

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)**



**Commenced at 08:30 and held on Tuesday, 14 September 2021 via
Microsoft Teams**

1. Opening and Welcome

The Chair, Mr Graham Jacobs, officially opened the meeting at 08:25 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members:

Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ) (Chair)
Ms Mishkah Collier (MC) left at 13:30
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)
Prof Walter Peters (WP)
Ms Helene van der Merwe (HvdM)

Members of Staff:

Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Cathy-Ann Potgieter (CAP)
Ms Xola Mlwandle (XM)
Ms Zikhona Sigonya-Ndongeni (ZSN)
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)
Ms Muneerah Solomon (MS)
Ms Aneeqah Brown (AB)
Ms Xola Mlwandle (XM)
Mr Michael Janse van Rensburg (MJvR)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)

Visitors:

Ms Hanmarie Reinecke
Mr Jose Rodrigues
Ms Marise Grobler
Ms Rene Winzker
Ms Tanja Kruger
Mr Jaco Cilliers
Mr Francois Fouche
Prof SE Donaldson
Ms Fazlin Samaai
Mr Izak Burger
Prof Berni Searle
Ms Wendy Wilson
Mr Carl Breytenbach
Ms Doryn Schreuder
Mr Robert Silke
Mr Chris Snelling
Mr Ron Martin
Ms Lize Malan
Ms Claire Abrahamse
Mr Rouan Theart

Mr Henry Aikman
Ms Annemie Vermeulen
Ms Maurietta Stewart
Mr Heine Matthee
Ms Ohna Clark
Dr Stephen Townsend
Ms Kathy Dumbrell
Ms Jacky Poking
Mr Giancarlo Bruno
Ms Kim Whitaker
Mr Mike Scurr
Mr Carlos De Mendonca
Mr Craig Thomas
Dr Rolf Annas
Ms Patricia Botha
Mr Arn Erasmus
Ms Tasneem Higgins
Mr Johan Cornelius
Mr Paul Truscott

3. Apologies

Mr Dennis Belter (DB)

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 14 September 2021.

The Committee approved the agenda dated 14 September 2021.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meetings

5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 25 August 2021

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 25 August 2021 and resolved to approve them with amendments.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:

6.1. Recusals

MC: item 13.9

7. Confidential Matters

None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1. Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

CAP reported back on the outcomes of the following appeals and tribunals matters:

- Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 12255, 230 Victoria Street, Woodstock
- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 334, 21 Victoria Road, Bantry Bay
- Erf 405, Oldfield Road, Sea Point: Appeal dismissed.
- 1430, Bradwell Road: Appeal dismissed

8.2. Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:

Nothing to report.

8.3. Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition

None.

8.4 Feedback on Erf 8731, Droomers Garage, Main Street, Paarl

The heritage consultant to provide written confirmation regarding the status of the kiosk between the semicircular bays which is apparently to be demolished, and confirmation of that status.

8.5 Discussion of 'matters arising'

The Committee discussed the impact that 'further requirements' and 'matters arising' were having on the lengths of agendas and meetings. This situation is not sustainable. In future the Committee will be firmer in its response to submissions that provide inadequate information and

applicants that do not engage appropriately skilled and experienced heritage consultants to submit their applications.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Report back on Close-Out Reports

Nothing to report.

9.2 Report back on HWC Council Meetings

Nothing to report.

9.3 Discussion of agenda

Noted

9.4 Proposed Site Inspections

None

9.5 Site Inspections Undertaken

None

10. Appointments

None

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Proposed Alterations on Rem of Ptn 12 Farm 653, Vergenoegd Farm, Macassar: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/MACASSER/REM OF PTN 12 FARM 653

Case No: 21070609XM0706E

Application documentation was tabled.

Ms Xola Mlwandle introduced the case.

Ms Marise Grobler (architect), Ms Ohna Clark (architect) and Mr Jaco Cilliers (project manager) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- When detailing alterations, to keep a 'memory' of interventions.
- The site is graded as a PHS and situated within a HPOZ.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered submission 3, dated 06 July 2021 and prepared by Urban Concepts as having met previous requirements on condition that:

1. The bricked-in doorway and window openings be recessed to retain the memory of these openings: on both sides for the doorway and on the internal wall faces of those window openings.
2. The gable attic window be retained without the proposed shutter.

XM

**11.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 699, Somerset College, Bredell Road, Somerset West:
NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ SOMERSET WEST/ ERF 699**

Case No: 21071407SB0817E

Application form and relevant documentation prepared by Annemie Vermeulen were tabled.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Ms Annemie Vermeulen (architect), Ms Rene Winzker (architect) and Mr Heine Matthee were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Stellenbosch Interest Group supports the proposal.
- The grading of the site is to be established.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee supports the proposals in principle. However, there is currently insufficient information regarding the fabric directly impacted by the proposals given that large parts of this barn that have undergone significant reconstruction at various stages.

Consequently, it is not clear to what extent the new mezzanine and walkway slab insertions will impact historic fabric. This will need to be clarified. The following is therefore recommended:

1. Ensuring that the new slabs are physically separated from the existing fabric wherever possible. This will have structural and architectural implications that will need to be resolved.
2. Providing clarity regarding the nature of the fabric impacted by the insertion of the widened opening in the east internal gable wall. Confirmation is needed as to whether this opening requires widening at all.

The applicant to provide images showing campus context and indicating precedent for the proposed new shutters for the existing arched windows in the building.

SB

**11.3 Erf 653, RE of Ptn 12 Vergenoegd Farm, Macassar: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/SOMERSER WEST/ ERF 653**

Case No: 21080404XM

Application documentation was tabled.

Included with item 11.1.

XM

**11.4 Proposed Emergency Permit, Drostdy Museum, erf 87, 18 Swellengrebel Street, Swellendam:
NM
HM/OVERBERG/SWELLENDAM/ERF 87**

Case No: 21071607SB0818E

Application form and relevant documentation prepared by Ms M Odendaal and Mr F Fouche were tabled.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Mr Francois Fouche (Drostdy Museum manager), Ms Tanja Kruger (architect) and Ms Kathy Dumbrell (observer and heritage consultant responsible for preparing the CMP for the Museum) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Insufficient information has been provided for the Committee to understand the nature of the problems requiring remediation.
- The proposed specifications for the masonry and plaster repairs are unworkable in their current form and in at least one instance, potentially harmful.
- The site is graded as a PHS.
- Gable & grape moulding of the Drostdy building need urgent repairs.
- Swellendam Heritage Association provided a positive comment.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee notes that this is an emergency application which therefore needs to be addressed with urgency. Nonetheless, the proposed remedial works in their current form are a source of concern. It is therefore strongly advised that a suitably qualified and experienced heritage architect, amongst others, be engaged to diagnose the problems and provide appropriate remedial specifications.

SB

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erven 1299 & 1300, 77 & 79 Shortmarket Street, Cape Town: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/BO KAAP/ ERF 1299

Case No: 21071209MS0712E

Application documentation was tabled.

Ms Xola Mlwandle introduced the case.

Mr Henry Aikman (heritage consultant), Ms Jacky Poking (Bo-Kaap Civic Ratepayers Association), Ms Maurietta Stewart (CoCT) and Mr Jose Rodrigues (owner) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site falls within a HPOZ.
- Bo-Kaap Youth Movement and CoCT did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.
- Bo-Kaap Civic and Ratepayers Association objects to the demolition of the building.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee is of the view that this submission may be incomplete regarding the site's social and historical significance. Until this can be clarified, the Committee cannot support the demolition of the subject buildings.

XM

12.2 Proposed for Total Demolition: Erven 977 and 978, Vredehoek: MA HM/VREDEHOEK/ERVEN 977 AND 978

Case No: 21061711 KB0728E and 21061712KB0728E

Application documentation was tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Dr Stephen Townsend (heritage consultant), Ms Kim Whitaker (Virginia Home Owners' Committee [VHOC]), Ms Maurietta Stewart (CoCT), Prof Berni Searle (VHOC), Mr Giancarlo Bruno (applicant), Mr Mike Scurr (heritage architect representing the VHOC) and Ms Wendy Wilson (architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is located within a proposed HPOZ.
- Greater Vredehoek Heritage Action Group and Virginia Home Owner's Committee objected to the proposal.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee continues to have reservations with regard to the proposals, particularly its massing, scale, recognition of street patterns (including side spaces) and terracing. While the Committee accepts in principle that the new development can be higher, the design does not satisfactorily acknowledge the Virginia Avenue streetscape.

The Committee does not consider the tall blocks of flats within the nearby streets to be justifiable precedent for development within Virginia Avenue which has its own distinct scale and character.

The Committee endorses the heritage explorations commissioned by the street association and strongly recommends that the architect take these as design criteria along with the heritage consultant's indicators.

KB

**12.3 Proposed Removal of a Crane on Erf 10256, Tanker Basin Monument Road, Table Bay Harbour:
NM
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/ TABLE BAY HARBOUR / ERF 10256**

Case No: 21052709SB0528E

Application form and relevant documentation prepared by Mr Carlos De Mendonca to be tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

Mr Carlos De Mendonca (applicant) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is grade IIIC and situated outside an HPO.
- City of Cape Town supports the proposal.
- Wharf crane forms part of the Duncan Dock infrastructure.
- APM Committee recommended that a report to be submitted which examines the historical and industrial significance of the crane in greater detail.

HELD OVER:

The Committee notes that APM does not regard the current report on the crane as sufficient with regard to significance. This item will therefore be considered once the additional information requested by APM has been made available and APM's response thereto received for consideration by BELCom.

SB

12.4 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 883, 66 Bath Street, Montagu: NM HM/MONTAGU/ERF 883

Case No: 21071507KB0715E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Carl Breytenbach (architect) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The structure is graded IIIC.
- Langeberg Municipality referred application to HWC.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee cannot consider the demolition of this building without a heritage statement prepared by a suitably qualified and experienced architectural heritage specialist. This statement should address not only the building but also its spatial context.

It is nonetheless noted from the images provided that there do not appear to be strong reasons for demolishing this building on grounds of structural or fabric condition.

KB

12.5 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 19858, 70 Berlyn Street, Paarl: MA HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 19858

Case No: 21062312KB0623E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Ms Lize Malan (heritage consultant) and Mr Chris Snelling (heritage consultant) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The house is considered by some members as a 'one and a half storey' typology endemic to Paarl yet of rectangular plan with central, double-loaded corridor, returns to the veranda end walls and enriched attic ventilators. The building is in a structurally good condition with many original features intact and is a survivor within a neighbourhood ravaged by forced removals.
- It was however also considered by other members that the house did not have sufficient intrinsic rarity or contextual value to motivate its placing on the register and accordingly warrant retention.
- The structure is not graded and is located outside Paarl Special Character Overlay Zone.

- Drakenstein Municipality, Paarl 300 and Drakenstein Heritage Foundation did not support the proposal.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition application as not negatively impacting heritage significance with two of four members present dissenting.

KB

12.6 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 10617, Corner Tabak and Station Street, Paarl: MA HM/PAARL/ERF 10617

Case No: 21050609KB069E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Ms Lize Malan (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The structure is graded IIIC and is located within Paarl Special Character Overlay Zone.
- Drakenstein Municipality, Paarl 300 and Drakenstein Heritage Foundation supported the proposal.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee endorses the Heritage Indicators document dated 25 August 2021 prepared by Lize Malan in terms of its general approach to the site's development, as this has great potential to not only regenerate the area but also sustain the surrounding historical buildings.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The indicators require a second level of detail that addresses the following:

1. The key scaling features of opposing building envelopes, particularly facing onto Tabak Street on one side, and the Railway Station on the other; as well as the relationship with Station Square.
2. The landscaping concept with particular attention to the relationship between the northern edge of the site and Station Square; and the relationships between the proposed parking courts within the subject property and the adjacent building edges around the perimeter of these parking courts.

KB

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 797, 6 Malherbe Street, Wellington: MA HM/DRAKENSTEIN/WELLINGTON/ ERF 797

Case No: 21040601XM0722E

Application documentation was tabled.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is graded IIIB and falls within the Special Character Overlay Zone.
- The DHF has no objections to the proposal. Drakenstein municipality objects to the proposal.
- HOMs referred this application to BELCom for their expertise.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawing numbered 2003-01D dated 4 September 2021 as having met previous requirements.

XM

13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 41855, 129 Main Road, Paarl: MA HM/PAARL/ERF 797

Case No: 21071507KB0715E

Application documentation was tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Ms Doryn Schreuder (architect & heritage consultant), Mr Rouan Theart (architect) and Dr Rolf Annas (Drakenstein Heritage Foundation) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The structure is graded IIIB and is located within Paarl Special Character Overlay Zone.
- Drakenstein Municipality, Paarl 300 and Drakenstein Heritage Foundation did not support the proposal.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee appreciates that the applicant has addressed certain concerns regarding the street interface of the old house. However, it notes that there are still issues that require addressing with regard to the detailing of interventions and impacts on built fabric in relation to the historical significance of the building as a whole and the impacts on that significance.

The Committee therefore again strongly recommends that the assistance of a suitably qualified and experienced architectural heritage practitioner be engaged to resolve the proposed interventions.

KB

13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1726, 1 Rowan Street, Stellenbosch: NM HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 1726

Case No: 21071508KB0716E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Ms Patricia Botha (Stellenbosch Interest Group) and Mr Arn Erasmus (architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The structure is graded IIIC.
- Stellenbosch Municipality and Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation supported the proposal. Stellenbosch Interest Group does not support the proposal.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawing Revision A, dated 14 June 2021 prepared by VKDB Architecture & Interior Design as not impacting heritage significance on condition that the historical windows and dining room floor are retained.

Amended drawings to be submitted to HWC for final approval.

KB

**13.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 3585, 18 Queen Victoria Street, Corner Dorp & Keerom Street, Cape Town: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 3585**

Case No: 21070510KB0720E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Johan Cornelius (heritage consultant), Mr Robert Silke (architect) and Ms Maurietta Stewart (CoCT) were present and took part in the presentation and discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The structure is graded IIIA.
- City of Cape Town does not support the proposal. Simon Van der Stel supported the proposal with concerns. CIBRA supported the proposal with concerns.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee concurs with the legal advisor that this submission triggers NHRA S.38 for the reasons submitted.

The Committee therefore recommends that a NHRA S.38 Notice of Intent to Develop (NID) application be submitted if this proposal is to be pursued.

KB

**13.5 Proposed Addition and Alteration on Erf 1895, 31 Bellevue Road, Oranjezicht: NM
HM/ORANJEZICHT/ERF 1895**

Case No: 21081111MS0816E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Ms Maurietta Stewart (CoCT) was present and took part in the presentation and discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The structure is graded IIIB and is located within an HPO.
- City of Cape Town does not support the proposal. CIBRA supported the proposal.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved not to approve the application as the proposed alterations to the street interface are not consistent with similar off-street parking conditions on the street.

The Committee has no objection to the internal alterations but recommends drywall partitioning.

KB

13.6 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 12563, 26 Coronation Road, Walmer Estate: NM HM/WALMER ESTATE/ERF 12563

Case No: 21081111MS0816E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

Mr Ron Martin (heritage consultant), Ms Tasneem Higgins (owner) and Ms Maurietta Stewart (CoCT) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The structure is graded an IIIC and located within a HPOZ.
- City of Cape Town does not support the proposal. Walmer Estate Ratepayers and Residents' Association and Walmer University Estate Conservation Action Group support the proposal.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee notes that the site falls within an area that is changing with the introduction of contemporary architecture. However, this is a corner site located in a heritage area. Therefore, while the Committee does not have objections in principle to the subject building being altered, the manner in which this is done must respond positively to the character of its neighbours.

Revised proposals are thus required informed by further information including key indicators explaining the context of the subject site as it is otherwise not possible for the Committee to properly assess the impact of the proposal on its neighbours.

MS

13.7 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 56207, 46 Talana Road, Upper Claremont: NM HM/CLAREMONT/ERF 56207

Case No: 21082601KB0826E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

No applicants or I&AP's were present.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The structure is graded IIIB.
- City of Cape Town supports the proposal. Upper Claremont Ratepayers and Residents association does not support the proposal.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered M11Claremont56207 LAD102 REV B dated 17 June 2020 as the proposals will not negatively impact heritage significance.

KB

13.8 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 600, 72 and 74 Bosch Street, Paarl: NM HM/PAARL/ERF 600

Case No: 19102932KB0820E

Application documents were tabled.

HELD OVER:

The matter is held over to the next BELCom meeting on 29 September 2021.

KB

13.9 Proposed Additions and Additions on Erf 118437, 41A Polo Road, Observatory: NM HM/OBSERVATORY/ERF ERF 118437

Case No: 17082803ZK0803E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Ms Claire Abrahamse (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The structure is graded IIC and is located within an HPO.
- City of Cape Town did not comment within the 30 days commenting period. Observatory Civic Association does not support.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered SUB 01/ SUB 02 /SUB 04/ SUB 06/ SUB 08 & SUB 07/ SUB 05/ SUB 03 Rev C dated 07 May 2021 & 11 August 2021 as the proposals will not negatively impact heritage significance.

KB

13.10 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 8676, La Concorde Building, Paarl: NM HM/PAARL/ERF 8676

Case No: 21072207KB0723E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Henry Aikman (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the discussions.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered SK 117 & SK 116 Rev 03 dated July 2021 as the proposals will not negatively impact heritage significance, but on condition that the cornice detail of existing parapets be acknowledged in the reconfiguration.

KB

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

**19.1 Erf 377, Alphen, Constantia - PHS Site: NM
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/ CONSTANTIA/ERF 377**

Case No: N/A

Presentation prepared by Claire Abrahamse was tabled.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Ms Claire Abrahamse (heritage consultant) and Mr Paul Truscott (architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Site is a PHS and is not within a heritage protected overlay zone.

ADVICE:

The Committee considers that the favoured alternative for protection of the historic timber doors and architraves would be the application of a specialised breathable protective timber application, such as products by internationally recognised brands like Keim.

Alternatives that involve shielding with glass panels or other applied elements should be regarded as a less satisfactory alternative, even with careful detailing.

SB

20 OTHER MATTERS

20.1 None

21. NON-COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting closed at 20:50

24 **DATE OF NEXT MEETING:**
29 September 2021

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIRPERSON _____

DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

DATE _____

Approved