APPROVED DECISIONS OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE, BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom) Held on Wednesday, 17 June 2015 at the 1st Floor Boardroom, at the Offices of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport, Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09:00

FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION

W.11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

W.11.1 Proposed Alteration and Addition, Erf 11310, St Peters Church, 101 Marsh Street, Mossel Bay: MA HM/MOSSEL BAY/ERF 11310

Case No: 15050803RN0514E

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade II in terms of its high architectural, historical, aesthetic and social value. The church is a significant landmark in Marsh Street and within the historic core of Mossel Bay.

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposals.

The Committee supported the intentions to upgrade the facilities and design an annex which relates more closely to the church in terms of overall massing. However the Committee felt that there was a lack of clarity in the underlining design intentions of the proposals and a lack of clarity regarding finishes.

The Committee felt that the upgrading of the facilities presented an opportunity to enhance the heritage significance of the site. However, the proposals in their current form detracted from the architectural quality of a provincial heritage site.

The Committee requested the submission of revised proposals.

RN

W.11.2Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 9808 (Ptn of 4944), Central Library, Old Drill Hall, Corner of Parade and Darling Streets, Cape Town: MN

Case No: 15052020RN0527E

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade II in terms of its architectural, historical and aesthetic value. The building is an important landmark in relation to the Grand Parade

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals given that the interventions do not impact the historic fabric of the building. The committee queried the use of toughened glass and assumes that the intention is for laminated safety glass.

The proposals are approved subject to the condition that any remedial work to the historical windows be referred to the case officer for approval.

RN

W.11.3 Proposed Partial Demolition, Additions, landscaping and re-application for permit, Erf 66660, 61 Wolfe Street, Wynberg: MA HM/WYNBERG/ERF 66660

Case No: 15040807RN0408E

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve option 2 subject to the following conditions:

- The parking in the front garden must be reduced to four bays to allow for a green buffer along Wolfe Street.
- A revised landscape plan and proposals for the new gateway off Wolfe Street must be submitted.
- Comment from the Wynberg Village Historical Society must be submitted.

JW

W.11.4Proposed Alterations on Erf 174, No 29 Church Street, Tulbagh: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/WITZENBERG/TULBAGH/ERF 174

DECISION

The Committee resolved to revoke the permit and to recommend to the CEO that charges be laid.

JW

W.11.5Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 159887, Five Flies Building, 14-16 Keerom Street, Cape Town HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 159887

Case No: 14120204KR1203E

DECISION

The Committee resolved to accept and support the findings of the completion report.

The Committee noted that further remedial work is to be undertaken and requires that this work be supervised by a suitably qualified heritage architect in order to comply with the permit requirements. Any additional work must be included in an updated completion report.

AS

W.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

W.12.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 683, 157 Main Road, Green Point: MA

Case No: 15033150JW0407E

DECISION

The Committee decided the building to be un-gradable given that the building has been highly altered and has become decontextualized.

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition.

JW

W.12.2 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 2045, 5 Prince Avenue, Fresnaye: MA HM/FRESNAYE/ERF 2045

Case No: 15040102RN0407E

DECISION

The Committee resolved to ratify the decision by e-mail attached.

W.12.3 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 10192, Helliger Lane, Bo Kaap, Cape Town: MA HM/CAPE TOW/BO KAAP/ERF 10192

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposed archaeological monitoring plan recommendations submitted by ACO.

RN

W.13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

W.13.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Rem of Farm 705, Spice Route (Leeuwenjacht), Agter Paarl Road, Agter Paarl, New Chocolate Factory, Ablution block: NM HM/AGTER PAARL/REM OF FARM 705

Case No: 15051304RN0513M

The matter was removed from the agenda as the proposed new ablution block does not trigger S34 or any other section of the NHRA

RN

W.13.2 Proposed Alterations on Old Goede Hoop Homestead, Mont Rochelle Estate and Vineyards, Erf 1412/9, Goede Hoop Homestead Precinct, Franschhoek: NM HM/FRANSCHHOEK/ERF 1412/9

Case No: 15060102JW0603E

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the manor house to be grade IIIB and the grading of the outbuilding to be IIIC.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals subject to the following conditions:

- Any below ground disturbance within the historical werf must be monitored by ahistorical archaeologist.
- The interventions to the historic core of the manor house are to be supervised by a heritage architect.

JW

RN

W.13.3 Proposed Alterations, Erf 186, Le Roux & Kie, Van Der Stel Street, Tulbagh: MA HM/TULBAGH/ERF 186

The Committee noted the site inspection report.

RN

W 13.4Proposed Alterations on Kinbrae Court, Erf 1407, Ptn of Erf 1406, No 10 Kinbrae Court, Belle Ombre Road, Tamboerskloof: NM HM/TAMBOERSKLOOF/ERF 1406

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade IIIC.

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposals due to the negative impact on the architectural integrity of the main façade of the building and the contribution of the projecting balconies to the character of the façade.

In the absence of a clear strategy for the enclosure of balconies by the body corporate for this block, ad hoc balcony enclosures could have a cumulative negative impact.

W 13.5 Proposed Alterations on Erf 383, No 42 Woodside Road, Tamboerskloof: NM HM/TAMBOERSKLOOF/ERF 383

DECISION

It was noted that the Committee had previously graded the building IIIB.

The Committee supported the principle of a single garage.

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposals given the impact on the streetscape and the front garden space. Concerns were raised regarding the following:

- The scale of the proposals.
- The extension of the deck onto the street boundary.
- The height of the garage outbuilding.

There is lack of clarity on the proposed alterations to the boundary wall treatment and impacts on associated historic fabric.

JW

W.13.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Rem of Farm 705, Spice Route (Leeuwenjacht), Agter Paarl Road, Agter Paarl, Pizzeria Kitchen and Ablution Addition: NM HM/AGTER PAARL/REM OF FARM 705

Case No: 15051304RN0513M

DECISION

The Committee resolved to request further information on the age and heritage significance of the building.

The Committee is unable to assess the proposals in the absence of this information.

RN

W.14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

W.14.1 None

W. 15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

W.15.1 None

W.16. PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

W.16.1 None

W.17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

W.17.1 None

W.18. PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

W.18.1 None

W.19. REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

W.19.1 None

W.20. Other Matters

W.20.1 None

SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION

E.11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

E.11.1 Restoration of Long Cottage on Erf 87086, No 248 Main Road, Muizenberg: MA HM\CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN\MUIZENBERG\ERF 87086

Case No: 14041612GT0514M

DECISION

The Committee resolved to accept the report and as per the agreement between the owner and HWC resolved that the deposit must be repaid.

KR

E.12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

E.12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 65915, 8 Wythan Avenue, Kenilworth: MA HM/KENILWORTH/ERF 65915

Case No: 15051114GT0513M

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be III B given its architectural and historical value and its association with the work of a recognised master.

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposed demolition.

The Committee agreed that the adaptive re-use of the building and the removal of later, less significant accretions could be considered.

GT

E.12.2 Proposed Total Demolition on Highclere, Erf 280, 8 Ranke Road Blaauwbergstrand: MA HM/BLAAUWBERGSTRAND/ERF 280

Case No: 14121801GT0115M

DECISION

The Committee resolved to conduct a site inspection and to convene a special BELCom meeting immediately afterwards.

Copies of all the relevant documents are to be circulated to all parties ahead of the meeting.

W 12.3 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 998, 152 Waterkant Street, Greenpoint: MA HM/GREENPOINT/ERF 152

Case No: 15041408KR0416M

DECISION

The Committee resolved to conduct a site visit (GJ, MS and SW) and requested that a CoCT HRS representative be invited to attend.

KR

GT

E 12.4 Proposed Total demolition on Erf 304, No 28 Scott Street, Lower Gardens, Vredehoek HM/VREDEHOEK/ERF 303

Case No: 15052618KR0416M

DECISION

The Committee resolved to remove the item from the agenda as the applicants and ownership details on annexure A are inconsistent and there is no power of attorney.

KR

E 12.5 Proposed Total demolition on Erf 303, No 26 Scott Street, Lower Gardens, Vredehoek HM/VREDEHOEK/ERF 303

Case No: 15052618KR0416M

DECISION

The Committee resolved to remove the item from the agenda as the applicant's and ownership details in Annexure A are inconsistent and no power of attorney is provided

KR

E.13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

E.13.1 Proposed alterations on Old Spier Café (slave quarters) and werf area at spier, Farm 1419, Stellenbosch: MA HM/STELLENBOSCH/FARM 1419

Case No: 14082805KR0901M

DECISION

The Committee resolved to accept the report.

- E.14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS
- E.14.1 None
- E.15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT
- E.15.1 None
- E.16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL
- E.16.1 None
- E.17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS
- E.17.1 None
- E.18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS
- E.18.1 None
- E.19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE
- E.19.1 None
- E.20 NON COMPLIANCE
- E.20.1 None

20. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

21. CLOSURE

	The meeting adjourned at:	15H30
22	DATE OF NEXT MEETING:	8 July 2015
CHAIRPERSON		DATE
SECRETARY		DATE

Approved BELCom Decisions_17 June 2015

KR