

**FINAL MINUTES OF MEETING
OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Wednesday, 16 May 2012, 1st Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09H00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The meeting was officially opened at 09H05 by the chairperson, Ms Sarah Winter, and she welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Dr Stephen Townsend	ST
Ms Melanie Attwell	MA
Mr Roger Joshua	RJ
Mr Patrick Fefeza	PF
Ms Sarah Winter	SW
Ms Maureen Wolters	MW
Mr Tim Hart	TH

Members of Staff

Ms Christina Jikelo	CJ
Mr Calvin van Wijk	CvW
Ms Tamar Grover	TG
Mr Jonathan Windvogel	JW
Mr Olwethu Dlova (Sec)	OD
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)	LM
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka	ZS
Ms Ntombi Nkoane	NN

Visitors

Mr Henry Aikman
Mr Colin Jones
Mr J. Peterson
Mr Chris Snelling

Mr M. Dall
Ms Claire Abrahamse
Mr J. Wilken

Observers

Mr Gregory Ontong (SAHRA)
Mr P. Steurman (SAHRA)

Mr Johan Cornelius (CoCCT)

3. Apologies

3.1 None

4. Approval of minutes of previous

4.1 Meeting held on 18 April 2012

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes.

5. Confidential Matters

5.1 None

6. Administration Matters

6.1 Report back on Old Sillery (EXCO meeting)

Ms Sarah Winter made a verbal report with regard to the Old Sillery matter discussed at the Executive Committee meeting held on the 4th May 2012.

6.2 Erf 443, 47 Napier Street, De Waterkant

Mr van Wijk will inform the committee by e-mail as to whether the City of Cape Town intends to take any action on this matter.

6.3 Report Back on Cenotaph

Dr Townsend made a verbal report in respect of this matter which is now being dealt with by the Impact Assessment Committee.

The issue of potential conflicts of interest arising from previous interests in applications was discussed and it was agreed that such interest should simply be routinely tabled. ST undertook to table this matter at Council/EXCO.

JW

6.4 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

Mr van Wijk gave a report back on the outcome of the various appeals.

7. Appointments

7.1 None

FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION

W 8 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

W.8.1 Proposed Restoration/ Maintenance, Ceolnamara, Erf 88244, 20 Main Road, St James HM/ST JAMES/ERF 88244

Case No: 120502JW01

An application prepared by Claire Abrahamse, dated 2 May 2012, photographs and plans were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by TT, ST and RJ.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

The heritage consultant, Ms Claire Abrahamse, was present and participated in the discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved the following:

- 1(a) the replacement of tiles is approved except that these be replaced with quarry tiles;
- 1(b) the damp proofing is approved;
- 1(c) the maintenance of timberwork is agreed excepting that this should be varnished rather than painted;
- 1(d) the removal of the porch doors is not approved and details of the proposed glazing must be submitted;

- 2(a) damp proofing is approved;
- 2(b) repainting is approved;
- 2(c) re-varnishing is approved;

- 3(a) re-varnishing is approved;
- 3(b) removing of cupboards is approved;
- 3(C) removing of fittings is approved;

- 4(a) damp proof measures are approved;
- 4 (b) the removal of the awnings are approved; and
- 4(c) the maintenance of timberwork is approved but must be varnished rather than painted.

Given the significance of the building, the committee requires the continued input of the heritage architect.

JW

**W.8.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Farm 185, Schoonderzicht, Off Steinthal Road, Tulbagh
HM/TULBAGH/SCHOONDERZICHT/FARM 185**

Case No: 120222TG24

ST and TT reported back on their site visit.

The Committee noted that the homestead itself is in need of urgent conservation attention and which must involve the input of and supervision by a suitably skilled architect.

The heritage consultant, Mr Aikman, was present and participated in the discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to refuse the application and require the appointment of a heritage architect to address the proposed interventions in a sensitive and innovative manner.

The Committee also requires the submission of revised proposals which clearly and accurately record the work already completed and which show the existing buildings to be demolished.

TG

**W.8.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Alphen Estate Manor House, Erf 337, Constantia
HM/CONSTANTIA/ALPHEN HOTEL/ERF 337**

Case No: 110713TG11

The Committee members reported back from site visit.

Mr Thorold recused himself.

The heritage consultant, Ms Claire Abrahamse, was present and participated in the discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to require the submission of revised proposals for the Rose Bar lean-to and that the proposals be submitted prior to August and the works completed by the end of 2012.

The Committee resolved to regard the fake fire place as a piece of furniture which is non-permanent and can be removed.

The Committee resolved not to approve the parasols in front of the homestead due to the high and damaging visual impact of the structures on the main façade and the main approach. The Committee requires these structures to be removed.

The Committee approves the parasols in front of the adjacent outbuilding or 'Jonkershuis' for the duration of the current hotel lease as the suggested by the applicant. The committee is of the opinion that these structures have considerably less visual impact on the building behind which has a less prominence and less formal architecture. However, given the impact on the werf as the whole the Committee requires that they not be permanent and they be removed by the current tenant when their occupation ends.

TG

W.8.4 West Coast Fossil Park, Farm 1223, Saldanha Bay HM/WEST COAST FOSSIL PARK/SALDANHA BAY/FARM 1223

Case No: 120502JL01

Preliminary Outline of Methodology, Process and Scope of Work, prepared by Melanie Attwell, dated 2 May 2012 were tabled

Ms Tamar Grover and Ms Jenna Lavin made a power-point presentation

Ms Melanie Attwell recused herself.

Ms Sarah Winter and Mr Roger Joshua declared their interest, however it was agreed that there is no conflict.

Ms Jody Patterson from NM Associates and the heritage consultant, Ms Melanie Attwell, were present and participated in the discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The future consideration of this matter must be dealt with jointly between this Committee and APM.

Interim Comment

The Committee resolved to endorse the planning approach and process (the package of plans approach), and the proposed methodology and scope of work, and agreed that the development of the visitors centre and the museum may proceed ahead of the conclusion of the broader planning framework.

The Committee recommends that this be dealt with in terms of S27 and that S35 does not apply (this is to avoid complications of jurisdiction). However all decisions will be made jointly between BELCom and APM.

TG/JL

**W.8.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 315, 17 Nuwe Street, Elim
HM/ELIM/ERF 315**

Case No: 120224JW24

Application prepared by PK Siebrits, dated 21 February 2012, photographs and plans were tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by ST, RJ and TT.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The applicant has made the amendments suggested by BELCom previously.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

JW

**W.8.6 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 237, 8 Kort Street, Elim
HM/ELIM/ERF 237**

Case No: 110727JW33

Application prepared by PK Siebrits, dated 21 February 2012, photographs and plans were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by ST, MA and RJ.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The applicant has made the amendments suggested by BELCom previously.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

JW

**W 9 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL
DEMOLITION**

**W.9.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 4150, 248 Buitengracht (Cnr Carisbrook) Road,
Bo-Kaap
HM/BO-KAAP/ERF 4150**

Case No: 120208JW05

Historical background reports prepared by Dr Ute A Seemann, dated January 2012, and a heritage statement prepared by Mr Aikman, dated February 2012, were tabled

The documents had previously been delivered to ST and MA.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

SW and MA reported back on their site visit.

Mr Greg Ontong (SAHRA), the heritage consultant, Mr Henry Aikman, and the owner and Mr Colin Jones were present.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The comment from the SAHRA BELCom requires that the front portion of the building be retained.
- The building is located outside the historical core of Bo-Kaap and is more a part of Tamboerskloof.
- The Bo-Kaap Civic Association is opposed to the demolition (because they are opposed to the proposed new building).
- While the building is situated within a proposed Urban Conservation Area, these boundaries were identified in the mid-1980s and need to be updated. Also, it appears that the extent of the Grade I area has not been properly considered or identified by SAHRA.
- The significance of the building does not warrant formal protection.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to agree to the demolition. The decision will be suspended to give SAHRA 14 days to provisionally proclaim as per the still draft MOU between SAHRA and HWC.

The case officer will inform SAHRA of this decision timeously and, if SAHRA does not provisionally proclaim the Civic Association will be informed of the right to appeal.

JW

W.10 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

W.10.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Glen Bridge Special Needs School, Erf 79021, 749, 79031/2, 91 Main Road, Diep Rivier HM/DIEP RIVIER/ERF 79021, 749, 79031/2

Case No: 120425JW15

An application prepared by Rudi Botha, architect and urban designer, dated 10 April 2012, plans and photographs were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by SW, TT and ST.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

JW

**W.10.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 16164, 191 Main Street, Paarl
HM/PAARL/ERF 16164**

Case No: 120509JW08

An application prepared by Leonard Raymond, dated 7 May 2012, photographs and plans were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by ST, TT and MA.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

It was noted that:

- The ACTAEM had concerns about the removal of the original material and the suitability of the lintol, and the overall effect of the new opening in the room, as well as the use of the floor tiles in the area to be used as a bakery.
- The Paarl 300 felt that as the opening is created already and done illegally, therefore they do not have to comment.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on the grounds that these minor works do not affect significance.

JW

W.11 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

W.11.1 None

W. 12 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

W. 12.1 None

W. 13 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

W.13.1 None

W.14 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

W.14.1 None

W.15 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

W.15.1 None

W.16 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

W.16.1 None

W.17 Other Matters

W.17.1 None

SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION

E 8 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

E 8.1 Proposed Multi-purpose Hall, Somerset House Preparatory School, Erven 7699 and 7698, Somerset West HM/SOMERSET HOUSE/ERVEN 7699/7698

Case No: 110824SD22

A Heritage Impact Assessment prepared by Arcon Architects Heritage Consultants, dated 2 May 2012 was tabled.

The documents had been delivered and read by TT, ST and RJ.

Mr Calvin van Wijk made a verbal report on behalf of Shaun Dyers.

Ms Sarah Winter recused herself.

A delegation from the School with the architects arrived late and the decision was explained to them and confirmed.

The Committee's deliberations and reasons for the decision were subsequently explained to the client and consultants.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve Option B, that is, with the pitched roof as shown on the sketch drawings dated 2 May 2012 prepared by Urban Concepts.

SD

E.8.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Strooidak Kerk, 163 B Main Road, Paarl HM/STROOIDAK/163

Case No: 120502SD01

Plans prepared by Malherbe Rust Architects, dated 2 May 2012 were tabled

The documents had not been circulated.

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Committee had no objection to the proposal in principle.
- Mr Shiceka will e-mail examples of other similar interventions approved by HWC to other PHS's.
- Details of the glazed panels and their attachment to the walls must be provided.
- This is a very significant heritage resource.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to defer the matter for a site visit (SW, ST and TT).

ZS

E 9 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

**E.9.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 49 Camps Bay, 24 Victoria Road, Bakoven
HM/CAMPS BAY/ERF 49**

Case No: 120417NN11

An application for a permit prepared by Thomas Geh Architects was tabled.

The documents had not been circulated.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building has no cultural significance.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition as the building has no cultural significance.

NN

**E.9.2 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 41 Camps Bay, 42 Victoria Road, Bakoven
HM/CAMPS BAY/ERF 41**

Case No: 120417NN12

An application for a permit prepared by Thomas Geh Architects was tabled.

The documents had not been circulated.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building has no cultural significance.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition as the building has no cultural significance

NN

E 10 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

**E 10.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 162869, 23 Osborne Street,
Zonnebloem
HM/ZONNEBLOEM/ERF 162869**

Case No: 120330ZS36

MA and SW reported back from their site visit.

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the revised plan as seen by BELCom and dated and signed by the chairperson.

The Committee recommended that the balcony balustrade be remade to match the simple diagonal cross pattern of adjacent balustrades.

ZS

**E.10.2 Proposed Alterations, Erf 118915, 8 Highwick Avenue, Claremont
HM/CLAREMONT/ERF 118915**

A Heritage Statement prepared by Claire Abrahamse, dated April 2012 was tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by ST, SW and TT.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

Mr Michael Dall, the architect, was present and participated in the discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to defer the matter for a site visit (SW, TT and ST).

NN

**E.10.3 Proposed Alterations, Erf 66375 and 66376; Dutch Reformed Mission Church,
Wynberg.
HM/WYNBERG/ERF 66375/66376**

Case No: 120502NN01

A Heritage Statement prepared by Claire Abrahamse, dated 25 April 2012 was tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by SW, TT and ST.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee resolved to defer the matter for a site visit (SW, TT and ST).

NN

E.11 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

E.11.1 None

E.12 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

E.12.1 None

E.13 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

E.13.1 None

E.14 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

E.14.1 None

E.15 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

E.15.1 None

E.16 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

E.16.1 None

E.17 Other Matters

E.17.1 None

18. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS
The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

19. CLOSURE
The meeting adjourned at 16:15

20 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 20 June 2012

CHAIRPERSON _____ **DATE** _____

SECRETARY _____ **DATE** _____