

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Wednesday, 17 June 2015 at the 1st Floor Boardroom, at the Offices of the
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09:00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The meeting was officially opened at 09:15 by the chairperson, Ms Sarah Winter, and she welcomed everyone present

Attendance

Members

Ms Sarah Winter	SW
Mr Michael Scurr	MS
Graham Jacobs (arrived 9.45)	GJ
Mr Peter Buttgens (left between 10H00 – 13H00)	PB
Mr Rowen Ruiters	RR

Members of Staff

Dr Errol Myburg	EM
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka	ZS
Ms Jenna Lavin	JL
Ms Penny Meyer	PM
Mr Ronny Nyuka	RN
Mr Jonathan Windvogel	JW
Mr Guy Thomas	GT
Ms Kathrine Robinson	KR
Mr Andrew September	AS
Ms Waseefa Dhansay	WD
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)	LM
Ms Heidi Boise	HB

Visitors

Mr R Graca	Mr G Van Der Spek
Mr A Lillie	Mr D Hart
Mr M Olden	Ms S Warnich-Stemmet
Ms L Mahomedy	Ms Marie-Lou Roux
Mr H Schulze	Mr C James
Mr J Orton	Ms H Clift

Observers

Ms C Driver

2. Apologies

Mr Olwethu Dlova (Sec)	OD
Mr Stuart Hermansen	SH

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 17 June 2015

The Committee approved the agenda dated 17 June 2015 with some amendments.

5 Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting

5.1 Dated 27 May 2015

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with one amendment.

6. Disclosure of Interest

MS: E 12.2

PB: W 11.5

GJ: W 13.2; E.13.1

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

The Legal Advisor (PM) reported back that there had been no new appeals and tribunals. She further reported that a legal advisor has been appointed to deal with tribunals.

PM

8.2 Report Back on Stop Works Orders and Charges

PM reported back on the following charges:

- Klein Constantia, Paarl.
- Long Street, Montagu
- Voortrekker Street, Swellendam
- Juno, Main Street, Paarl.

PM

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings Refused for Demolition

There were no new matters to report back.

ZS

8.4 St Mary's Church, Stellenbosch.

PM gave a report back on this matter and indicated that she and KR will conduct a site visit.

PM

8.5 Proposed Landscaping & Civil Engineering Works at Leeuwenhof Estate, Oranjezicht, Cape Town

JL gave a report back on the meeting held between HWC and Leeuwenhof Estate project team.

ZS

8.6 Longkloof Building, erf 4150, 1636 Longkloof Road, Hout bay

HB gave a report back on this matter.

ZS

8.7 Restoration, Repairs & Renovations to the National Council of Provinces building, Parliament

ZS reported that a site visit is to be arranged.

ZS

9. Standing items

9.1 Site Inspections

The following site inspections were noted:

- Erf 174, 29 Church Street, Tulbagh
- 186 van der Stel Street, , Tulbagh
- Erf 683, 157 Main Road, Greenpoint,
- Genandedal Groote Schuur Estate, Rondebosch ,
- Erf 2045, 5 Prince Avenue, Fresnaye
- Erf 65915, 8 Wythan Avenue, Kenilworth

10. Appointments

10.1 The Committee noted the appointments for items 10.1 and 10.2.

FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION

W.11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

W.11.1 Proposed Alteration and Addition, Erf 11310, St Peters Church, 101 Marsh Street, Mossel Bay: MA HM/MOSSEL BAY/ERF 11310

Case No: 15050803RN0514E

An application for a permit, photographs and plans (drawing nos: 2014-24-1 dated 15 March 2015, 2014-24-2 dated 11 March 2015, 2014-24-3 dated 9 March 2015, 2014-24-4 dated 11 March 2015, 2014-24-5 dated 11 September 2015, 2014-24-6 dated 11 March 2015 and 2014-24-7 dated 15 March 2015) prepared Hamilton Nel were tabled.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade II in terms of its high architectural, historical, aesthetic and social value. The church is a significant landmark in Marsh Street and within the historic core of Mossel Bay.

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposals.

The Committee supported the intentions to upgrade the facilities and design an annex which relates more closely to the church in terms of overall massing. However the Committee felt that there was a lack of clarity in the underlining design intentions of the proposals and a lack of clarity regarding finishes.

The Committee felt that the upgrading of the facilities presented an opportunity to enhance the heritage significance of the site. However, the proposals in their current form detracted from the architectural quality of a provincial heritage site.

The Committee requested the submission of revised proposals.

RN

W.11.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 9808 (Ptn of 4944), Central Library, Old Drill Hall, Corner of Parade and Darling Streets, Cape Town: MN HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 9808 (PTN OF 4944)

Case No: 15052020RN0527E

An application for a permit, photographs and plans (drawing no: A007/101, A007/102, A007/103 and A007/501) prepared by City of Cape Town Architectural Branch, dated April 2015 were tabled

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade II in terms of its architectural, historical and aesthetic value. The building is an important landmark in relation to the Grand Parade

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals given that the interventions do not impact the historic fabric of the building. The committee queried the use of toughened glass and assumes that the intention is for laminated safety glass.

The proposals are approved subject to the condition that any remedial work to the historical windows be referred to the case officer for approval.

RN

W.11.3 Proposed Partial Demolition, Additions, Landscaping and Ae-application for Permit, Erf 66660, 61 Wolfe Street, Wynberg: MA HM/WYNBERG/ERF 66660

Case No: 15040807RN0408E

Revised plans prepared by Olden and Associates Urban and Regional Planners, dated June 2015 were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve option 2 subject to the following conditions:

- The parking in the front garden must be reduced to four bays to allow for a green buffer along Wolfe Street.
- A revised landscape plan and proposals for the new gateway off Wolfe Street must be submitted.
- Comment from the Wynberg Village Historical Society must be submitted.

JW

**W.11.4 Proposed Alterations on Erf 174, No 29 Church Street, Tulbagh: MA
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/WITZENBERG/TULBAGH/ERF 174**

The site inspection report and correspondence between HWC and the owner were tabled.

JW gave a report back.

The Committee noted the contents of the letter from the owner and was of the opinion that the reasons provided for the unauthorised work and for HWC not to revoke the permit are not compelling for the following reasons:

- An alternative entry for guests is possible.
- Alternative less invasive security measures are possible.
- The detailing of the sliding glass doors behind the barn doors to the wagon shed is unsympathetic to the historic character of the building and the doors are an illegal addition.

The Committee is of the opinion that the unauthorised work has damaged the significance of a PHS deemed to be a grade II heritage resource.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to revoke the permit and to recommend to the CEO that charges be laid.

JW

**W.11.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 159887, Five Flies Building, 14-16
Keerom Street, Cape Town
HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 159887**

Case No: 14120204KR1203E

A completion report prepared by Peter Buttgens Architects, dated 15 May 2015 was tabled.

PB was not present when the matter was discussed.

Mr Andrew September made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to accept and support the findings of the completion report.

The Committee noted that further remedial work is to be undertaken and requires that this work be supervised by a suitably qualified heritage architect in order to comply with the permit requirements. Any additional work must be included in an updated completion report.

AS

W.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

W.12.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 683, 157 Main Road, Green Point: MA HM/GREEN POINT/ERF 683

Case No: 15033150JW0407E

SW gave a report back on the site visit conducted on 10 June 2015 by GJ, SW, PH and SH and staff members (JW, RN and GT).

DECISION

The Committee decided the building to be un-gradable given that the building has been highly altered and has become decontextualized.

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition.

JW

W.12.2 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 2045, 5 Prince Avenue, Fresnaye: MA HM/FRESNAYE/ERF 2045

Case No: 15040102RN0407E

A site inspection was undertaken by GJ, SW, PB and SH on the 12th June 2015 and they were accompanied by three staff members (JW, RN and GT).

DECISION

The Committee resolved that the application for demolition be approved given that the building is ungradable. The building and its context do not fulfil any of the criteria of Section 3 of the National Heritage Resources Act (Act 25 of 1999).

RN

W.12.3 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 10192, Helliger Lane, Bo Kaap, Cape Town: MA HM/CAPE TOW/BO KAAP/ERF 10192

Archaeological Monitoring Plan Recommendations prepared by Dave Halkett were tabled.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposed archaeological monitoring plan recommendations submitted by ACO.

RN

W.13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

**W.13.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Rem of Farm 705, Spice Route (Leeuwenjacht), Agter Paarl Road, Agter Paarl, New Chocolate Factory, Ablution block: NM
HM/AGTER PAARL/REM OF FARM 705**

Case No: 15051304RN0513M

An application for a permit, photographs and plans (drawing no: 100, 5201, 5301) dated 13 May 2015 and (drawing no 5101) prepared by Malherbe Rust Architects dated 15 April 2015 was tabled

The matter was removed from the agenda as the proposed new ablution block does not trigger S34 or any other section of the NHRA

RN

**W.13.2 Proposed Alterations on Old Goede Hoop Homestead, Mont Rochelle Estate and Vineyards, Erf 1412/9, Goede Hoop Homestead Precinct, Franschhoek: NM
HM/FRANSCHHOEK/ERF 1412/9**

Case No: 15060102JW0603E

The Heritage Statement prepared by Graham Jacobs, undated was tabled.

GJ recused himself.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the manor house to be grade IIIB and the grading of the outbuilding to be IIIC.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals subject to the following conditions:

- Any below ground disturbance within the historical werf must be monitored by a historical archaeologist.
- The interventions to the historic core of the manor house are to be supervised by a heritage architect.

JW

**W.13.3 Proposed Alterations, Erf 186, Le Roux & Kie, Van Der Stel Street, Tulbagh: MA
HM/TULBAGH/ERF 186**

A site inspection report was tabled.

The Committee noted the site inspection report.

RN

W 13.4 Proposed Alterations on Kinbrae Court, Erf 1407, Ptn of Erf 1406, No 10 Kinbrae Court, Belle Ombre Road, Tamboerskloof: NM HM/TAMBOERSKLOOF/ERF 1406

Application and plans prepared by T Jordaan, dated March 2015 was tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade IIIC.

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposals due to the negative impact on the architectural integrity of the main façade of the building and the contribution of the projecting balconies to the character of the façade.

In the absence of a clear strategy for the enclosure of balconies by the body corporate for this block, ad hoc balcony enclosures could have a cumulative negative impact.

JW

W 13.5 Proposed Alterations on Erf 383, No 42 Woodside Road, Tamboerskloof: NM HM/TAMBOERSKLOOF/ERF 383

An application and plans prepared by Visser Architects, dated 24.04.2015 were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

It was noted that the Committee had previously graded the building IIIB.

The Committee supported the principle of a single garage.

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposals given the impact on the streetscape and the front garden space. Concerns were raised regarding the following:

- The scale of the proposals.
- The extension of the deck onto the street boundary.
- The height of the garage outbuilding.

There is lack of clarity on the proposed alterations to the boundary wall treatment and impacts on associated historic fabric.

JW

**W.13.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Rem of Farm 705, Spice Route (Leeuwenjacht), Agter Paarl Road, Agter Paarl, Pizzeria Kitchen and Ablution Addition: NM
HM/AGTER PAARL/REM OF FARM 705**

Case No: 15051304RN0513M

An application for a permit, photographs and plans (drawing no: 100, 5201, 5301) dated 13 May 2015 and (drawing no 5101) prepared by Malherbe Rust Architects dated 15 April 2015 was tabled

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee resolved to request further information on the age and heritage significance of the building.

The Committee is unable to assess the proposals in the absence of this information.

RN

W.14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

W.14.1 None

W. 15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

W.15.1 None

W.16. PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

W.16.1 None

W.17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

W.17.1 None

W.18. PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

W.18.1 None

W.19. REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

W.19.1 None

W.20. Other Matters

W.20.1 None

SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION

E.11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

E.11.1 Restoration of Long Cottage on Erf 87086, No 248 Main Road, Muizenberg: MA HM\CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN\MUIZENBERG\ERF 87086

Case No: 14041612GT0514M

A Completion Report prepared by Stuart Hermansen, dated May 2015 was tabled.

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to accept the report and as per the agreement between the owner and HWC resolved that the deposit must be repaid.

KR

E.12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

E.12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 65915, 8 Wythan Avenue, Kenilworth: MA HM/KENILWORTH/ERF 65915

Case No: 15051114GT0513M

A site inspection report was tabled.

Mr Guy Thomas made a power-point presentation.

It was noted that a site inspection was conducted by GJ, SW, PH and SH and staff members (JW, RN and GT)

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be III B given its architectural and historical value and its association with the work of a recognised master.

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposed demolition.

The Committee agreed that the adaptive re-use of the building and the removal of later, less significant accretions could be considered.

GT

**E.12.2 Proposed Total Demolition on Highclere, Erf 280, 8 Ranke Road
Blaauwbergstrand: MA
HM/BLAAUWBERGSTRAND/ERF 280**

Case No: 14121801GT0115M

Application and a heritage statement prepared by A Lillie, dated 14 January 2015 was tabled

MS recused himself

Mr Guy Thomas made a power-point presentation.

Mr Ashley Lillie, Ms Marie-Lou Roux, Mr Orton and various representatives from the City of Cape Town were present.

The chair indicated that Mr Jacobs had a prior involvement in the case. The parties present agreed that there was no conflict of interest.

The City tabled various arguments regarding the legal status of the application and the steps undertaken by the City to protect the building. It was indicated that HWC would respond to the legal arguments in due course.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to conduct a site inspection and to convene a special BELCom meeting immediately afterwards.

Copies of all the relevant documents are to be circulated to all parties ahead of the meeting.

GT

**W 12.3 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 998, 152 Waterkant Street, Greenpoint: MA
HM/GREENPOINT/ERF 152**

Case No: 15041408KR0416M

An application for a permit, motivation and plans prepared by G squared Architecture and Interiors, dated 10 April 2014 were tabled.

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee resolved to conduct a site visit (GJ, MS and SW) and requested that a CoCT HRS representative be invited to attend.

KR

**E 12.4 Proposed Total demolition on Erf 304, No 28 Scott Street, Lower Gardens, Vredehoek
HM/VREDEHOEK/ERF 303**

Case No: 15052618KR0416M

An application and a Heritage Statement prepared by Claire Abrahamse, dated April 2015 were tabled

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

Representatives from CIBRA were present when the matter was discussed.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to remove the item from the agenda as the applicants and ownership details on annexure A are inconsistent and there is no power of attorney.

KR

**E 12.5 Proposed Total demolition on Erf 303, No 26 Scott Street, Lower Gardens, Vredehoek
HM/VREDEHOEK/ERF 303**

Case No: 15052618KR0416M

An application and a Heritage Statement prepared by Claire Abrahamse, dated April 2015 were tabled.

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

Representatives from CIBRA were present when matter was discussed.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to remove the item from the agenda as the applicant's and ownership details in Annexure A are inconsistent and no power of attorney is provided

KR

E.13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

**E.13.1 Proposed alterations on Old Spier Café (slave quarters) and werf area at spier, Farm 1419, Stellenbosch: MA
HM/STELLENBOSCH/FARM 1419**

Case No: 14082805KR0901M

A Completion Report prepared by Claire Abrahamse, dated May 2015 was tabled

GJ recused himself.

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to accept the report.

KR

E.14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

E.14.1 None

E.15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

E.15.1 None

E.16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

E.16.1 None

E.17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

E.17.1 None

E.18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

E.18.1 None

E.19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

E.19.1 None

E.20 NON COMPLIANCE

E.20.1 None

20. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

21. CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at: **15H30**

22 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 8 July 2015

CHAIRPERSON _____ **DATE** _____

SECRETARY _____ **DATE** _____