

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING
OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Wednesday, 18 December 2013, 1st Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09H00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The meeting was officially opened at 09:00 by the chairperson, Ms Sarah Winter, and she welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms Sarah Winter
Ms Belinda Mutti
Mr Graham Jacobs
Mr Michael Scurr
Mr Rowen Ruiters
Mr Stuart Hermansen
Mr Peter Buttgens

SW
BM
GJ
MS
RR
SH
PB

Members of Staff

Mr Andrew Hall AH
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka ZS
Mr Troy Smuts TS
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec) LM
Mr Ronny Nyuka RN
Mr Olwethu-Oz-Dlova (Sec) OD
Mr Jonathan Windvogel JW
Ms Ntombekhaya Nkoane NN
Mr Christina Jikelo CJ

Visitors

Ms Ilse Lochner
Ms Sanet Stander
Ms Maritjie Smit
Ms Berta Hayes
Ms Elaine Aucamp
Mr Chris Snelling

Ms Clarrisa Molteno
Ms Lauren Fine
Ms Helen May
Mr Ashley Lillie
Ms Corlie Smart

Observers

None

3. Apologies

None

4. Approval of minutes of previous meeting held 27 November 2013

4.1 The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with minor amendments.

5. Disclosure of Interest

5.1 **GJ:** W.12.5 and E.10.1
MS: 8.6, 8.8, , E.11.3 and E.18.1
SH: W.12.1 and E.12.3
SW: W.10.3 and W.10.5

6. Approval of Agenda

The Committee approved the agenda dated 18th December 2013 with following additional item:

- Proposed Alterations and Additions, Stellenbosch Museum, c/o Ryneveld and Plein Streets, Stellenbosch

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

No new matters to report

AH/ZS

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges

8.2.1 Formal Stop Works Order for Unauthorised Work, Erf 106, 1 Church Street (Museum), Tulbagh

JW reported that Mr van Wijk had informed him that the sand had been removed from the furrow and that photographs would be forwarded to HWC as requested.

JW

8.3 Checklist for Applications

The matter was held over for discussion at the next meeting.

ZS

8.4 Elim Workshop

CJ reported that that draft report had not yet been circulated as the CEO's presentation had been misplaced. SW expressed concern and requested that the draft report be circulated before the end of the year, with or without the CEO's presentation.

CJ

8.5 Application for Departures on Erf 1324, Dorp Street, Stellenbosch: MA HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 1324

ZS and the CEO reported that an attempt has been made to set up a meeting with the Stellenbosch Municipality and that this will be followed up.

ZS/CEO

8.6 Unauthorised Work, Erf 90780 and 91062, Oak Cottage, Durban Road, Wynberg (PHS)

MS recused himself.

Mr John Rennie was present and took part in discussion.

The Committee accepts the proposals submitted by Rennie Scurr and Adendorff. It recommends that before the stop works order is lifted detailed proposals be submitted for consideration. HWC will require a written undertaking from the owner to

implement the remedial work within a set time frame and under the supervision of RSA Architects. HWC reserves its right to proceed with laying charges should the work not be properly implemented.

ZS

8.7 Resolution of Stop Works Order, at Purple Turtle (Old Imperial Hotel, 29 Shortmarket Street, Cape Town, Erf 2355, Cape Town

This matter was discussed by the Council on Friday, 13 December 2013. Oz/Litha, for the final minutes, please get summary of Council presentation from Andrew.

DECISION

That the specification for removal of the paint on the ground floor stonework be approved subject to the following:

- The making of a deposit of R 83 176.26, being equivalent to the cost of the proposed work.
- That the appointment of the specialist to remove the paint must be made by 31 January 2014 and a time frame for completion of the work agreed to by the CEO.
- That the specialist appointed be the same specialist who drew up the specification.
- Should the appointment of the specialist and the work not be completed within the specified time frame the deposit be forfeited to HWC and used to complete the work in so far as may be possible. (the matter to be confirmed via email)

8.8 Process Report, Fleurbaix, Stellenbosch: Portion 6 of Farm 1060

MS recused himself and took part in discussion.

The Committee endorses the process report, prepared by Rennie Scurr Adendorff, dated 04 December 2013.

No further work may be undertaken until the report has been completed and a S 27 application is submitted.

9. Appointments

9.1 The Committee noted the appointment under item E.12.4 set for 12H00.

FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION

W.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

W.10.1 Proposed Alterations, Schreuderhuis, Stellenbosch, Stellenbosch Village Museum, Erf 1271, Cnr Kerk and Ryneveld Street, Stellenbosch: NM HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 1271

Case No: 131204JW11E

An application and photographs prepared by HB Architects, undated were tabled.

SH recused himself.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application with the condition that the floor slab as proposed be divided into sections of at least 1m square to facilitate future easier removal. This does not apply to the proposed corcolem floor surface finish.

JW

**W.10.2 Proposed Landscaping Trafalgar Park, Erf 8168, Cnr of Sir Lowry and Searle Street, Woodstock: NM
HM/WOODSTOCK/ERF 8168**

Case No: 131206JW06M

An application and plans prepared by Studio MAS, dated 13 November 2013 was tabled

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee strongly welcomes the intention to upgrade the park and activate its edges by providing spatial linkages with adjacent properties. However, the Committee requires further information on the broader landscaping vision for the park as a whole. It also requires contour information, particularly regards to the historic earthworks and an indication of the archaeological sensitivity of the site and extent of the ground disturbance that would be undertaken.

The applicant is to be invited to attend the January 2014 meeting.

JW

**W.10.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions to existing structures, Oude Werf Hotel, Erf 16044, 30 Church Street, Stellenbosch: NM
HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 16044**

Case No: 031112JW27M

An application and plans prepared by Revel Fox and Partners, dated 13.09.2013 was tabled.

SH and SW recused themselves and MS took the chair.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the site to be grade II and the Spice Café to be grade IIIB.

The Committee requested further information to be provided by the architects regarding the application with particular attention to the interface between historic and proposed new fabric. It is further required that the previous heritage reports and assessment be updated by the heritage practitioners to contextualise the proposal and assess the significance of the proposed changes.

The consultant team on the project is to be invited to attend the next meeting at which the project is presented.

JW

**W.10.4 Proposed Restoration on Field of Springs, Erf 861, Abutting Homestead Park, Upper Orange, Oranjezicht: MA
HM/ORANJEZICHT/ERF 861**

Case No: 131104RN17E

PB and MS reported back on their sit visit.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the lime plaster repairs and limewash application on condition that the work is undertaken by a suitably qualified and experienced heritage skilled contractor approved by HWC. The remaining work is yet to be approved. HWC recommends that the City seek the advice of a structural engineer to advise on the stability of the embankment after the tree removal. It also recommends that the City obtain the advice of the water engineer to advise on the flooding of the vault. Any ground disturbance within the vicinity of the vault will need to be supervised by a historical archaeologist.

RN

**W.10.5 Proposed Additions to existing structures, Boschendal Farm, portion 10 of Farm 1674, Off the R310, Dwars River Valley: NM
HM/DWARSRIVERVALLEY/FARM 1674**

Case No: 131024TS48M

An application and plans prepared by Philip Briel, dated October 2013 were tabled.

SW, SH and GJ recused themselves and RR took the chair.

Mr Troy Smuts made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

TS

**W.10.6 Proposed Alterations, Erf 1271, Bletterman House Annex, Stellenbosch Village Museum, Cnr Plein and Ryneveld Street, Stellenbosch
HM/STELLENBOSC/ERF 1271/BLETTERMAN HOUSE ANNEX**

Case No: 131204JW12E

An application, plans and photographs were tabled.

SH recused himself and jtook part in discussion.

Ms Berta Hayes and Ms Elaine Aucamp of the Stellenbosch Interest Group were present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building known as the *slawehuis* to be grade II and Victoria College building to be grade IIIB.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals except for the proposed umbrella and railing and the proposed gutter, and the removal of the original sash windows.

The Committee queried the approval status of the existing umbrella's and signage and was concerned by the cumulative impact of further accretions on the front façade. It thus requested a reconsideration of the treatment of this façade.

JW

W.11 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

W.11.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 15449, 84-90 Foundry Road, Salt River: MA HM/SALT RIVER/ERF 15449

Case No: 130912JW12E

Report dated 15 November 2013 by EAS Engineering Analysis Services (Ted Kelly), together with covering letter by Ashley Lillie dated 6 December 2013 was tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr Ashley Lillie was present and took part during discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to accept the findings of the structural engineer and to approve the demolition of the front façade and colonnade.

The Committee strongly recommends that the replacement building re-instate a similar colonnade in the interest of the environmental qualities of the area and that this be implemented through the provisions of the HPOZ.

JW

W.11.2 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 57935, Hoogeind, 6 Torguay Avenue, Claremont, Cape Town: NM HM/CLAREMONT/ERF57935

Case No: 131114RN33E

An application and photographs prepared by Ashley Lillie, dated 13 November 2013 to be tabled.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation. Mr Lillie also made a presentation on the comparative analysis and grading of buildings from a similar period.

MS and PB reported on their site visit.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The two Committee members who had inspected the site did not support demolition.
- It would be necessary for all Committee members to undertake a site inspection before a decision could be made. The case officer would set up the meeting in consultation with Mr Lillie.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a full recorded site inspection.

RN

W.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

W.12.1 Proposed Additions to existing structures at Looiershuis, Erf 13190, 43 Market Street, Stellenbosch: NM HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 13190

Case No: 131204JW10E

An application and Heritage Statement prepared by Corlie Smart, dated November 2013 were tabled.

SH recused himself.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Ms Corlie Smart was present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade IIIC.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

JW

W.12.2 Proposed Alterations and Landscaping, House Kreeve, Erf 383, 42 Woodside Road, Tamboerskloof: NM HM/TAMBOERSKLOOF/ERF 383

Case No: 130919JW24E

An application and plans was tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The designs of the proposed gates are unsympathetic to the character of the area by being over-scaled and out-of-keeping with the vertical palisade and permeable boundary treatment.
- The existing gate and pergola appear to already serve the purpose for which the alterations are intended.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade IIB within a significant streetscape.

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposal.

JW

W.12.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 88668, Main Road, Kalk Bay: NM HM/KALK BAY/ERF 88668

Case No: 131120JW40E

An application, plans and Heritage Report prepared by Chris Snelling, dated November 2013 to be tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr Chris Snelling was present.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The City and Kalk Bay-St James Ratepayers Association supported the proposals.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade IIIC and it is situated within a HPOZ.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

JW

W.12.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 2991, 50 Lion Street, Cape Town: NM HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 2991

Case No: 130826RN13E

An application and plans prepared by M Joseph, dated May 2013 to be tabled.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The streetscape appeared to be relatively intact based on the photographic material submitted.
- There was a concern about introducing foreign elements such as the curved balcony.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to grade the building a grade IIIC.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals subject to the the opening on the projecting bay remaining as is and the proposed balcony being rectilinear in plan configuration. Furthermore, the height of the garage terrace is to be reduced by 400mm and stepped down from the existing stoep level.

RN

**W.12.5 Proposed Additions to existing structures, Erf 327, Clanwilliam: NM
HM/CLANWILLIAM/ERF327**

Case No: 131122RN56E

An application, photographs and plans prepared by Williams and van Rensburg, dated 11/11/2013 were tabled

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

Mrs Ilze Lochner, Ms Sanet Stander and Mrs Marietjie Smit were present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be IIC.

The Committee resolved to support the proposal in principle. However, concerns were raised regarding the junction between the existing building and the proposed addition. The Committee recommended that the new addition be set back from the existing building by at least the width of the existing entrance steps. Revised proposals must be submitted.

RN

**W.12.6 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 1674/4, Le Rhone, Simondium, now forms part of the Boschendal Farm: NM
HM/SIMONDIUM/ERF467/4**

Case No: 131119RN22M

An application and plans prepared by Nelia Malherbe, dated 13/11/2013 to be tabled.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- Le Rhone is a provincial heritage site.

DECISION

The matter was withdrawn from the agenda as the application was submitted under the wrong section of the Act and that this might have affected the information provided.

RN

**W.12.7 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 9649, Lourens Street, Somerset West: NM
HM/SOMERSET WEST/ERF 9649**

Case No: 131113RN31E

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- SH reported back on his site visit.

- The proposed work was all but completed and little heritage significance remained.
- The building forms part of an important heritage site and SH was of the opinion that the building dated to at least the 1880's.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to recommend that HWC proceed with laying charges.

RN

W.12.8 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 24292, Louws Avenue, Suider Paarl: MA HM/PAARL/ERF24292

Heritage Statement prepared by 13 September 2013 to be tabled

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation
GJ SH and SW reported back on their site visit.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building has little intrinsic value and does not form part of a significant streetscape.
- The adjacent factory building is a landmark building and is of grade IIIB status.
- The use of the site for parking should be mitigated by landscaping or the introduction of an appropriately scaled walled element along the street edge.
- The Committee does not support the ad hoc retention of the front façade and veranda.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that the building is un-gradable.

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition.

The case officer must advise the Interested and Affected parties of their right to appeal.

RN

W.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

W.13.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 487, No 92 The Ridge, Clifton, Cape Town: NM HM/CLIFTON/ERF 487

Case No: 131114JW31E

An application and Heritage Statement prepared by Ashley Lillie, dated 13 November 2013 to be tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.
Mr Lillie, Ms Lauren Fine and Adv. Molteno were present and participated in the discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The site is within a declared heritage area.

- The regulations make no provision for demolitions, but that S31 (9) provides for other protections under the act to apply and that S34 (3) has not been applied to the Clifton heritage area.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to seek legal opinion to clarify the applicability of S31 in the case of a S34 demolition application for the Clifton heritage area.

JW

W. 14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

W.14.1 None

W.15. PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

W.15.1 None

W.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

W.16.1 None

W.17. PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

W.17.1 None

W.18. REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

W.18.1 None

W.19. Other Matters

W.19.1 None

SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION

E.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

E.10.1 Proposed Paving on Historic Dutch Reformed Church, Somerset West: MA HM/SOMERSET WEST

Plans prepared by Steyn le Roux Truter, undated were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

GJ recused himself.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the paving proposal, drawing no.4866, dated 03 December 2013.

NN

E.11. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

E.11.1 Proposed Partial Demolition on Tothills and Total Demolition of Warehouse, Erf 163045, Cnr Buitengracht and castle street, Cape Town: MA HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 163045

Case No: 131125NN46E

Matter has been withdrawn from the agenda on request of the applicant.

NN

E.11.2 Proposed Total Demolition on House Mac Donald, Erf 122, 119 Victoria Road, Camps Bay: NM HM/CAMPS BAY/ERF 122

Case No: 131023NN38M

An application and structure Specification to be tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposed demolition.

NN

E.11.3 Proposed Signage, Rex Trueform, Erf 175134, 263 Victoria Road, Salt River: NM HM/SALT RIVER/ERF 175134

Case No: 131023NN38M

An application and signage specifications were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

MS recused himself.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to request further information to clarify the position and relative size of the signage.

It is recommended that consideration be given to the issue of signage being dealt with in the CMP in order to inform future such interventions.

NN

E.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

E12.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 342, Taillard Street, Arniston: NM HM/ARNISTON/ERF 342

Case No: 130930NN36M

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The revised proposal addressed the previous concerns.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

NN

E.12.2 Proposed Restorations, Uitkyk, Erf 4907, Paarl: NM HM/PAARL/ERF 45907

Case No: 131125NN49E

An application and Heritage Statement prepared by Aikman Associates, dated November 2013 were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The utilitarian nature of the building is significantly changed and this can be mitigated to some extent by the retention or use of corrugated iron barn doors or gates.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal subject to the sliding gate being retained on the west elevation and a similar sliding gate being installed on the east elevation with the new door opening reduced accordingly, and that the folding doors on the elevations be replaced with inward opening doors or folding doors stackable on the inside.

NN

E.12.3 Proposed Alterations on Erf 1802, 1 Murray Street, Stellenbosch: NM HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 1802

Case No: 131204NN22E

An application and Heritage Report prepared by Corlie Smart, undated were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Committee does not agree with the Stellenbosch Municipality's comment regarding the reconfiguration of the bathroom.

- The Committee noted the comment regarding the boundary wall but had not received an application in that regard.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be a grade IIIB.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

NN

E.12.4 Proposed Alterations at Purple Turtle (Old Imperial Hotel, 29 Shortmarket Street, Cape Town, Erf 2355, Cape Town: MA HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 2355

Case No: 111124ZS23M

Drawings prepared by Mathews Architectural were tabled

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation.

Mr Ashely Lillie was present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals subject to the timber being painted to match the other joinery and the submission of revised drawings indicating inward opening swing doors.

This decision is suspended until email resolution of item 8.7

ZS

E.12.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Thierry Farm, Ptn 42/127, Helshoogte Road, Stellenbosch: NM HM/STELLENBOSCH/FARM 127

Case No: 131203NN24E

An application and plans prepared by Patty Price, dated 19/09/2013 to be tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of site to be a grade IIIB.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal subject to the front façade (north east elevation) being retained as is and the elevated structure on the south east elevation being significantly reduced to below the eaves lines of the thatch.

Revised drawings must be submitted.

NN

E 12.6 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Rem of Ptn 1 of Vrolikheid, Farm 135, Mc Gregor, De Erf, Along public road between Mc Gregor and Robertson: NM HM/MC GREGOR/FARM 135

Case No: 131205NN30E

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the complex to be grade II in terms of its architectural qualities and relation to its setting.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals subject to the mitigation proposals described in drawing no. P35.101 dated 2013 and prepared by Claire Abrahamse being implemented, the work being supervised by a suitably qualified heritage practitioner and the submission of the completion report within two months of conclusion of work.

NN

E.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

E.13.1 None

E.14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

E.14.1 None

E.15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

E.15.1 None

E.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

E.16.1 None

E.17 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

E.17.1 None

E.18 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

E.18.1 Klein Constantia, Constantia, portion of Farm 1121, Constantia. Clarity re Consultation with CPOA, SVD Stel and SAHRA: NM

Drawings prepared by Hout Street Design Studio, dated November 2013 were tabled together with a summary by Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects 04 December 2012.

MS recused himself.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

ADVICE

The Committee advised that if the refinements to the proposals do not materially change the approved proposals or conflict with previous comments from I & AP's that

it would not be necessary to obtain further comments. It is suggested that as a courtesy revisions be forwarded to I& AP's.

NN

E.19 Other Matters

E.19.1 None

20. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions other than item 8.7 which has to be confirmed by email.

21. CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at **17H00**

22 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 30 January 2014

CHAIRPERSON _____ **DATE** _____

SECRETARY _____ **DATE** _____