

**MINUTES OF MEETING  
OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,  
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)  
Held on Wednesday, 21 November 2012, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the  
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,  
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09H00**

---

**1. Opening and Welcome**

The meeting was officially opened at 09H10 by the chairperson, Ms Sarah Winter, and she welcomed everyone present.

**2. Attendance**

**Members**

Ms Sarah Winter	SW
Ms Maureen Wolters	MW
Mr Roger Joshua	RJ
Mr Trevor Thorold	TT
Mr Tim Hart	TH
Dr Stephen Townsend (arrived 9.50am)	ST
Ms Melanie Attwell	MA
Mr Patrick Fefeza	PF

**Members of Staff**

Mr Andrew Hall	AH
Mr Calvin van Wijk	CvW
Ms Christina Jikelo	JC
Mr Jonathan Windvogel	JW
Mr Olwethu Dlova (Sec)	OD
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)	LM
Mr Ronny Nyuka	RN
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka	ZS
Ms Jenna Lavin	JL
Mr Troy Smuts	TS

**Visitors**

Mr Mark Wiley  
Mr Dave Cowley  
Mr Chris Everett  
Mr Calvin Mojapelo  
Mrs PE Botha  
Mr H. van Aswegen

Mrs Anne Murphy  
Mr Christopher Hudson  
Mr Mike Slayen  
Mrs Elaine Aucamp  
Dr Elzet Albertyn  
Mrs H. Cloete

**Observers**

None

**3. Apologies**

3.1 None

**4. Approval of minutes of previous meeting held 17 October 2012**

4.1 The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with no amendments.

**5. Disclosure of Interest**

5.1 MA: E.10.1

**6. Approval of Agenda**

The Committee approved the agenda with no additional items.

**7. Confidential Matters**

7.1 None

**8. Administration Matters**

## **8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees**

Mr van Wijk gave a report back on the outcome of the following tribunal cases:

- Erf 162892, 18 Osborne Street, Zonnebloem; and
- Erf 162889, 12 Osborne Street, Zonnebloem.

## **8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges**

Mr van Wijk reported back on the Klein Konstantia, 4 Konstantia Street, Paarl and Mamre matters.

## **8.3 Digital distribution of documents**

Mr Troy Smuts made a power-point presentation.

## **8.4 Ptn 53 and Ptn 4 of Farm 281, Cape Agulhas Lighthouse**

Mr Shiceka reported back and the Committee resolved that Mr Shiceka will visit the site to ensure that the work is according to approved specifications and that the work is being appropriately supervised. Mr Shiceka will report back to the Committee by email including photographs and information on who is supervising the work.

## **8.5 Compulsory Repair Order: Watergat Provincial Heritage Site, Bien Donne Farm, Watergat Road, Simondium, Paarl**

Mr Hall reported on progress in this matter and informed the Committee that the owner had requested an extension to the time period in which to respond to the compulsory repair order. The matter had been tabled at EXCO.

## **8.6 Remainder of Ptn 2 of the Farm Rotterdam No.166, Buffeljagsrivier, District Swellendam**

The CEO reported back that legal opinion was requested.

## **8.7 Overstrand Municipality Issues of Jurisdiction**

Mr Hall will meet with the Municipal Manager and Mr John Simson to clarify issues of jurisdiction especially with respect to Section 34 and Section 31.

## **8.8 Elim Applications**

The Committee discussed the matter at length and agreed that a workshop would be held in February 2013 and that this would be arranged by Ms Jikelo in discussion with Ms Wolters and Dr Townsend.

## **8.9 Mamre**

Mr Thorold and other Committee members raised concerns regarding the cumulative impacts of changes to the werf and the poor condition of its historical buildings. It was agreed that Mr van Wijk and Mr Dyers together with a heritage official from the City of Cape Town should visit the site and report back on the state of conservation of the werf.

## 9. Appointments

9.1 The Committee noted the appointments set for W.19.1

### FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION

#### W. 10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

##### W.10.1 Proposed Excavation on Company Gardens, Between Queen Victoria and St Johns Road, Erf 95164/ 95136, Gardens: NM HM/GARDENS/ERF 95164/95136

**Case No:** 121030JW02E

An application prepared by City of Cape Town, dated 30 October 2012, photographs and plans were tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by TH, ST and SW.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The site is situated within an area of high archaeological sensitivity.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee decided the grading of the site to be Grade I.

Given the heritage significance and sensitivity of the site, the Committee requests that a monitoring brief be preceded by historical map analysis and a statement on the archaeological sensitivity which must be vetted by HWC (via Ms Lavin).

**JW**

##### W.10.2 Proposed Total Demolition, Bergstraat 34, Elim: NM HM/ELIM/BERGSTRAAT 34

**Case No:** 120831JW29M

An application prepared by P.K Siebrits, dated 31 August 2012, photographs and plans were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by RJ, SW and ST.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- Plans for a new building must be submitted to HWC for approval and must conform to dimensions of the existing building.
- The building appears to be unsalvageable.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee recognises that the building is situated in a grade II site.

The Committee resolved to approve the application subject to:

- The submission of measured drawings (plan only) including adjacent buildings, property boundaries, building dimensions and its internal layout and photographs showing/including a metre stick.

JW

**W.10.3 Proposed Total Demolition, Boom Street 53, Elim: NM  
HM/ELIM/BOOM STREET 53**

**Case No:** 120906JW22E

An application and photographs were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by RJ, SW and ST.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The new building should conform to the guidelines for Elim.
- Should a new dwelling be constructed plans must be submitted to HWC for approval.
- The building appears to be unsalvageable.

**DECISION**

The Committee recognises that the building is situated in a grade II site.

The Committee resolved to approve the application subject to:

- The submission of measured drawings (plan only) including adjacent buildings, property boundaries, building dimensions and its internal layout and photographs showing/including a metre stick.

JW

**W.10.4 Proposed Addition to existing structure, Erf 237, 6 Kort Street, Elim: NM  
HM/ELIM/ERF 237**

**Case No:** 110627JW33

An application and plans, dated 28 August 2012 were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by RJ, SW and ST.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr H. van Aswegen and Mrs H. Cloete was present and participated during discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The owner is advised to make some changes to the proposed plans and resubmit to BELCom for consideration.
- A proposal had been inappropriately approved by the officials in 2010 but this proposal had been refused by the local authority for NBR&BS Act-related reasons.

The Committee agreed that it was *functus officio* in this matter and advised that a new application be submitted with some suggested changes.

JW

**W.10.5 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Buitekant Street 8, Elim: NM  
HM/ELIM/BUITEKANT STREET 8**

**Case No:** 120802RN22ER

An application prepared by Mr David Willemse, dated 1 August 2012, photographs and plans were tabled.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation

**DECISION**

The Committee recognises that the building is situated in a grade II site.

The Committee resolved that MW will undertake a site inspection and report back at the next meeting.

**RN**

**W.11 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL  
DEMOLITION**

**W.11.1 Proposed Total Demolition of all structures on Erf 2289, 10 Cluver Road,  
Stellenbosch: NM  
HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 2289**

**Case No:** 121107RN19M

An Application prepared by Dr Elzet Albertyn, dated 6 November 2012, photographs, plans and comments from I&APs were tabled

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation

Dr Elzet Albertyn, Mrs PE Botha and Mrs Elaine Aucamp were present and participated during the discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation has no objection to the proposed demolition.
- The Stellenbosch Advisory Committee has no objection to the proposed demolition. Neither of the parties were aware of the survey of Stellenbosch currently under way.
- The Stellenbosch Interest Group does not support the demolition.
- The building is not worthy formal protection.

**DECISION**

The Committee decided the grading to be ungradable.

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition as the building is not worthy of formal protection.

**RN**

**W. 12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

W.12.1 None

**W.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS**

W.13.1 None

**W. 14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT**

W.14.1 None

**W.15. PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL**

W.15.1 None

**W.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS**

W.16.1 None

**W.17. PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS**

W.17.1 None

**W.18. REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE**

W.18.1 None

**W.19. Other Matters**

**W.19.1 The Current Condition of East Fort, Hout Bay  
HM/HOUT BAY/EAST FORT**

A User Agreement between SANParks and Hout Bay and Llandudno Heritage Trust dated 30 November 2011 was tabled.

Mr Mark Wiley representing WCPP, Mrs Anne Murphy, Mr Dave Cowley, Mr Christopher Hudson and Mr Chris Everett representing HBHT, Mr Mike Slayen and Mr Calvin Mojapelo representing SANParks were present and participated during discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- It appears that the Trust and SANParks have different understandings or expectations in respect of the financial and practical responsibilities for stabilising the declared PHS structures and sites.
- It appears that the two parties are likely to take some time to reach agreement on the Trust's proposals (which will then have to be approved by HWC).
- There is an immediate concern regarding the continuing eroding and degrading of the structures and the site.

## **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection before the 26<sup>th</sup> November 2012 and thereafter make a decision whether to serve a compulsory repair order immediately or not.

**TS**

## **SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION**

### **E.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS**

**E.10.1** West Coast Fossil Park, Precinct One, Farm 1223, Saldanha Bay (West Coast)  
Municipality: NM  
HM/SALDANHA BAY/FARM 1223

Case No: 120502JL01

Baseline Study prepared by Melanie Attwell and Associates, dated 22 October 2012 was tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by TH and ST

Ms Attwell recused herself

Ms Jenna Lavin made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The report had been submitted to APM and APM's comments were tabled.
- The site was recently declared a PHS.

#### **COMMENT**

- HWC endorses the statement of significance and heritage related design indicators.
- HWC endorses the choice of the site for the proposed visitors centre in Precinct 1.
- HWC supports the adaptive re-use of the industrial infrastructure where possible.
- HWC endorses the recommendations included in the report in Annexure 3 prepared by Ms P. Haarhof.

**JL**

### **E.11. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION**

**E.11.1** None

### **E. 12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**E.12.1** None

### **E.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS**

**E.13.1** None

**E.14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT**

E.14.1 None

**E.15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL**

E.15.1 None

**E.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS**

E.16.1 None

**E.17 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS**

E.17.1 None

**E.18 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE**

E.18.1 None

**E.19 Other Matters**

E.19.1 None

**20. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS**

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

**21. CLOSURE**

The meeting adjourned at . **14H35**

**22 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 12 December 2012**

**CHAIRPERSON** \_\_\_\_\_ **DATE** \_\_\_\_\_

**SECRETARY** \_\_\_\_\_ **DATE** \_\_\_\_\_