

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Wednesday, 21 October 2015 at the 1st Floor Boardroom, at the Offices
of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09:00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The Chairperson Ms Sarah Winter officially opened the meeting at 09:05 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms Sarah Winter
Mr Peter Buttgens
Mr Mike Scurr
Mr Graham Jacobs
Mr Rowen Ruiters
Ms Belinda Mutti

SW
PB
MS
GJ
RR
BM

Members of Staff

Dr Errol Myburg
Ms Jenna Lavin
Ms Penny Meyer
Mr Guy Thomas
Mr Jonathan Windvogel
Mr Andrew September
Ms Heidi Boise
Ms Waseefa Dhansay
Mr Olwethu Oz Dlova (Sec)
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)

EM
JL
PM
GT
JW
AS
HB
WD
OD
LM

Visitors

Mr John Rennie
Mr Henry Aikman
Dr Nicholas Baumann
Mr Johan Malherbe
Nr M Miromo
Mrs Annelise Botes
Mr Willem Louw
Mr David Townsend
Sarah Jane Jackson

JR
HA
NB
JM
MM
AB
WL
AT

Mr Ashley Lillie
Mr David Kirsch
Mr Johan Cornelius
Ms S Jackson
Mrs Zhirah Sablay
Mr Aidan Hart
Ms Melanie Attwell

AL
DK
JC
SJ
ZS
AH
MA

Observers

Mr Bewin September (CoCT)

BS

3. Apologies

Mr Stuart Hermansen
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka
Ms Katherine Robinson

SH
ZS
KR

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 21 October 2015

The Committee approved the agenda dated 21 October 2015 with minor amendments.

5 Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting

5.1 Dated 30 September 2015

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes without amendments.

6. Disclosure of Interest

- MS: 11.2, 11.3 and 11.5

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees some of these are carry overs from previous meeting

There were no new matters to report.

PM

8.2 Report Back on Stop Works Orders and Charges

8.2.1 Erf 156896, 47 Bree Street, Cape Town

It was noted that a Stop Works Order was issued for unauthorized work carried out at Erf 156896, 47 Bree Street, Cape Town.

8.2.2 Erf 1837, 40 Bellevue Road, Vredehoek

It was noted that unauthorized work had been undertaken and that this has resulted in considerable damage to the heritage significance of the building.

The Committee recommended that the HWC lay charges in terms of Section 51(1)c of the NHRA

8.2.3 Erf 1847, 1 Hout Bay Main Road, Constantia

It was noted that a Stop Works Order was issued for unauthorized work carried out at Erf 1847, 1 Hout Bay Main Road, Constantia.

PM

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings Refused for Demolition

It was noted that there were no matters to report.

ZS

9. Standing items

9.1 Site Inspections

The following site inspections undertaken by Committee members were noted:

- Proposed Alterations and Additions to Klein Constantia Street, Paarl
- Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 1079, 28 Vredehoek Avenue, Vredehoek
- Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 827, 216 High Level Road, Sea Point

- Proposed Alterations and Additions to an PHS, Erf 656, 110 Dorp Street, Stellenbosch

The following site inspections undertaken by staff were noted:

- Erf 1938, 38 Bellevue Street, Gardens
- Erf 958, 8 Bedford Road, Vredehoek
- 47 Bree Street, Cape Town

PM

10. Appointments

10.1 The Committee noted the appointment for item 19.1 set for 14H00.

MATTERSDISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions to a PHS, Erf 656, 110 Dorp Street, Stellenbosch: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 656

Case No: 15090308KR0309E

Mr Andrew September made a power-point presentation.

SW, PB and GJ reported back on their site inspection.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade II given its high architectural and historical significance and its contribution to the Dorp Street streetscape. The property is one of the last remaining historical erven which has retained a strong visual and spatial relationship between street and court yard space and a characteristic figure ground pattern which is typical of a large part of Dorp Street.

The Committee was of the opinion that the proposals are highly problematic on a conceptual level particularly in terms of the bridging of the court yard space and the negative impact that this would have on the figure ground pattern of the site, visual spatial linkages and axial relationships.

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposals.

KR

11.2 Erf 95030, Rem Erf 95031, 7 Weltevreden Street, Gardens:NM CAPE METROPOLITAN/GARDENS/ERF 95030, REM ERF 95031

Case No: 15091709HB0917M

Leinster Hall Interim Report 01 by Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects dated September 2015 was tabled.

MS recused himself.

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade II in terms of its architectural, aesthetic and historical value. Despite the fire damage the heritage significance of the building can be retained with sensitive interventions informed by a carefully considered conservation strategy.

The committee recognises the urgency to reinstate the roof and has no objection to the use of corrugated iron to achieve this. The committee supports the architect's intention that the new roof be structured to accept roof slates in the future. The Committee resolved to approve this proposal.

The Committee requests that a conservation strategy be submitted to HWC for endorsement and for this to inform any future interventions.

HB

11.3 Farm 281/53, Cape Agulhas Lighthouse- Restoration: NM OVERBERG/CAPE AGULHAS/STRUIS BAY/FARM 281/53

Case No: 15091510HB0916D

Heritage Report-proposed Interim Measures by Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects Dated 15 September 2015 was tabled.

MS recused himself.

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

Mr John Rennie was present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building is a highly significant and prominent PHS.
- Complete stone replacement (as previously approved) of the south side blind entrance is not possible now, but interim stabilisation and repair is recommended. LNS/RME should be encouraged to restore/ reinstate this stone feature at some point in the future. This would be subject to a Section 27 application.
- The Committee agreed with the decision not to remake the Egyptian emblem in a replica material now. (The original pre 1980s stone is still stored on site).
- The previously approved thinner granite pavers and edging on the south plinth are also not affordable now, and the options of whether to leave this work unfinished for possible future completion in stone (as previously approved) or to complete now in concrete and brick were discussed.
- The brick wall built to replace eroded stone, prior to the earlier Stop Works order, requires resolution and integration with the plinth.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the stabilisation and new rendering work to the Egyptian revival south side blind entrance as recommended in the report prepared by Mr Rennie dated 15 September 2015. This work includes stabilising the top

stones, dentil repairs to all severely eroded stones using a compatible lime mortar and the application of a render coat of sufficient thickness over the entire surface to consolidate the friable stonework, while at the same time retaining the visual integrity of the masonry joints and stone profiles behind. A proprietary mineral-based breathable paint coating or thin render should be investigated as a final barrier for weather resistance and prevention of water ingress.

The Committee approved the installation of water and waste sleeves/ piping to the centre weight tube to reach the tower top.

The Committee resolved to approve the alternate proposed completion work to the unfinished plinth. This work includes the casting of an exposed aggregate concrete finish on waterproofing in lieu of granite pavers, brick roller-course edging to match the rebuilt verandah/stoep on the north façade and finishing the brick plinth wall in a natural render to blend in with the landscape and vegetation.

The Committee fully supported the recommendation that the immediate landscape setting of the light house be reinstated particularly in terms of re-establishing the contours of its hilltop location. The Committee also supports the recommendation that RSA be authorised by LNS/RME to liaise with SANParks via their consultants in order to integrate any landscape proposals for the immediate and broader landscape setting of the light house.

Landscaping proposals will need to be submitted as part of a Section 27 application and should include the recommendation of an archaeologist regarding the archaeological sensitivity of the site.

HB

11.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions to Klein Constantia Street, Paarl: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 11306

Case No: 15090103JW0209D

SW and PB reported back on their site inspection.

Mr Henry Aikman and Mr David Kirsch were present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposed reinstatement of the internal layout of the building subject to the following conditions:

- That the size and position of the opening linking the dining room and kitchen be reduced as per previous approved plans dated May 2010
- That doors be reinstated at the end of the passage and that a door be positioned between the dining room and the passage. The detailing of these doors must be submitted to the case officer for stamping.

This approval does not condone other unauthorised work particularly the widening of the front stoep. The Committee is of the opinion that this negatively impacts the heritage significance of the building and recommends that the width of the pre-existing stoep be reinstated

JW

11.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions to Farm Fleurbaix, Stellenbosch: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSCH/PTN 6 FARM 1040

Case No: 14081108JW0813

MS recused himself.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

It was noted that BELCOM had requested that the applicant provide the Committee with an indication of when outstanding issues relating to unauthorised work undertaken prior to the current commission are intended to be resolved.

Mr Scurr reported that a submission that addresses the outstanding issues including an assessment of previous unauthorised work and proposed remedial work is to be submitted to HWC by early 2016.

JW

12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 827, 216 High Level Road, Sea Point: NM HM/CAPE TOWN/ SEA POINT/ERF 827

Case No: 15082410HB0825E

SW, MS and PB reported back on their site inspection.

Mr Ashley Lillie was present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The committee decided the grading of the building to be grade IIIB in terms of its intrinsic architectural value.

- The building has been impacted by ad hoc accretions but the historic core of the building is largely intact, authentic and legible
- The building retains a number of period features including joinery and fire places.
- The original layout of the building is intact. The turret is a rare architectural element in this context.

While the condition of the building is poor the Committee was of the opinion that this is recoverable.

The Committee resolved not to approve the demolition.

The building is located on a large site. The Committee was of the opinion that the development of the site could occur without impacting the heritage significance of the building.

HB

12.2 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 1079, 28 Vredehoek Avenue, Vredehoek: NM HM/CAPE TOWN/ VREDEHOEK/ERF 2142

Case No: 15071004HB0715E

MS and PB reported back on their site inspection.

Mr Johan Cornelius was present and took part in discussion

DECISION

The committee decided the grading of the building to be grade IIIC. However, the building has insufficient significance to warrant retention.

The site is located within a proposed HPOZ and the Committee agrees that this area has heritage value and is worthy of formal protection as a HPOZ. The building is located within an important street with a mix of single and double storey buildings and a general consistency of scale and massing.

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition subject to the plans for the re development of the site being submitted to HWC for approval.

HB

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Remainder of Portion 5 Erf 834, Boschgaas Fontein, Malmesbury: MA HM/WEST COAST/SWARTLAND/MALMESBURY/REMAINDER OF PORTION 5 ERF 834

Case No: 15033113KR04320M

A Heritage Statement prepared by A. Berman was tabled.

Mr Andrew September made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The heritage statement had adequately addressed a number of queries raised by the Committee.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals.

KR

13.2 Erf 1847 - Constantia Nek: NM HM/CONSTANTIA NEK/ERF 1874

Case No: 15091504WD0916E

Annexure A - Historical Background - CoCT Comment - Plans - Letter to BELCom was tabled.

Ms Waseefa Dhansay made a power-point presentation.

Dr Nicholas Baumann was present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- A cease works order has been issued and the architect indicated that no further unauthorised work has been undertaken

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection in order to clarify the nature and extent of unauthorised work and its impact on heritage significance. The Committee requested that a summary of unauthorised work and assessment of its impact on heritage significance be prepared by the heritage practitioner and that this be circulated to Committee members prior to the site inspection.

WD

13.3 Erf 4431, Cheve House, Paarl: NM CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 4431

Case No: 15090802HB0910E

Heritage Statement dated 5 August 2015 prepared by Malherbe Rust Architects, drawings S-200 Rev A dated 4 June 2015, 101 Rev A, 201 Rev A, dated 9 September 2015 & Heritage Statement prepared by DHF dated 4 September 2015 were tabled.

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

Mr Johan Malherbe and Ms S Jackson were present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection (SW, GJ, MS and PB). The Committee requested that the information provided by the DHF be addressed in the heritage statement particularly in terms of establishing the social significance of the building. This revised heritage statement must be circulated to the Committee members prior to the site inspection.

The Committee was of the opinion that the approved III B grading may be amended based on additional information.

HB

13.4 Erf 156896, 47 Bree Street, Cape Town Illegal Work: NM CAPE METROPOLITAN/CAPE TOWN/ERF 156896

Case No: 15091104HB0915E

Plans (drawing no: P282.01_1F;2F;3F,RF_CON_003, REV E, P282.G+S_FURN_000 REV E, P282.01_1F;2F;3F,RF_FURN_001, REV E, P282.01_G;SEC;FELEV_002 REV E were tabled

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- HWC had issued a cease works order and the architect indicated that no further unauthorised work is being undertaken.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection and requested that a summary of the unauthorised work and an assessment of its impact of heritage significance be prepared by a heritage practitioner and circulated to the Committee members prior to the site inspection.

HB

13.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 5876, 1 Morkel Street, Somerset West: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/SOMERSET WEST/ERF5879

Case No: 15080706KR0814E

Elevations: Drawing 1 Of 3, Site Plan: Drawing 2 of 3 & Floor Plans: Drawing 3 of 3
Dated 05-08-2015 by 2 Ad Space Inc and Sketch Up Model were tabled

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee agreed the grading of the building to be grade III C
The Committee resolved to approve the proposals as they will not impact heritage significance.

KR

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 Erf 5010 Castle of Good Hope Block F Lifts: NM HM\CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN\CITY CENTRE CBD\CASTLE OF GOOD HOPE DISABLED ACCESS FACILITIES

Case No: 14111907 AS1202M

A letter to HWC re HWC's response to the alternative Block F proposal was tabled.

Mr Andrew September made a power-point presentation.

ADVICE

The Committee advised that a new application be submitted and this be accompanied by the identification and assessment of alternative sites and their relative impact on heritage significance taking into account the authenticity of historic fabric and visibility.

AS

20 OTHER MATTERS

20.1 None

21. NON COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at: **14:30**

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 11 November 2015

CHAIRPERSON _____ **DATE** _____

SECRETARY _____ **DATE** _____