

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING
OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Wednesday, 22 March 2012, 1st Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09H00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The meeting was officially opened at 9h15 by the chairperson, Ms Sarah Winter, and she welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Dr Stephen Townsend	ST
Mr Trevor Thorold	TT
Mr Roger Joshua	RJ
Mr Patrick Fefeza	PF
Ms Sarah Winter	SW
Ms Melanie Attwell	MA

Members of Staff

Mr Andrew Hall	AH
Ms Christina Jikelo	CJ
Mr Calvin van Wijk	CvW
Ms Ntombi Nkoane	NN
Mr Olwethu Dlova (Sec)	OD
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)	LM
Ms Tamar Grover	TG
Mr Jonathan Windvogel	JW

Visitors

Prof Fabio Todeschini	FT
Ms Yvonne Leibman	YL
Mr Dave Sanders	DS
Mr L Ionel	LI
Ms Clare Abrahamse	CA
Ms P Malan	PM
Mr G Viljoen	GV
Mr Henry Aikman	HA
Mr Aidan Hart	AH
Ms Marise Potgieter	MP

Mr Stuart Hermansen	SH
Mr Ashley Lillie	AL
Mr Tendai Gava	TG
Mr S. Mallei	SM
Mr Graham Jacobs	GJ
Mr M Malan	MM
Mr Albertrum Crowder	AC
Mr Ron Martin	RM
Ms Helen May	HM
Mr Johnny William	JW

Observers

Mr Mark Bell (C.o.C.T)	MB
------------------------	----

3 Apologies

Ms Tamar Grover	TG
Ms Christina Jikelo	CJ

4 Approval of minutes of previous

4.1 Meeting held on 15 February 2012

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with amendments.

5 Confidential Matters

5.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 2305, Old Sillery, Sillery Avenue, Constantia

The appointment and the views of different parties were discussed briefly.

6 Administration Matters

6.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

The CEO reported on recent cases heard by the Appeals Committee and the Tribunal.

6.2 Details in respect of decisions

The Committee resolved to endeavour to give more detail requirements in respect of more complex applications.

6.3 Digital circulation of documents

The CEO reported on the necessity for the digital circulation of documents to Committee members.

6.4 Request from Mr Len Raymond re Van der Bijlhuis, Stellenbosch

It was reported that Mr Raymond had written to the CEO and the BELCom chair requesting that responsibility for the approval of detailed specifications for maintenance and repair work to the Van der Bijlhuis be delegated to a special committee in order to avoid delays of working through BELCom. The request had been tabled at the previous Council meeting and the CEO would respond to Mr Raymond accordingly.

6.5 International Heritage Day

The CEO reported that the unveiling of the new HWC plaque on the 18th April had been arranged to coincide with International Heritage Day. This date also coincides with the next meeting of BELCom. In order for Committee members and staff to be able attend the ceremony, the meeting would start at 8am and there would be a break between 12.30pm and 2:30pm. The public would be informed of these changes.

7. Appointments

7.1 The Committee noted the appointment in respect of Old Sillery at 11H00

FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION

W 8 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

W.8.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, St Mary's on the Braak Anglican Church, Stellenbosch: MA HM/STELLENBOSCH/ST MARY'S ON THE BRAAK ANGLICAN CHURCH

Case No: 110727TG32

Revised Drawings prepared by HB Architects were be tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by SW, TT and RJ

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation on behalf of Ms Tamar Grover

DECISION

The Committee resolved to support the proposal and await comments from IAP's before making a final decision. If possible, the matter will be resolved by email.

TG

W.8.2 Proposed Residential Development, Farm 1087, Lanzerac, Stellenbosch: MA HM/STELLENBOSCH/LANZERAC/FARM 1087

A letter from the Stellenbosch Municipality dated 28 February 2012 together with their Senior Legal Advisor's opinion and an email from Ashley Lillie dated 29 February were tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by SW, ST and MA

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation on behalf of Ms Tamar Grover

In discussion it was noted that:

- The legal opinion from Stellenbosch Municipality's legal advisor does not deal with the National Heritage Resources Act and only deals with LUPO and a LUPO condition imposed when that approval was granted more than twenty years ago.
- It appears that Heritage Western Cape should require a proper section 38 application but must also give comment in terms of LUPO.
- Two Phases of the development relating to the hotel were approved by the old National Monuments Council twenty or so years ago.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that the CEO and Mr Lillie will meet to clarify the documentation and the issues discussed, the need for additional information and what application(s) are necessary.

TG

W.8.3 Proposed Maintenance and Painting Work, Herbert Baker House-Pick n Pay Head Office, 101 Rosmead Avenue, Kenilworth: NM HM/KENILWORTH/ "HERBERT BAKER HOUSE"

Case No: 120315JW19

Specifications for the exterior redecoration prepared for PicknPay by Tri-Star Painting & Renovations Cape, and plans by Bentel Associates for a drainage system were tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by TT

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation on behalf of Ms Tamar Grover

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building should be graded as Grade IIIB.
- The specifications should involve the input of a conservation architect specialist.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve in principle the proposed renovations and redecoration. However, the committee requires that a conservation architect be appointed to scrutinise and re-draft the specifications. The revised specifications may be circulated and approved by email.

TG

W.8.4 Proposed Wall of Remembrance and Boundary Enclosure, Dutch Reformed "Toringkerk", Erf 1586, Cnr Main and Van Der Lingen Streets, Paarl: NM HM/PAARL/ERF 1586

Case No: 111130JW31

Heritage Statement prepared by Ron Martin Heritage Consultancy were tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by SW, MA, TT and ST

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The property was a former National Monument.
- The building should be graded as Grade II.
- Local conservation bodies had commented as follows:
 - AKSO supports the proposed wall, but would prefer that separate applications be made for additional future panels;
 - The Drakenstein Heritage Foundation commented that the proposed wall is too high; and
 - Paarl 300 feels that the wall is too decorative and the future boundary enclosure is not appropriate.
- The Church has high social, historical and architectural significance.
- The design informants needs to take into account the landmark qualities of the building
- A more simplified design and reduced scale would be more appropriate.

DECISION

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposal. The committee was of the opinion that the proposal needed to be reconceptualised in terms of its design, scale and decorative elements, and its impact on the church and its landmark qualities. The committee recommends the input of a heritage architect to advise on an appropriate design response.

JW

W.8.5 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 22, 17 Kerk Straat, Elim: NM HM/ELIM/ERF 22

Case Number: 120224JW25

An application prepared by P.K. Siebrits, dated 21 February 2012, plans and photographs were tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by ST, TT and RJ

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The mature fig tree should be retained.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal in principle subject to the submission of revised drawing with the front part of the building with thatch roof being replicated in all senses and confirmation that the width of the proposal coincides with the width of the old building.

JW

W.8.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 315, 17 Nuwe Street, Elim: NM HM/ELIM/ERF 315

Case No: 120224JW24

Application prepared by P.K. Siebrits, dated 21 February 2012, plans and photograph were tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by SW, ST, TT and RJ

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal in principle. Revised proposals must be submitted indicating a double pitched roof of 25 degrees, without a parapet and with a bargeboard of no more than 150mm.

JW

W.8.7 Proposed Additions on Erf 315, 2 Jubilee Street, Elim: NM HM/ELIM/ERF 315

An application prepared by Collin Cloete, dated 29 February 2012 and plans prepared by C Cloete, dated 17 August 2011 were tabled.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The plans had not been cleared or stamped by the “opsieners’ raad” and that, strictly speaking, HWC could not approve plans not submitted with such a clearance.

DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the application.

RN

**W.8.8 Proposed Change of Planning Status, Erf 96660, SA Breweries, Main Road, Newlands: MA
HM/NEULANDS/ERF 96660**

A Section 27 Permit Application was tabled

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation on behalf Ms Tamar Grover

In discussion it was noted that:

- the City is currently processing a land use planning application i.t.o LUPO and the land use application can only be approved by City of Cape Town once HWC has issued a permit for this change in planning status

DECISION

The Committee agrees that there is no in principle problem with the application to change the planning status and the final approval should be granted at the same time as the earlier application, i.e. when the amended drawings are submitted.

TG

**W.8.9 Proposed Routine Road and Stone Retaining Wall Maintenance, Swartberg Pass, Main Road 369, from Cango Caves to Prince Albert: MA
HM/CANGO CAVES TO PRINCE ALBERT**

Case No: X120115RN09

Various documents in respect of the Swartberg Pass Rehabilitation Project, prepared by Prince Albert Cultural Foundation, dated 18 December 2011 were tabled.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved not to deal with the matter at the current meeting, and to invite all IAP's, the applicant and the heritage consultant to be present at the next meeting.

RN

**W.8.10 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Alphen Hotel, Alphen Drive, Erf 377, Constantia: MA
HM/CONSTANTIA/ERF 377**

Case No: 110713TG11

DECISION

The Committee resolved that an application and motivation for in respect of the works carried out must be submitted in time to be dealt with at the next meeting

TG

**W.8.11 Illegal Works, Erf 11306, Klein Konstantia, 4 Konstantia Street, Paarl
HM/PAARL/ERF 11306**

Mr Jonathan Windvogel reported that the case had been withdrawn by the Magistrate without HWC's knowledge.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that the CEO and staff should follow up the matter.

JW

W.8.12 Farm Watergat Homestead, Simondium: MA

Mr Calvin van Wijk made a verbal report.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to write to PWD informing them that unless an application is received for the April meeting, consideration will be given to issuing a compulsory repair order.

JW

**W.8.13 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 32100, Welgelegen, University of Cape Town, Chapel Road Extension, Rosebank: MA
HM/RONDERBOSCH/UCT/ERF 32100**

Case No: 120118TG15

Landscape Phase II (Supplementary Report) prepared by Thorold Architects, dated January 2012 was tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by MA, ST and SW

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation on behalf of Ms Tamar Grover

Mr Thorold and Mr Hart recused themselves.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals as detailed in Section 6 of the application form and including:

- The landscaping proposals primarily of the circular sunken garden area;
- The repair/ reconstruction of the stone walls and retaining walls and terraces to the west and north of the circular garden, and of the circular structure itself;
- The removal of acrylic paint, repair and lime-washing of all werf walls;
- Repairs to and possible underpinning of the house's east stoep and stairs;
- The repair/ partial replacement of the stoep's pergola timber beams;
- The removal of the later 20th C gumpole pergola west stoep, making good;
- The demolition of the 1930s garage, and making good; and
- The repair and reconstruction of the brick-lined watercourse to the south of the house.

TG

W 9 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

W.9.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 2268, 49 Long Street, Mossel Bay: NM HM/MOSSELBAY/ERF 2268

Case No: 120208JW01

Application prepared by Christine Wilke, dated 16 January 2012, plans and photograph were tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by SW, MA, TT and ST

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation

It was noted that the local conservation body supported the demolition.

It was also noted that the site is outside of the proposed conservation area.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition as the building does not have sufficient significance to warrant formal protection.

JW

W.9.2 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 4150, 248 Carisbrook Road, Bo-Kaap HM/BO KAAP/ERF 4150

Case No: 120208JW05

Revised Heritage Statement prepared by Aikman Associates, dated February 2012, application, plans and photographs were tabled

The documents had been delivered and read by ST, MA, SW and TT

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation

The Committee noted that:

- this was the first matter to be dealt with which is affected by the recent agreement with SAHRA in respect of Grade I sites; and, accordingly, that HWC would discuss any differences with SAHRA before making a decision.
- It was also noted that contrary to SAHRA's comments and recommendation, the property is not within the area historically recognised to be the Bokaap; and, further, it was recognised that the building, a late-nineteenth century and much altered and degraded house, was not consistent with the house-types recognised to be typical of the Bokaap.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site visit and that SAHRA would be invited to attend.

JW

W.10 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

W.10.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 2305, Old Sillery, Sillery Avenue, Constantia HM/CONSTANTIA/ERF 2305

Case No: 110801TG04

A report prepared by Prof Fabio Todeschini on behalf of the CPOA, dated 19th March 2012 was tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation on behalf of Ms Tamar Grover.

Prof Fabio Todeschini made a power-point presentation on behalf of the CPOA. Mr Ashley Lillie was present and participated in the discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The unauthorised works had resulted in considerable damage to significance.
- The historical fabric of the building and its associated significance had been lost and was irretrievable.
- The form and internal configuration of the building could be retrieved.
- The role of the building as an element within a significant landscape needed to be considered.
- A recommendation by the Committee that HWC lay charges would require the majority of the members to have been on site.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to meet on site with IAP's and the applicant on 30th March 2012 at 14H00.

TG

W.10.2 Proposed Partial Demolition of the Groote Schuur Hospital Engineering Workshop, Erf 27863, Observatory HM/OBSEVATORY/ERF 27863

Case No: 111007TG09

A preliminary Heritage Statement prepared by Claire Abrahamse, dated March 2012 was tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by SW, MA and TT

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation on behalf of Ms Tamar Grover

COMMENT

The Committee supported the suggested Grade III significance of the building and accepted that the re-use of the building as forensic laboratory would require partial demolition. However, the extent of demolition can only be negotiated once a concrete proposal has been formulated and assessed as part of a Section 38 process.

TG

**W.10.3 Proposed Restoration, Erf 9124, Farm Hexburg, Wellington: MA
HM/WELLINGTON/FARM HEBURG/ERF 9124**

Case No: 110516JW04

Proposed new plans prepared by George Viljoen Architects were tabled

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation

The architect, George Viljoen, and the heritage architect, Graham Jacobs were present and participated in the discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal subject to removal of the Velux windows on the south side. The committee would have no objection to use of half glazed loft doors on the end gables and Velux windows or dormers on the inner facing roofs.

JW

**W.10.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions , 140-142 Buitengracht, Erven 2802, 2902, 2799, 2971 and 2798, Cape Town: MA
HM/CAPE TOWN/ERVEN 2802/2902/2799/2971/2798**

New plans prepared by Inhouse Brand Architects, dated 1 August 2011 and comments from the Auwal Masjied, dated 2 March 2012 were tabled.

Comments from the CIA Heritage Committee were circulated at the meeting. The documents had been delivered to and read by ST, TT and SW

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

It was noted that the Imam had not made any comments that were heritage-related.

The IAPs that had commented should be informed of their right of appeal by the case officer.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the revised drawings subject to the addition being set back by 2m from the street boundary; and the sign being removed from the application. Final drawings are to be circulated and approved via email.

JW

**W.10.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 4064, 226 and 228, Cnr Buiten and Long Streets, Cape Town: Ma
HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 4064, 226 AND 228**

Plans prepared by IG Architects were tabled.

Mr Calvin van Wijk made a verbal report on behalf of Ms Tamar Grover.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application subject to the setting back by 1m of the roof light.

TG

W.11 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATION

W.11.1None

W. 12 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

W. 12.1None

W. 13 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

W.13.1None

W.14 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

W.14.1None

W.15 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

W.15.1None

W.16 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

W.16.1None

W.17 Other Matters

W.17.1None

SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION

E 8 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

E 8.1 Alterations to Several Buildings and the Construction of a Proposed Multi-Purpose Space, Somerset House Preparatory School, Erven 7699 (consolidated from Erven 7629 and 2520) with Erf 7698, Somerset West. HM/SOMERSET WEST/ERF 7698/ERVEN 7699/CONSOLIDATED ERVEN 7629 AND 2520

Case No: 110824SD22

A Heritage Impact Assessment prepared by Arcon Architects, dated March 2012 was tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by ST, RG and MA.

Ms Winter recused herself

Mr Shaun Dyers made a power-point presentation.

Marise Potgieter from Urban Concepts and Graham Jacobs were present and participated in the discussion.

It was noted that the Helderberg Renaissance Trust had made cogent and well-framed comments.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal in respect of the Grade 5 Classrooms, the Guild hall, the New Classrooms, the Ould Hall and the Relly Block. The Committee resolved that the Multi - Functional Space is appropriate in principle but that its character, in particular its roof shape, should be reconsidered so as to fit more comfortably into the family of buildings on the campus.

SD

E 8.2 Erf 973, Moravian Church, Werf, Akkerhuisie, Mamre HM/MAMRE/ERF 973

Case No: 110601SD03

Mr Shaun Dyers reported back on the matter.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that if the verdict in this case is guilty, it be recommended to the court that in terms of S.51 (8) the reconstruction of the building takes place within a specified period.

SD

E 9 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

E.9.1 None

E 10 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

E 10.1 Proposed Alterations, Elwyngor, No 8 Silwood Road, Erf 45281, Rondebosch. HM/RONDEBOSCH/ERF 45281

Case No: 120205ZS14

A Heritage Statement and plans prepared by Karin Strom, dated 8 February 2012 were tabled

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee resolved to conduct a site visit on the 30th March 2012 at 13H00. The case officer is to ensure access.

ZS

E 10.2 Proposed Development of House Charl Cilliers, Erf 2255 and 2256, 7 Verreweide Street, Stellenbosch. HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 2255/2256

Case No: 120314NN14

Plans prepared by van Tonder Architects, dated February 2012 were tabled

Ms Ntombi Njobe made a power-point presentation

It was noted that:

- The building appears to be a Grade IIIB in terms of its architectural quality and characteristics, and garden setting. Significance is difficult to assess adequately based on the information provided.
- The proposals dominate and damage the significance of the building and site.
- Local conservation bodies and the Stellenbosch Heritage Advisory Committee are opposed to the application.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to refuse the application. If a further application is made it should be supported by the input of a heritage practitioner including an assessment of significance and guidance on an appropriate design response.

NN

E.11 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATION

E.11.1None

E. 12 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

E. 12.1None

E. 13 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

E.13.1None

E.14 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

E.14.1None

E.15 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

E.15.1None

E.16 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

E.16.1None

E.17 Other Matters

E.17.1None

18. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions

19. CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned

17H20

20 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

18 April 2012

CHAIRPERSON _____

DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

DATE _____

Approved