

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING
OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Wednesday, 22 May 2013, 1st Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09H00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The meeting was officially opened at 09H13 by the chairperson, Ms Sarah Winter, and she welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms Sarah Winter	SW
Ms Maureen Wolters	MW
Mr Roger Joshua	RJ
Mr Trevor Thorold	TT
Ms Melanie Attwell	MA
Mr Patrick Fefeza	PF
Dr Stephen Townsend	ST

Members of Staff

Mr Calvin van Wijk	CvW
Ms Tamar Shem-Tov	TS
Ms Christina Jikelo	JC
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka	ZS
Mr Jonathan Windvogel	JW
Ms Ntombekhaya Nkoane	NN
Mr Shaun Dyers	SD
Mr Troy Smuts	TS
Mr Olwethu Dlova (Sec)	OD
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)	LM

Visitors

Mr Graham Jacobs	GJ	Mr M Scurr	MS
Mr P Truscott	PT	Mr J Bernicht	JB
Mr J Noero	JV	Mr S De Villiers	SdV
Mr Frawks			

Observers

None

3. Apologies

Mr Andrew Hall AH

4. Approval of minutes of previous meeting held 24 April 2013

4.1 The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with minor amendments.

5. Disclosure of Interest

- MA: W.10.5
- TT: W.10.4 & W.10.6
- SW: E.10.1

6. Approval of Agenda

The Committee approved the agenda dated 22 May 2013 with a few additional amendments.

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

Mr van Wijk gave a report back on the Tribunal matters.

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges

There were no matters to report back.

8.3 Checklist for Application- Related Decision- Making

Mr van Wijk will follow up the finalisation of the form with the CEO.

AH

8.4 Overstrand Municipality Issues of Jurisdiction

SD gave a report back on HWC's meeting with the Municipal Manager and Mr John Simson to clarify issues of jurisdiction especially with respect to Section 34 and Section 31.

SD/AH

8.5 Elim Workshop 1 June 2013

The Committee discussed the purpose and focus of the workshop and made some suggestions which CJ will take up with the CEO. It was requested that the agenda be re-circulated including the suggested structure of the workshop.

Agreement on the agenda must be determined with in consultation with the church, Opsienersraad and Friends of Elim and opportunity for all organisations to make representation must be included on the agenda.

The Committee requested that a large aerial (AO) of Elim be made available at the workshop. A map showing the location of the most recent applications should also be emailed to Committee members so that they can inspect these sites prior to the meeting. These applications should not be the focus of the workshop but can perhaps be discussed towards the end of the meeting.

CJ

8.6 Draft Urban Design Policy

The Committee is of the opinion that the policies are too vague to be meaningful from an urban design and heritage perspective and do not give sufficient direction in terms of which laws development applications will be effected. The Committee requested that the document be tabled at the next Council meeting and that the Council be requested to endorse BELCom's position.

TG

8.7 Decisions of HWC meetings

Ms Wolters informed the Committee that the Stanford Heritage Trust had written to HWC expressing concern that it was not informed of decisions by HWC on applications within Stanford and that decisions were not being uploaded onto the website to give sufficient opportunity to appeal any such decision.

Ms Wolter was advised to table the letter from the Stanford Heritage Trust at the next Council meeting.

8.8 East Fort, Hout Bay (PHS)

In discussion it was noted that the deadline for the stabilisation of the ruins is the end of May. The Committee is requested that the CEO interact with the SANParks and get feedback by the next meeting.

9. Appointments

9.1 The Committee noted the appointment for item W.10.5 set for 11H00.

FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION

W.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

W.10.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 237, 10 Boom Street, Elim: NM HM/ELIM/ERF 237/10 BOOM STREET

Case No: 130507JW08E

An application prepared by J Adonis, undated, photographs and plans were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The absence of a location map made difficult to assess the position of the dwelling and related visual impacts.
- The committee expressed concern with the scale of the proposals to a building and context that appears to be highly intact

DECISION

The Committee resolved not to approve the current proposal.

JW

W.10.2 Proposed Restoration, Erf 237, Kerk Street, Elim: NM HM/ELIM/ERF 237/KERK STREET

Case No: 130507JW07E

An application prepared by G Cunningham, undated, photographs and plans were tabled

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to defer the matter for a site visit on 1 June 2013.

JW

**W.10.3 Proposed Additions to Existing House, Erf 237, Kerk Street, Elim: NM
HM/ELIM/ERF 237/KERK STREET**

An application prepared by G Cunningham, dated 5 May 2013, photographs and plans were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

COMMENT

The Committee supports the proposal but would prefer to clarify the detailing on site i.e. at the workshop on 1 June 2013.

JW

**W.10.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 3507, Bellevue Manor, St John's
Estate, 9 Higgs Crescent, Higgovale: NM
HM/HIGGOVALE/ERF 3507**

Case No: 130508JW16M

An application prepared by Neil Franks, dated 8 May 2013, photographs and plans prepared by Neil Marie Architects were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr Thorold recused himself.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be Grade II.

- The Committee resolved to approve the application subject to Mr Thorold's involvement to advise on detailing and supervise the interventions to the historic core.

JW

**W.10.5 Proposed Development on Farm 1223, West Coast Fossil Park, Saldanha Bay:
MA
HM/SALDANHA BAY/FARM 1223/FOSSIL PARK**

Ms Attwell recused herself.

Mr Troy Smuts made a power-point presentation.

Mr Joe Noero presented the proposals.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal subject to:

- Any changes to the above mentioned Spatial Development Plan, Architectural Sketch Plans and Service Plans deemed by HWC to be substantial changes, will

require the approval of HWC, for which a further submission to HWC will be required

- Detailed building plans be submitted to HWC for approval once these have been finalized;
- A Heritage Conservation Management Plan be submitted for the Fossil Dig Site and Quarry E once detailed planning and implementation is underway for this phase; and
- That a suitably qualified palaeontological and/ or archaeological specialist conduct a watching brief during all site excavation and preparation within the Precinct.

TS

**W.10.6 Proposed Heat Pumps, Erf 2142, Hof Street, Leeuwenhof, Cape Town: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN/LEEUVENHOF/ERF 2142**

Case No: 130522TG25E

Mr Thorold presented the proposals.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals.

TG

**W.11 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL
DEMOLITION**

**W.11.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 64505, Terraced houses, 12-18 Bell Road,
Claremont: NM
HM/CLAREMONT/ERF 64505**

Case No: 130508JW11E

An application prepared by Ron Martin, dated 8 May 2013 and Heritage Statement prepared by Ron Martin undated were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

The Committee decided it must await comments from the registered I & AP's as they have been approached but have not had the required 30 days to comment.

JW

**W.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL
DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**W.12.1 Proposal for Partial Internal Demolition and Addition of a New First Floor on Erf
455, 84 Waterkant Street, De Waterkant, Cape Town: MA
HM/CAPE TOWN/DE WATERKANT/ERF 455**

Case No: 130305TG07E

A revised Proposal, dated 16 May 2013 (dwgs A, B, C) was tabled.

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The City of Cape Town prefers option A or C, i.e. that both options are set back.
- However, the set back and height of these alternatives are such as to have a severe negative impact on the environs;
- The Committee prefers option B as this is consistent with the tradition of adding a second storey to buildings within this context.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve option B as indicated in the sketch proposal submitted. Final drawings are to be submitted and stamped by the case officer.

TG

**W.12.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 1745, Dirkie Uys Street, Franschhoek:
MA
HM/FRANSCHHOEK/ERF 1745**

Case No: 130301TG04E

Comments of the Franschhoek Valley Conservation Trust and plans prepared by Emerging Architects were tabled.

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The FVCT is strongly opposed to the proposals.

DECISION

The Committee confirmed the grading of the building to be Grade IIIB

The Committee resolved to support the principle of extending the building but required certain amendments to reduce the impact of the proposals.

TG

**W.12.3 Proposed Alterations and Extensions on Saggy Stone Homestead, Saggy Stone Farm, Ptn Farm Vinke Rivier No.8, Robertson: NM
HM/ROBERTSON/SAGGY STONE FARM/PTN FARM VINKE RIVIER NO. 8**

Case No: 130503TG07E

A Heritage Impact Assessment and Motivation prepared by ARCON Architects & Heritage Consultants, dated April 2013 was tabled.

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation.

Mr Graham Jacobs was present and took part in the discussion.

In the discussions it was noted that:

- The Committee supported the recommendations of the heritage report prepared by ARCON.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be Grade IIIA

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

TG

**W.12.4 Proposed Partial Demolition and Landscaping, Erven 2304 & 2305, The Old Sillery Farm, End of Sillery Avenue, Constantia: MA
HM/CONSTANTIA/OLD SILLERY FARM/ERVEN 2304 & 2305**

Case No: 130411TG16M

An application prepared by Carrie Latimer, dated 7 April 2013 and Landscape Plans were tabled.

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation

COMMENT

The committee endorses the proposed removal of the dividing wall and recommends that the landscaping proposal within the central werf area be simplified.

TG

**W.12.5 Proposed Restoration and New Building, Erf 174552, 53 Napier Street, Waterkant, Cape Town: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN/WATERKANT/ERF 174552**

Case No: 130508TG12E

An application prepared by Martin Kruger, dated 7 May 2013 and plans was tabled.

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building was effectively a new building as it contains only one section of ancient walling;
- The site is within a declared conservation area and the City officials are able to regulate the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

TG

W.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

W.13.1 None

W. 14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

W.14.1 None

W.15. PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

W.15.1 None

W.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

W.16.1 None

W.17. PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

W.17.1 None

W.18. REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

W.18.1 None

W.19. Other Matters

W.19.1 None

SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION

E.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

E.10.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 237, 10 Boom Street, Elim: MA HM/ELIM/ERF 237

Case No: 130326ZS37E

The matter was deferred to the next meeting.

ZS

E.11. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

E.11.1 Proposed Total Demolition of an Existing house at No. 14 College Road, Rondebosch, Erf 47007: NM HM/RONDEBOSCH/ERF 47007

Case No: 130509NN12E

An application for permit, motivation and plans prepared by WP Bosch and Associates, undated were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

Based on the evidence the Committee decided the grading of the building to be Grade IIIB

The Committee refused the application and advises that any future application be accompanied by a heritage statement by an accredited heritage practitioner detailing the significance and the building and its various components and advising on the appropriate nature and extent of any proposed interventions.

NN

**E.11.2 Proposed Total Demolition at No. 122 Somerset Road, Green Point, Erf 999
Three Anchor Bay: NM
HM/GREENPOINT/ERF 999**

Case No: 130405ZS09M

A Building Assessment Report prepared by Rennie Scurr Architects, dated April 2013 was tabled

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site visit (MA, SW, and ST) and the matter will be resolved via email.

ZS

**E.11.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 173823, Crn Wale & Rose Streets, Bo-Kaap: NM
HM/BO-KAAP/ERF 173823**

An application for a permit was tabled

Mr Calvin van Wijk made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- That the committee concurs with SAHRA and is distressed that the work commenced prior to approval.
- The Committee has no objection to the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

CvW

**E.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL
DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**E.12.1 Proposed Adjustments to Dairy Parlour (Reception Area and Lounge) Farm 744
Somerset West, Vergelegen-Harmonie Werf Redevelopment: NM
HM/SOMERSET WEST/FARM 744**

Case No: 130507NN09E

A Site Roof plan, Dairy Parlour Plan, Sections and Elevations, prepared by MLH Architects and planners was tabled; the architects and heritage practitioners were present and took part in the discussion

Ms Sarah winter recused herself and Dr Townsend took the chair.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The silo makes a significant contribution to the character of the site and its complex of agricultural buildings
- Its removal would be a significant loss, limiting the reading of the complex as a whole.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to refuse the demolition of the Square Silo attached to the Dairy Parlour building. The Committee resolved to approve the luggage extensions at the rear Dairy Parlour building.

NN

E.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

E.13.1 None

E.14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

E.14.1 None

E.15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

E.15.1 None

E.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

E.16.1 None

E.17 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

E.17.1 None

E.18 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

E.18.1 None

E.19 Other Matters

E.19.1 None

20. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

21. CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at

16H00

22 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

26 June 2013

CHAIRPERSON _____

DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

DATE _____