

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,  
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)  
Held on Tuesday, 23 November 2016 at the 1<sup>st</sup> Floor Boardroom, at the Offices  
of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,  
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09:00**

---

**1. Opening and Welcome**

The Chairperson, Ms Sarah Winter, officially opened the meeting at 09H00 and welcomed everyone present.

**2. Attendance**

**Members**

Ms Sarah Winter	SW
Mr Mike Scurr	MS
Mr Rowen Ruiters	RR
Mr Graham Jacobs	GJ
Mr Stuart Hermansen	SH
Ms Belinda Mutti	BM

**Members of Staff**

Ms Colette Scheermeyer	CS
Ms Penelope Meyer	PM
Ms Katherine Robinson	KR
Mr Andrew September	AS
Ms Heidi Boise	HB
Ms Waseefa Dhansay	WD
Mr Olwethu Dlova (Sec)	OD

**Visitors**

Mr Johan Cornelius	JC	Mr Ashley Lillie	AL
Mr Chris Snelling	CSn	Mr Henry Aikman	HA
Mr Frik Vermeulen	FV	Ms Corlie Smart	CSm
Mr David Townsend	DT	Mr Alex Mueller	AM
Mr Niall Smith	NS	Mr Antony Arvan	AA
Mr Mike Hackner	MH	Mr C Wood	CW
Mr Shlom Azor	SA	Ms Claire Abrahamse	CA
Mr E. Badenhorst	EB	Mr Philip Bromley	PB
Ms Carol Podd	CP	Mr Francois Sahd	FS
Mr Johann Papendorf	JP	Ms Bridget O'Donoghue	BO'D
Ms Jacki McInnes	JM		

**Observers**

Ms Elize Joubert	EJ	Ms Janine De Waal	JDW
Ms Karin Dugmore Strom	KDS		

**3. Apologies**

Mr Peter Buttgens	PB
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka	ZS
Mr Jonathan Windvogel	JW

**4. Approval of Agenda**

**4.1 Dated 23 November 2016**

The Committee approved the agenda dated 23 November 2016 with some amendments.

**5 Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting**

**5.1 26 October and 31 October 2016**

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with minor amendments.

## **6. Disclosure of Interest**

- SH: item 13.5 and 20.3

## **7. Confidential Matters**

7.1 None

## **8. Administrative Matters**

### **8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and tribunal Committees**

PM reported back on the outcomes of the following appeals matters:

- Proposed Remedial Work, Erf 11306, Klein Constantia Street, Paarl: Section 27
- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 26939, 6 Roman Road, Observatory: Section 34
- Proposed Redevelopment of Erf 19506, Paardevlei, Somerset West: Section 38 (4)
- Proposed Additions to Existing Structure, Restoration & Alteration to Erf 785, 19 Hasting Street, Tamboerskloof: Section 34
- Proposed Redevelopment of the Warwick, Erven 333, 334 and 335, Main Road, Green Point: Section 38 (4)
- Proposed Total Demolition, Erven 177651 (5044, 5046, 5047, 5048, 5050, 5052 & 5053), 44, 46 & 48 Commercial Street, Cape Town CBD: Section: Section 38(4)
- Proposed Total Demolition - Erf 1186 - 19 A Cumming Street – Wellington: Section 34
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 48363, 49 Dean Street, Newlands: Section 34

### **8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges**

The following stop works orders and charges were noted:

- Unauthorised Work, Alteration & Additions to Erf 26939, 6 Roman Road, Observatory
- Unauthorised Work, Alteration & Additions To Erf 13536, "Sillery Estate", Sillery Lane, Constantia

### **8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition**

There was no further report back.

### **8.4 Submissions of Revised Plans**

This matter will be tabled before the new BELCom.

### **8.5 Conduct of Conservation Bodies**

It was noted that the legal advisor has drafted a letter to all conservation bodies and local authorities outlining HWC's requirements for consultation..

## 9. Standing Item

### 9.1 Site Inspection

The following site inspections undertaken by Committee members were noted:

- Proposed Total Demolition, Erven 369, 399 and 400 at 1 Gorleston Road, Sea Point

The following site inspections undertaken by staff were noted:

- Drostdy Museum, Swellendam
- Spice Route, Paarl
- Erf 26939, 6 Roman Road, Observatory
- Erf 13536, "Sillery Estate", Sillery Lane, Constantia

## 10. Appointments

- 10.1 The Committee noted the appointment for item 20.3 set for 10H00 and item 11.2 set for 12H00.

## MATTERS DISCUSSED

### 11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

#### 11.1 Drostdy Museum: MA HM/ OVERBERG/ SWELLENDAM/ DROSTDY MUSEUM PHS

**Case No:** 16042002WD0420M

A site inspection report dated November 2016 was tabled.

Ms Waseefa Dhansay made a power-point presentation.

It was noted that there had been noncompliance with the permit issued on the 6 May 2016 and that further unauthorised work had been undertaken.

The Committee recommended that HWC proceed with legal action.

**WD**

#### 11.2 Buffeljagsrivier Bridge, Sugar Bridge, Swellendam: NM HM/ OVERBERG/ SWELLENDAM/ BUFFELJAGSRIVIER BRIDGE – SUGAR BRIDGE

A site inspection report prepared by Ms Waseefa Dhansay was tabled.

Ms Waseefa Dhansay made a power-point presentation.

Mr Philip Bromley and Ms Carol Podd were present and took part in the discussion.

#### **COMMENT**

It was noted that the structure has heritage significance. However, further research is required to establish the nature and degree of heritage significance as well as alternative approaches to conservation and sustainability. This need to be proceeded by discussions with the property owner and therefore establishing ownership is an important priority.

**WD**

**11.3 Proposed Additions, Alterations to Farm Shed and New Structures on Hazendal, Farm Haasendal 222, Stellenbosch: MA HM/STELLENBOSCH/FARM HAASENDAL 222**

**Case No:** 16010502AS1005E/ 16072504AS0810E

A motivation letter against the revocation of a previous permit and for the lifting of stop works order was tabled.

Mr Andrew September made a power-point presentation.

Mr Ashley Lillie, Mr Antony Arvan and Mr Mike Hackner were present and took part in the discussion.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved that a site inspection be undertaken by the new BELCom. The Committee requires that the exposed wall and gable caps be covered with DPM and secured in place.

**AS**

**12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION**

**12.1 Unauthorised Work, Alteration & Additions to Erf 26939, 6 Roman Road, Observatory: MA HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/OBSERVATORY/ERF 26939**

**Case No:** 15080413HB1022E

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

Mr Johan Cornelius was present and took part in the discussion.

**DECISION**

The Committee noted that unauthorised work had been undertaken and that the scale and lack of street setback of the increased mass of the development had a negative impact on the streetscape.

The Committee recommended the laying of charges.

It was noted that unauthorised work had also been undertaken to 4 Roman Road. It was recommended that this matter be tabled at the next BELCom meeting.

**HB**

**12.2 Proposed Total Demolition, Erven 369, 399 and 400 - 1 Gorleston Road, Sea Point: NM  
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ SEA POINT / ERVEN 396, 399 AND 400**

**Case No:** 6092212WD1004E

MS, GJ and SW reported back on their site visit.

Mr Chris Snelling was present and took part in the discussion.

**DECISION**

The Committee is of the opinion that the building and its context are not worthy of formal protection.

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition.

**WS**

**13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**13.1 Proposed Additions to the Back, New Front Boundary Wall and Car Port Erf 91470, 29 Sandhurst Road, Wynberg: MA  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/WYNBERG/ ERF 91470**

**Case No:** 16081507KR0818M

Revised proposals were tabled.

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals as having addressed previous concerns.

**KR**

**13.2 Proposed Replacement of Timber and Steel Windows with Aluminium, Erf 3630, Cape Town Medi-Clinic, 21 Hof Street, Oranjezicht: MA  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ORANJEZI CHT/ERF 3630**

**Case No:** 16072509KR0907E

Revised proposals were tabled.

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

Mr Ashley Lillie and Mr Johan Cornelius were present and took part in the discussion.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals subject to the section drawings being endorsed to reflect stick-on slim line mullions and being stamped by the case officer.

**KR**

**13.3 Unauthorised Work, Alteration & Additions to Erf 13536, "Sillery Estate",  
Sillery Lane, Constantia: MA  
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/CONSTANT IA/ERF 13536**

**Case No:** 15111907HB1202E

A letter from Combo Trade Twenty CC was tabled.

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

Mr E. Badenhorst was present and took part in the discussion.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved not to accept the reasons for non-compliance and therefore to revoke the permit.

Despite the opinion of the engineer that the structure was unstable, the Committee was of the opinion that temporary measures to stabilise the structure should have been implemented and that HWC should have been approached to consider an emergency permit for total demolition or alternative remedial measures.

The Committee is of the opinion that heritage significance has been irretrievably lost and recommends that HWC lay charges.

**HB**

**13.4 Proposed Alterations to "Agricultural Shed" on Farm D'Olyfboom, Farm  
29112, Napier Street, Paarl: MA  
HM/PAARL/FARM 29112**

**Case No:** 16090602AS0907E

The matter was removed from the agenda.

**AS**

**13.5 Proposed Addition of 3 to 4 Storeys to the top of the Old Post Office Building  
Erf 2051, Old Post Office, Corner of Bird and Plein Street, Stellenbosch: MA  
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSC H/EEF 1051**

**Case No:** 16050912KR0511M

Revised proposals were tabled.

SH recused himself and joined the applicant.

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

Mr Hermansen, Mr Francois Sahd and Mr Johann Papendorf were present and took part in the discussion.

**DECISION**

The Committee supports the revised proposals in principle subject to amendments to address three concerns:

- The sloping roof of the new addition.

- The treatment of the projecting slab above the Post Office parapet must ensure that the parapet is the dominant element (consideration should be given to the setting back of the slab from the parapet as well as reducing the thickness of the slab).
- The colour of the setback wall on Plein Street.

The Committee requires the submission of revised proposals and recommends that these be accompanied by street level views.

**KR**

**13.6 Proposed Additions of a Second Storey and to the Front Boundary Erf 1441, 10 Leeuwenhof Road, Oranjezicht: MA  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ORANJEZI CHT/ERF 1441**

**Case No:** 16080801KR0912E

A heritage report prepared by Ms Bridget O'Donoghue was tabled.

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

Ms Bridget O'Donoghue and Ms Jacki McInnes were present.

**DECISION**

The Committee is of the opinion that the building has insufficient heritage significance to warrant formal protection. The Committee resolved to approve the proposals.

**KR**

**14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS**

14.1 None

**15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT**

15.1 None

**16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL**

16.1 None

**17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS**

17.1 None

**18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS**

18.1 None

**19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE**

19.1 None

## 20 OTHER MATTERS

### 20.1 **Illegal Work, Erf 9701, Corner Burg and Hout Street Cape Town: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CAPE TOWN CBD/ ERF 9701**

A Heritage Statement prepared by Mr Chris Snelling was tabled.

Ms Waseefa Dhansay made a power-point presentation.

Mr Chris Snelling was present and took part in the discussion.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee is not able to condone unauthorised work. However, the unauthorised work has not damaged heritage significance. It was also noted that the surviving cast iron columns and pressed metal ceiling are being retained as significant elements.

WD

### 20.2 **Erf 173 - 49 Cabriere Street, Franschoek - Illegal Work – Admin: MA CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ FRANSCHOEK/ ERF 173**

**Case No:** 15121502JW1218E

Documents prepared by Henry Aikman, Prof Fabio Todeschini and Frik Vermeulen were tabled

Ms Waseefa Dhansay made a power-point presentation.

Mr Frik Vremeulen and Mr Henry Aikman were present and took part in the discussion.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee was of the opinion that the reasons for non-compliance have not been adequately addressed and resolved that the permit be revoked. The Committee was of the opinion that the unauthorised work has negatively impacted heritage significance in terms of the scale and massing of the additions and recommended that HWC lay charges.

JW

### 20.3 **Deviation from Approved Plans - Erf1847: Hout Bay Main Road, Constantia: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ COSTANTIA/ ERF 1847**

**Case No:** 15111707WD1118M

Response to HWC letter dated 19 Oct 2016 was tabled.

SH recused himself and left the room.

Mr David Townsend, Mr Alex Mueller, Mr Niall Smith, Ms Corlie Smart and Mr Ashley Lillie were present.

Ms Waseefa Dhansay made a power-point presentation.



**DECISION**

The Committee accepted the motivation outlined in the letter from Mr Hermansen and resolved that the permit not be revoked.

The Committee has no objection to the roof lights and the canopy as these interventions have not impacted heritage significance.

**WD**

**21. NON COMPLIANCE**

**21.1** None

**22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS**

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

**23. CLOSURE**

The meeting adjourned at: **13H15**

**24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 14 December 2016**

**CHAIRPERSON** \_\_\_\_\_ **DATE:**

**SECRETARY** \_\_\_\_\_ **DATE:**