

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING
OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Wednesday, 23 October 2013, 1st Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09H00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The meeting was officially opened at 09:00 by the acting chairperson, Dr Stephen Townsend, and he welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms Sarah Winter	SW
Dr Stephen Townsend	ST
Mr Roger Joshua	RJ
Mr Trevor Thorold	TT
Mr Tim Hart	TH
Mr Patrick Fefeza	PF

Members of Staff

Ms Christina Jikelo	CJ
Mr Troy Smuts	TS
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)	LM
Mr Ronny Nyuka	RN
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka	ZS
Mr Jonathan Windvogel	JW
Ms Ntombekhaya Nkoane	NN
Mr Olwethu-Oz-Dlova	OD
Ms Tamar Shem-Tov	TST

Ms Sarah Winter arrived at 9:15h

Visitors

Ms Ursula Rigby	UR	Ms Lindy Briginshan	LB
Ms Bridget O'Donoghue	BO'D	Ms N Mc Aughey	NMcA
Mr Ashley Lillie	AL	Ms Leighan Mossop	LM
Mr Calvin Mojapelo	CM		

Observers

Ms Jacqui Marais (City of Cape Town)

3. Apologies

Ms Melanie Attwell	MA
Ms Maureen Wolters	MW
Mr Andrew Hall	AH

4. Approval of minutes of previous meeting held 25 September 2013

4.1 The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with no amendments.

5. Disclosure of Interest

5.1 None

6. Approval of Agenda

The Committee approved the agenda dated 23 October 2013 with additional items.

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

ST gave a report back on the UCT S.38 (6) review matter.
CJ reported that there had been complaints because the High Clere matter was still unresolved by the MEC's tribunal; but it had been shown that HWC's processing had been appropriately prompt.

ZS

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges

There were no matters to report.

ZS

8.3 Checklist for Applications

ZS reported that the checklist had been finalised and will be circulated for the discussion at the next meeting.

ZS

8.4 East Fort, Hout Bay (PHS)

Mr Calvin Mojapelo and Ms Leighan Mossop from SANParks were present and took part in discussion.

The Committee supported the proposed plan for the stabilisation of the structures in particular the employment of the appropriately skilled and heritage expert in the next financial year. Preference is given to the use of herbicides rather than pulling out vegetation as this could damage historical fabric.

TS

8.5 Report back on Elim Workshop

CJ to circulate the report to committee members, Friends of Elim, the Moravian Church, the Opsieners Raad and the municipality

CJ

8.6 Application for Departures on Erf 1324, Dorp Street, Stellenbosch: MA HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 1324

The Committee requested that the CEO follow this up with Mr De La Bat, Piet Claassen and interested and affected parties.

ZS/CEO

8.7 Erf 90780 and 91062, Oak Cottage, Durban Road, Wynberg (PHS)

Ms Tamar Shem-Tov made a power-point presentation

The Committee finds the deviation from approved envelop entirely unacceptable as are the reasons given by the owner, i.e. the reasons do not relate to the changes in the approved envelope.

The Committee recommends that HWC proceed with prosecution.

ZS

9. Appointments

9.1 The Committee noted the appointment of item 8.4 set for 10H30

FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION

W.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

W.10.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 518, Dutch Reformed Church, 7 Church Street, Malmesbury: NM HM/MALMESBURY/ERF 518

Case No: 131003RN02E

A Heritage Statement prepared by Ron Martin Consultancy was tabled,

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

It was noted that the heritage statement submitted was unnecessary; and that the applicant would have been better advised to get appropriate architectural advice instead.

DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the proposal in principle subject to the submission of further detailing and requires that this involve the input and advice of a conservation architect.

RN

W.11 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

W.11.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 15449, 84-90 Foundry Road, Salt River: NM HM/SALT RIVER/ERF 15449

Case No: 130912JW12E

An application for a permit, arial photographs and photographs were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr Ashley Lillie was present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The colonnades, with others of the same type, were the primary reason for the identification of the area as a HPOZ.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the front façade and colonnade to be IIIA in terms of its significant contribution to the streetscape.

The Committee does not approve the demolition of the façade and colonnade but in principle supports the demolition of the building behind the façade. It requires the submission of an appropriately experienced (in these matters) professional engineer's report to establish the extent to which the remaining structure can be repaired and re-used.

JW

**W.11.2 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 109, 6 St Patricks Road, Fresnaye: NM
HM/FRESNAYE/ERF 109**

Case No: 130912JW11E

An application for a permit prepared by Mark Zuckerman, dated 11 September 2013, plans and photographs were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr Ashley Lillie was present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be IIIC and that its surrounding context has been considerably altered and cannot be formally protected.

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition.

JW

**W.11.3 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 24292, 24 Louws Avenue, Southern Paarl:
NM
HM/SOUTHERN PAARL/ERF 24292**

Case No: 131017RN19M

An application for a permit prepared by Johan Malherbe, dated 16 October 2013, a Heritage Statement prepared by Malherbe Rust, dated 13 September 2013 and comments from Paarl 300 and DHF were tabled

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation,

In discussion it was noted that:

- The DHF does not support the demolition.
- Paarl 300 recommends that a portion of the building be retained.
- There is a need to have a greater understanding of the context.
- The building is clearly a rather better example of its type than is implied.
- The sacrifice of this building (to provide for parking) to enable the hypothetical upgrading/conservation of the warehouse building is an interesting proposition.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be IIIB.

The Committee resolved to undertake a site visit and that this should be undertaken by the new committee.

RN

**W.11.4 Proposed Total Demolition on De Novo, Kraaifontein, Portion 10 Rem Extent of Farm 727, Joostenbergvlakte: MA
HM/KRAAIFONTEIN/FARM 727**

Case No: 130918TG24M

Letter of objection from De Novo Loods Komitee dated 21 October 2013 was tabled.

Ms Tamar Shem-Tov made a power-point presentation.

Mr Albert Hensen and Mr Henry Gouws represent De Novo Komitee and Mr Naseegh Long from DTPW were present and took part in the discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to request the submission of a Heritage Statement compiled by a suitably qualified and experienced heritage practitioner and that this include an assessment of the significance of the site and its various structures and its physical condition as well as consultation with interested and affected parties.

The Committee recommends the involvement of an appropriate social or oral historian.

ZS

**W.11.5 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 353 & 354, 6 and 6A Avenue Le Sueur, Fresnaye: NM
HM/FRESNAYE/ERF 353 & 354**

Case No: 130816TG18E

An application for a permit prepared by Juan Bernichi, dated 17 July 2013, photographs and plans were tabled.

Ms Tamar Shem-Tov made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be IIC but not worthy of formal protection.

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition.

TS-T

W.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

**W.12.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 176367 (previously Erf 87040 & 87046), Oartmouth Cottage, 212 Main Road, Muizenberg: NM
HM/MUIZENBERG/ERF 176367 (PREVIOUSLY ERF 87040 & 87046)**

Case No: 131009JW09E

An application for permit prepared by G Hamilton dated 30 September 2013, plans and photographs were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Ms Bridget O'Donoghue and Ms N Mc Augey (the client) were present and took part in the discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- It was agreed that the building had lost any intrinsic significance as a consequence of the works approved in 2012 and already initiated.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals understanding that the detailing of the 'interface' between façade and street will be addressed by the City of Cape Town. The Committee supports the client's suggestions as indicated in a photomontage presented in the meeting.

JW

**W.12.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 98038, 6 Riverton Road, Rondebosch: NM
HM/RONDEBOSCH/ERF 98038**

Case No: 131002JW05E

An application for a permit prepared by P Bishop undated, plans (dwg no: MP 06038), date 21 August 2013 and photographs were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be ungradable.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

JW

**W.12.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 91982, 33 Honiton Road, Plumstead: NM
HM/PLUMSTEAD/ERF 92982**

Plans was tabled

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The existing building, a Cape Dutch revival building of the 1920s, was a well designed, well-constructed and well-kept building.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be IIIB.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

JW

**W 12.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Sand Street 4, Elim: NM
HM/ELIM/SAND STREET 4**

A Heritage Statement prepared by T Engel, dated September 2013 and plans prepared by T Engel, dated September 2013, drwg no: 01_01_14 were tabled

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Committee commended the applicant and the designer for the completeness of the application.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

RN

**W.12.5 Proposed Removal of Internal fittings on Standard Bank Building, Erf 9998,
corner Adderly Street and Darling Street, Cape Town: MA
HM/HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 9998**

Case No: 130928TG27M

Ms Shem-Tov made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be II.

The Committee resolved to approve the application involving the removal of dry-wall partitions and modern fittings only as heritage significance will not be affected.

TS-T

**W.12.6 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 271, Kiwinet Workshop, 34 Daneel
Street, Stanford: NM
HM/STANFORD/ERF 271**

Case No: 130828TG26E

An application for a permit and plans prepared by Maureen Wolters Architects, dated 7 October 2013, drwg no: 271_01 were tabled

Ms Tamar Shem-Tov made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- That the local conservation body objected to the proposal
- That any land-use restriction departures were not issues that concerned the heritage resources authority.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be ungradable.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

ZS

W.12.7 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 176418 (Erven 46054 & 46055 Consolidated), No.1 Woodroyd Road (Cnr Grotto Road), Rondebosch: NM HM/RONDEBOSCH/ERF 16418 (ERVEN 46054 & 46055 CONSOLIDATED)

Case No: 130910TG13E

An application for a permit prepared by Ursula Rigby, dated 3 June 2013 and a Heritage Statement prepared by Andrew Berman, dated June 2013 were tabled

Ms Tamar Shem-Tov made a power-point presentation

Ms Ursula Rigby, the architect, and Ms Lindy Briginshan (the owner) were present and took part in discussion

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be IIIB

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal subject to minor revisions to the roof of the stoep kamer as marked up on the drawings.

ZS

W12.8 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 311, House Pera, No.2 Sedgemore Avenue, Camps Bay: MA HM/CAMPS BAY/ERF 311

Case No: 130911TG22E

Revised drawings was tabled

Ms Claire Donovan was present and took part in discussion

In discussion it was noted that:

- Most of the matters raised previously by the committee had been satisfactorily resolved.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the revised proposals and were satisfied that they addressed its previous concerns. A condition of the approval is that the Committee requires that the materials and manufacture of the friezes be further investigated before determining an appropriate method for their removal.

ZS

W.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

W.13.1 None

W. 14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

W.14.1 None

W.15. PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

W.15.1 None

W.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

W.16.1 None

W.17. PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

W.17.1 None

W.18. REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

W.18.1 None

W.19. Other Matters

W.19.1 None

SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION

E.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

**E.10.1 Proposed reduced granite Works, Agulhas Lighthouse, Ptn 53 of Ptn 4 of Farm 281, Cape Agulhas: MA
HM/CAPE AGULHAS/AGULHAS LIGHTHOUSE/PTN 53 OF PTN 4 OF FARM 281**

Case No: 110525ZS16M

Letter from John Rennie and photographs were tabled

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation

Mr Rennine was present and took part in the discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal and that the current conservation architect (Rennie Scurr Addendorff) be required to be employed to supervise the work.

ZS

**E.10.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 115958, 81 Wale Street, Bookaap: NM
HM/BOOKAAP/ERF 115958**

Case No: 130611ZS14E

An application for a permit prepared by M Sedick Lukie, dated 11 June 2013, final comment from SAHRA, photographs and plans were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- This building forms part of a Grade I area.

- The building is one of the original properties dating to the 1760's even if much altered over the years and much restored in the 1970s.
- That SAHRA had commented positively.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

NN

**E.10.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 12264, Dutch Reformed Church, Somerset West
HM/SOMERSET WEST/ERF 12264**

The Committee noted that unauthorised alterations, the insertion of a concrete floor in particular had been undertaken. The Committee requires a stop works order to be issued and a site inspection to be undertaken. A full description of the work already undertaken must be submitted.

ZS

E.11. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

**E.11.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 2726 & 3587, 1 Higgs Road, Higo Vale, Oranjezicht, Cape Town: MA
HM/CAPE TOWN/ORANJEZICHT/HIGOVALE/ERF 2726 & 3587**

Case No: 130611SD07E

An application for a permit prepared by Daniel Caley, dated 5 July 2013 and photographs was tabled

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building has been unoccupied for many years and was damaged beyond repair.

DECISION

The Committee decided that as a consequence of the degradation the building is ungradable.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

ZS

E.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

**E12.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 558, 37 Gilmore Hill Road, Tambierskloof: MA
HM/TAMBOERSKLOOF/ERF 558**

Case No: 130205ZS04E

Plans prepared by SALT, dated Sept 2013, drwg no: A4-100 was tabled

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The proposal is to do identical work to two attached dwellings

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the buildings to be grade III C

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

ZS

**E.12.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions on, 39 Gilmore Hill Road, Tamboerskloof: MA
HM/TAMBOERSKLOOF**

Plans prepared by SALT, dated Sept 2013 was tabled

The Committee decided the grading of the buildings to be grade III C

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

ZS

**E.12.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 95067, Wilton House, 7 Krynauw Street, Gardens: MA
HM/GARDENS/WILTON HOUSE/ERF 95067**

Case No: 130508ZS05E

Revised plans were tabled

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation

In the discussion it was noted that:

- The previous approval dated May 2013 had been dealt with in terms of staff delegations.
- The Committee expressed concern that a building of this considerable significance had not been referred to the committee.

The Committee resolved to defer the matter for consideration at the following meeting and requires that the new committee be provided with the full set of the documentation and that the heritage consultant be present when the matter is discussed.

ZS

**E.12.4 Proposed Restoration, Portion Farm Elandsfontein No 64, Farm Amalienstein Zoar, Main of Kannaland, Ladismith: NM
HM/LADISMIT/FARM AMALIENSTEIN ZOAR**

Case No: 130925NN33M

An application for a permit prepared by Anthony Davis undated, A Heritage Statement prepared by Dr Nicolas Baumann and Sarah Winter, dated 24 October 2013, photographs and plans to be tabled.

The matter was removed from the agenda as the matter had been dealt with by the staff.

NN

**E.12.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Old Bethlehem Homestead: NM
HM/BETHLEHEM HOMESTEAD**

Specification of Material and Methods prepared by Elisabeth Davies Architect, plans prepared by Elisabeth Davies Architect, dated August 2013, drwg no: D001 were tabled

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals.

NN

**E.12.6 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 9676, 41 Jordaan Street, Cape Town: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 9676**

Case No: 131002NN02E

An application for a permit prepared by M Scurr, dated 1 August 2013, photographs and plans prepared by Rennie Scurr Andendorff, dated 27 July 2013 drwg no: C-1001 were tabled

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The dwelling was being converted into a block of flats
- That the roof extension was awkwardly resolved but would not be overwhelming to the streetscape or townscape significances
- That the investment into the building would have a positive effect on the immediate surroundings.
- That SAHRA had commented positively.

DECISION

The Committee decided the building to be a grade III C within an existing grade I area.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal

NN

**E.12.7 Proposed Additions on Ptn 1 of Farm Wilgerivier No 688, Wilgerivier, Nuy Road, Worcester: NM
HM/WORCESTER/PTN 1 OF FARM WILGERIVIER NO 688**

An application for a permit prepared by Henry Hall, undated and plans were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building is a most interesting and significant Victorian homestead
- That the proposal would have a considerable visual effect on the composition and character of the building.

DECISION

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposals and requires that a suitably qualified architect with heritage experience be employed to advise on the appropriate architectural resolution of the proposals.

NN

**E.12.8 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Farm Fredericks1602, Simondium, Paarl: MA
HM/PAARL/FARM 1602**

Case No: 120905NN07M

Mr Thorold reported back on his site visit.

The architect, Ms Fick was present and participated in the discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals subject to the submission of revised drawings indicating the detailing (structural support) of the covered veranda, the treatment of the new werf walling and the north gable end elevation.

NN

E.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

E.13.1 None

E.14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

E.14.1 None

E.15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

E.15.1 None

E.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

E.16.1 None

E.17 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

E.17.1 None

E.18 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

E.18.1 None

E.19 Other Matters

E.19.1 None

20. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

21. CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at **16H00**

22 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 27 November 2013

CHAIRPERSON _____ **DATE** _____

SECRETARY _____ **DATE** _____

Approved