

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING
OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Wednesday, 24 April 2013, 1st Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09H00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The meeting was officially opened at 09H25 by the chairperson, Ms Sarah Winter, and she welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms Sarah Winter	SW
Ms Maureen Wolters	MW
Mr Roger Joshua	RJ
Mr Trevor Thorold	TT
Mr Tim Hart	TH
Mr Patrick Fefeza	PF
Dr Stephen Townsend	ST

Members of Staff

Mr Andrew Hall	AH
Ms Tamar Shemtov	TS
Ms Christina Jikelo	JC
Mr Ronny Nyuka	RN
Mr Jonathan Windvogel	JW
Ms Ntombekhaya Nkoane	NN
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)	LM
Mr Troy Smuts	TS
Mr Olwethu Dlova (Sec)	OD
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka	ZS

Visitors

Mrs Adelaide Combrink	AC	Mr B Wintermeyer	BW
Mr Johan Malherbe	JM	Mr Jan Le Roux	LLR
Mr Niel Le Roux	NLR	Ms Yolande Le Roux	YLR
Mr Joe De Villiers	JDV	Ms Antionet van Wyk	AvW
Prof David Dewar	DD	Mr Piet Louw	PL
Mr Ashley Lillie	AL	Ms Claire Donovan	CD
Ms Tanya Golding	TG	Ms Heidi Boise	

Observers

Mr Bevin September (City of Cape Town)	Mr Johan Cornelius (City of Cape Town)
--	--

3. Apologies

Mr Calvin van Wijk	CvW
Ms Melanie Attwell	MA

4. Approval of minutes of previous meeting held 27 March 2013

4.1 The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with minor amendments.

5. Disclosure of Interest

6. Approval of Agenda

The Committee approved the agenda dated 24 April 2013 with a few additional items.

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 Minutes attached

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

The Chairperson gave a report back on the following various appeals matters:

- Proposed Alterations to 2 Kortmark Street, Erf 237, Elim
- Proposed Re-Assembly of the Cenotaph Adderley Street, Cape Town and the Construction of an IRT Bus Station on the Site
- Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 501/02, Main Road, Mooikelder, Paarl
- Proposed Alterations, Erf 237, 82 Kerk Street, Elim

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges

No matters to report back

8.3 Checklist for Application- Related Decision- Making

The checklist revised form to be circulated to members.

AH

8.4 Overstrand Municipality Issues of Jurisdiction

A date has been set for a meeting between HWC, the Municipal Manager and Mr John Simson to clarify issues of jurisdiction especially with respect to Section 34 and Section 31.

AH

8.5 UCT, Middle Campus, Economics Building

SD gave a report back on HWC's meeting with Mr Haupt and a process for resolving issues of non-compliance has been agreed too.

SD.

8.6 Elim Workshop

The Committee noted the draft programme of the Elim workshop to be held on 11 May 2013. Ms Jikelo will discuss the programme with the CEO, especially with regard to clarifying the purpose of the workshop and participants.

8.7 List of decisions of team meetings

The CEO confirmed that those decisions will be provided to the web manager within two working days of the team meeting.

CvW

8.8 Report back on meeting with SAHRA Re-District Six Demolitions

Mr Shiceka reported back on his meeting with SAHRA officials as required in terms of the MOU with SAHRA.

ZS

9. Appointments

9.1 The Committee noted the appointment for item E.10.2 set for 11H00.

FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION

W.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

W.10.1 Proposed Re-instatement of Gable Windows, Erf 28002, De Meule, Avenue Road, Mowbray: NM HM/MOWBRAY/DE MEULE/ERF 28002

An application for a permit prepared by Michael Scurr, dated 5 December 2012 and plans (dwg no: W-3005/A) prepared Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects, dated 16 April 2013 were tabled

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be Grade II.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

TG

W.10.2 Proposed Restoration, Erf 8168, French Redoubt, Trafalgar Park, Searle Street, Woodstock: NM HM/WOODSTOCK/FRENCH REDOUBT/TRAFALGAR PARK/ERF 8168

Case No: 130325JW14E

An application for a permit prepared by Margot van Heerden, photographs and plan were tabled

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be graded II and it is a PHS.

The Committee resolved to approve the application for repairs and maintenance to the French Redoubt, Trafalgar Park as per scope of works in report prepared by Sjanel Martin dated March 2013. The supervision of the work is to be done by a suitable qualified professional to be approved by HWC.

JW

**W.10.3 Proposed New Building, Bredasdorp Shipwreck Museum, Erf 2096, 6
Independent Street, Bredasdorp: NM
HM/BREDASDORP/BREDASDORP SHIPWRECK MUSEUM/ERF 2096**

Case No: 130417JW16E

An Application for a permit, photographs and plans (dwg no: A-745/1), prepared by Klaus Fischer Architects & Associates undated were tabled

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the existing building to be graded II and it is a PHS.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposed new building subject to there being a distinction between the proposed new joinery and old joinery in the abutting old building in terms of detailing rather than proportion.

JW

**W.11 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL
DEMOLITION**

**W.11.1 Proposed Total Demolition to Erf 54, 1 Botany Lane, Bantry Bay, Cape Town:
MA
HM/CAPE TOWN/BANTRY BAY/ERF 54**

Case No: 130130TG31E

Report back of site inspection

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation

Mr Ashley Lillie and Mr Johan Cornelius were present and took part in the discussion

In discussion it was noted that:

- Ms Winter gave report back from site visit undertaken by Ms Attwell
- The notes of the site visit prepared by MA were circulated.

The Committee requested a Heritage Statement of the architectural significance of the building including some comparative study of buildings of the same type, period and design.

TG

W.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

W.12.1 Proposal for Partial Internal Demolition and Addition of a New First Floor on Erf 455, 84 Waterkant Street, De Waterkant, Cape Town: MA HM/CAPE TOWN/DE WATERKANT/ERF 455

Case No: 130305TG07E

Plans (dwg no: 000 002) dated 10 August 2012 and photographs were tabled

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation

Mr Joe De Villiers, the architect and Mr Cornelius of the City Council were present and took part in the discussion

In discussion it was noted that:

- The City of Cape Town is of the opinion that the height and the scale of the proposed new addition are unresolved.
- That there are essentially four heritage-related generators of design in such cases (additions above a significant heritage resource): the choice of design strategy (traditional/in-keeping or modern/contrasting), the height of the addition, how far it is set back (both of these generators effect the silhouette of the complex) and the articulation of architectural elements (fenestration, mouldings, materials, etc)
- That, as a consequence of the combination of these factors, the proposal would be rather too obtrusive
- This was explained to the architect in order to assist in moving to a more acceptable design

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the street block to be Grade IIIA.

The Committee resolved not to approve the current proposal.

TG

W.12.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 1745, Dirkie Uys Street, Franschhoek: NM HM/FRANSCHHOEK/ERF 1745

Case No: 130301TG04E

An Application for a permit prepared by E. Da Silva, dated 27 February 2013, photographs and plans prepared by Emerging Architecture (dwg no: 2008 13-PL001) were tabled

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The case officer, Ms Grover, was asked to discuss with the architect the several relatively minor amendments the committee suggested in order to have the proposal accepted

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be possible IIB and part of an important streetscape.

The Committee resolved to refuse the application. While the design principles are acceptable, numerous relatively minor modifications to the proposal are required.

TG

W.12.3 Proposed Partial Demolition, Additions and Alterations, Erf 2305, Old Sillery, 33 Sillery Avenue, Constantia: NM HM/CONSTANTIA/OLD SILLERY/ERF 2305

Case No: 130411TG16M

Revised proposal for Remedial work prepared by Tanya Golding, dated 10 July 2012, an application for permit prepared by Tanya Golding, dated 8 April 2013, photographs and plans were tabled.

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation

Ms Claire Donovan and Ms Tanya Golding were present and participated in the discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- No comments were submitted from City of Cape Town and CPOA.

COMMENT

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be Grade II

The Committee supports the proposal and awaits comments from the CPOA. The proposal for the sash window on the east elevation is preferred.

TG

W.12.4 Proposed Additions to Existing Dwelling, Erf 4444, 13 Cheve Street, Paarl: NM HM/PAARL/ERF 4444

Case No: 130403JW05E

An application for a permit prepared by Pieter Syfert, dated 20 February 2013, plans (dwg no: 140109MU1, prepared by Level 7 Architects, dated March 2012, comments from Paarl 300, DHF and Drakenstein Municipality were tabled

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be Grade IIC

The Committee resolved to approve the application

JW

**W.12.5 Proposed Alterations on Erf 237, Kortsand Straat 31, Elim: MA
HM/ELIM/ERF 237**

Case No: 130315RN05E

Report back onsite inspection

DECISION

The Committee resolved that the application be refused but noted that the proposal may receive a more positive reception if the thatch was to be retained.

The applicant should be informed that the issue of retaining thatch roofs in Elim will be discussed on the workshop on 11 May 2013.

RN

**W.12.6 Proposed Alterations and Additions to Existing Buildings on Mooikelder, Farm
501/02, Main Road, Paarl: MA
HM/PAARL/MOOIKELDER/FARM 501/02**

Revised plans prepared by Johan Malherbe was tabled

The architect, Johan Malherbe, and the applicant were present and took part in the discussions.

In discussion it was noted that:

- DHF does not support the revised proposal.
- Paarl 300 supports the revised proposal.
- The reduced height does respond in large part to the previous comments
- The horizontally proportioned windows are aesthetically awkward and discussion of this issue ensued

COMMENT

The Committee supports the revised proposal for the envelope but requires modifications to the fenestration.

The Committee agreed that if the revised drawings could be circulated by email a decision could be made by email.

RN

W.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

W.13.1 None

W. 14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

W.14.1 None

W.15. PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

W.15.1 None

W.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

W.16.1 None

W.17. PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

W.17.1 None

W.18. REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

W.18.1 None

W.19. Other Matters

W.19.1 None

SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION

E.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

E.10.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 237, Boom Street, Elim: NM HM/ELI/ERF 237

Case No: 130326ZS37E

An Application for a permit prepared by J Baxter, dated 25 March 2013, photographs and plans was tabled

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection.

ZS

E.10.2 Proposed Development, Agulhas lighthouse Precinct, Papenkuilsfontein 281, Ptn 53 and Papenkuilsfontein 281, Rem of Ptn 3, Ptn 4 and Ptn 17, Cape Agulhas: MA HM/CAPE AGULHAS/AGULHAS LIGHTHOUSE PRECINCT/PAPENKUILSFONTEIN 281, PTN 53 and REM of PTN 3, PT 4 and PTN 17

Case No: 110525ZS16D

Heritage Indicators and Urban Design Concept prepared by Piet Louw and Dave Dewar in Association, an application for a permit prepared by Antionet van Wyk, dated 5 April 2013 and plans was tabled

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation

Mr Piet Louw, Mr Dave Dewar and Ms Antionet van Wyk were present and took part in the discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the Heritage Indicators and Urban Design Concept.

ZS

E.11. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

**E.11.1 Proposed Total Demolition of Erven 8504, Zonnebloem in Pontac, Nelson and Aspeling Streets, District Six: MA
HM/DISTRICT SIX/ERVEN 8504**

Case No: 121011ZS11M

A Heritage Statement prepared by Jake de Villiers, Heritage Consultant, dated March 2013, an application for a permit prepared by J A De Villiers and Andrew Berman, dated 9 April 2013, plans and photographs was tabled

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The procedure in the MOU with SAHRA has been followed and SAHRA has issued a letter to HWC stating that it does not support the demolitions and that it intends to provisionally protect the sites.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that the permit for demolition should be issued.

ZS

**E.11.2 Proposed Total Demolition of Erven 8505, Zonnebloem in Pontac, Nelson and Aspeling Streets, District Six: MA
HM/DISTRICT SIX/ERVEN 8505**

A Heritage Statement prepared by Jake de Villiers, Heritage Consultant, dated March 2013, an application for a permit prepared by J A De Villiers and Andrew Berman, dated 9 April 2013, plans and photographs was tabled

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The procedure in the MOU with SAHRA has been followed and SAHRA has issued a letter to HWC stating that it does not support the demolitions and that it intends to provisionally protect the sites.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that the permit for demolition should be issued.

ZS

**E.11.3 Proposed Total Demolition of Erven 8513, Zonnebloem in Pontac, Nelson and Aspeling Streets, District Six: MA
HM/DISTRICT SIX/ERVEN 8513**

A Heritage Statement prepared by Jake de Villiers, Heritage Consultant, dated March 2013, an application for a permit prepared by J A De Villiers and Andrew Berman, dated 9 April 2013, plans and photographs was tabled

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The procedure in the MOU with SAHRA has been followed and SAHRA has issued a letter to HWC stating that it does not support the demolitions and that it intends to provisionally protect the sites.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that the permit for demolition should be issued.

ZS

E.11.4 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 11122, 11123, 11124, 11126 and 11127, 80-88 Albert Road, Woodstock: NM HM/WOODSTOCK/ERF 11122, 11124, 11125, 11126 and 11127

Case No: 130227NN05E

An application for a permit, plans and photographs was tabled

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

The Committee resolved that this matter should be treated as a S38 application and that the applicant should submit a NID and be appropriately advised by the case officer.

NN

E.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

E.12.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, St Andrew's Anglican Church, Erf 1362, 5 Wesley Street, Strand: NM HM/STRAND/ST ANDREW'S ANGLICAN CHURCH/ERF 1362

Case No: 130405SD06E

An Application plans and photographs was tabled

In discussion It was noted that:

- The church, designed by Kendall and built in the late 1920s is a significant building in the oeuvre of the "school of Baker" and one of a number of closely-related churches designed by Baker and his followers for the Anglican Church between about 1915 and 1940
- Other churches in this medieval Romanesque mode include Baker and Kendall's 1915 St Peter's chapel at the Diocesan Training College in Grahamstown, Morris's 1925 (or so) St Cyprian's Chapel at St Cyprians School in Oranjezicht and Kendall's 1927 St Alban's in Green Point
- This church is unspoiled (although it may have had its roof tiles replaced)
- This proposal will severely damage the architectural character and significance
- It appears that neither the Anglican Church nor the architect are sensitive to the architectural value of the church

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be IIIA, possibly II

The Committee resolved not to approve the application as the proposals are unsympathetic to the significance of the building. In order for an application of this nature to be considered in the future an application would have to be accompanied by a Heritage Statement and the assessment of the impact on the significance of the building.

SD

E.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

E.13.1 None

E.14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

E.14.1 None

E.15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

E.15.1 None

E.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

E.16.1 None

E.17 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

E.17.1 None

E.18 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

E.18.1 None

E.19 Other Matters

E.19.1 None

20. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

21. CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at **15H15**

22 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 22 May 2013

CHAIRPERSON _____ **DATE** _____

SECRETARY _____ **DATE** _____