

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING
OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Wednesday, 26 June 2013, 1st Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09H00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The meeting was officially opened at 09H13 by the chairperson, Ms Sarah Winter, and she welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms Sarah Winter	SW
Dr Stephen Townsend	ST
Ms Maureen Wolters	MW
Mr Roger Joshua	RJ
Mr Trevor Thorold	TT
Ms Melanie Attwell	MA
Mr Patrick Fefeza	PF
Mr Tim Hart	TM

Members of Staff

Ms Christina Jikelo	CJ
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)	LM
Mr Calvin van Wijk	CvW
Mr Ronny Nyuka	RN
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka	ZS
Mr Jonathan Windvogel	JW
Ms Ntombekhaya Nkoane	NN
Mr Shaun Dyers	SD
Mr Olwethu Dlova (Sec)	OD

Visitors

Mrs Claire Donovan	CD	Mr Henry Aikman	HA
Mr Frik Vermeulen	FV	Mr Raymond Morkel	RM
Mrs C Morkel	CM	Ms Lezanne Botha	LB
Mr John Powell	JP	Mrs Heidi Boise	HB
Mr Chris Snelling	CS	Mrs Robyn Berzen	RB

Observers

None

3. Apologies

Andrew Hall	AH
-------------	----

4. Approval of minutes of previous meeting held 22 May 2013

4.1 The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with minor amendments.

5. Disclosure of Interest

- TT, SW and MA: W.10.3

6. Approval of Agenda

The Committee approved the agenda dated 26 June 2013 with a few additional amendments.

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

Mr van Wijk gave a report back on the outcomes of the following appeals matter:

- Proposed Adjustments to Dairy Parlour, Vergelegen Estate, Lourensford Road, Somerset West. The committee was advised that the Appeals committee had upheld the appeal contrary to the previous decisions of both IA Comm and the BEL Comm.

AH/CvW

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges

Mr van Wijk gave a report back on the Jacobs Ladder, St James electricity upgrade. He informed the Committee that a stop works order had been issued. Concerns were raised with regards as to how matters are dealt with between various departments within the City of Cape Town and the delay in taking action in this matter; and it was suggested that the officials should seek cooperation within the City Council structures in cases like this.

CvW

8.3 Checklist for Application- Related Decision- Making

Mr van Wijk will follow up the finalisation of the form with the CEO and this will form part of Mr van Wijk's handover report.

AH

8.4 Elim Workshop

The Committee noted that the Church intends to obtain a declaratory order regarding to Provincial Heritage Site status of Elim.

The Church has also informed HWC that it does not intend to participate in the workshop set for 6 July in Bredasdorp if other parties are also involved. The committee read the CEO's response to the Church and concurred with it.

The Committee resolved that the entire farm is grade II and that HWC should begin the process of provisionally declaring the entire property and that proposal to the EXCO is to be accompanied by a survey diagram clearly indicating the extent of the provisional declaration.

The Committee discussed the agenda for the workshop and recommended certain amendments. The new agenda and maps should be circulated to the HWC members attending the meeting before Friday, 5 July.

CJ

8.5 East Fort, Hout Bay (PHS)

In discussion it was noted that the deadline for the stabilisation of the ruins was the end of May. The Committee is requested that the case officer and the CEO interact with the SANParks and get feedback by the next meeting.

TS

9. Appointments

9.1 None

FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION

W.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

W.10.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 237, 47 Boom Street, Elim: NM HM/ELIM/ERF 237/47 BOOM STREET

Case No: 130523JW30 E

An application prepared by R Morkel, photographs and plans were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr and Mrs Morkel were present and took part in the discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- Elim Opsienersraad supports the application

DECISION

The Committee confirmed the grading of Elim to be Grade II.

The Committee approves the application on condition that the front elevation roof material remains thatch.

JW

W.10.2 Proposed Subdivision on Erf 4150, Longkloof, Cnr Longkloof Road and Hout Bay Main Road, Houtbay Longkloof: NM HM/HOUTBAY/ERF 4150

Case No: 130612JW15E

An application prepared by Claire Abrahamse dated 6 June 2013; comments from the City of Cape Town and report prepared by Claire Abrahamse and Laura Bridgman, dated April 2013 were tabled

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Ms Claire Donovan was present and took part in the discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- City of Cape Town supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the remainder erf 4150 to be Grade II in terms of its historic landmark qualities located on an important scenic route as well as its historical and architectural values.

The Committee resolved to approve the subdivision subject to a title condition being imposed on the area defined as LyzC on the survey diagram with the following restrictions:

- No building may erected within this area;
- No vehicular access may be provided across this area;
- No boundary wall may erected in this area without HWC approval;
- No felling of mature trees in this area without HWC approval.

The Committee recommends to IGICom that Ptn 1 be de-proclaimed as a PHS.

JW

W.10.3 Proposed Alterations Additions to Valkenberg Core Historical Complex and back Service Buildings, Erf 26439, Observatory, Cape Town: NM HM/OBSERVATORY/ERF 26439

Case No: 121121JW25D

An application, Scope of Works, HWC Comments, Extracts from Valkenberg Hospital Phase 1 HIA and Locality Plan prepared by Thorold Architects CC, dated June 2013 were tabled.

Ms Winter, Ms Attwell, Mr Thorold and Mr Hart recused themselves and Dr Townsend took the chair. The Committee with only four members did not have a quorum and it was agreed that the four-person committee would formulate the recommendation for the EXCO to decide on as per the rules for meetings.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- Consultation is occurring within the HIA & EIA processes.

RECOMMENDATION TO EXCO FOR DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of all the buildings involved in this application to be Grade II.

The Committee recommends that the EXCO approves the applications and notes, in particular, the contemporary character of the services being provided.

JW

W.10.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 3701, Zeederberg Square, Paarl: NM HM/PAARL/ERF 3701

Case No: 130524TG23E

An application to replace the existing roof with corrugated iron and comments from AKSO, Paarl 300 and DHF were tabled.

Mr van Wijk made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Paarl 300 supported the proposals.
- The DHF did not support the proposals.

INTERIM COMMENT

The Committee resolved that the grading of the building to be a grade II and it is a PHS.

The Committee resolved not to consider the proposals.

The Committee requires an appropriately skilled conservation architect to advise on the design and specifications of the repairs to the roof.

TG

**W.10.5 Proposed New Building, Erf 237, 33 Kerk Street, Elim: NM
HM/ELIM/ERF 237/33 KERK STREET**

Case No: 130507RN07E

An application prepared for L Cloete, undated, photographs and plans were tabled.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

COMMENT

The Committee resolved to defer the matter for a site visit on 6 July 2013.

RN

**W 10.6 Proposed Alterations and Additions Ruth Prowse School of Art, Erf 145879, 5
Elson Road, Woodstock:NM
HM/PAARL/ERF 145879**

Case No: 130518TG13E

An application and plans prepared by Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects were tabled.

Mr Calvin van Wijk made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- City of Cape Town supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade II and it is a PHS.

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

TG

**W.10.7 Proposed Alterations, Erf 237, 31 Sand Street, Elim: NM
HM/ELIM/ERF 237/31 KERK STREET**

Case No: 130315RN05E

An application prepared for B Temmers, undated, photographs and plans were tabled.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

COMMENT

The Committee resolved to defer the matter and deal with it after a site visit on the 6 July 2013.

RN

**W 10.8 Proposed Alterations, Erf 237, 31 Kerk Street, Elim
HM/ELIM/ERF 237**

COMMENT

The Committee has no objection to the proposal on condition that the thatch roof is retained with a hipped gable-end and a lightweight timber floor with lightweight screed is used. Revised drawings must be submitted including a section.

RN

**W.10.9 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 237, 13 Kerk Street, Elim: NM
HM/ELIM/ERF 237**

Case No: 130514JW25E

An application prepared for J Absalom, photographs, comments from Opsienersraad and plans were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation

COMMENT

The Committee resolved to defer the matter and deal with it after the site visit on the 6 July 2013.

JW

**W.11 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL
DEMOLITION**

W.11.1 None

**W.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL
DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

W.12.1 None

W.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

W.13.1 None

W. 14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

W.14.1 None

W.15. PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

W.15.1 None

W.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

W.16.1 None

W.17. PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

W.17.1 None

W.18. REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

W.18.1 None

W.19. Other Matters

W.19.1 None

SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION

E.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

**E.10.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 237, 31 Boom Street, Elim: NM
HM/ELIM/ERF 237**

Case No: 130326ZS37E

COMMENT

The Committee resolved to defer the matter and deal with it by e-mail after a site visit on 6 July 2013.

ZS

**E.10.2 Proposed Redevelopment of St. Saviour's Church site Claremont, Erf 55017, 55018, 55019, 55020 and 55021, Cape Town: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 55017-55021**

Case No: 110927NN20

Heritage Impact Assessment Report prepared by Aikman Associates Heritage Management, dated May 2013 was tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

Mr Henry Aikman and Mr Frik Vermeulen were present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- This is a significant intervention within an important heritage context and will have a significant impact on heritage resources
- No consultation focusing on heritage issues has been undertaken and it is required.
- The likelihood of the impact on burials must be established as per the recommendation of the APM.
- Concern was expressed regarding the sitting and the scale of the proposed developments.
- The brief report attached to the NID indicated that consultation with the CIA would at least be undertaken in addition to the requirements in Section 38(3).

- The Committee advises that the planning- and heritage-related consultation be undertaken jointly.
- The HWC Council has formally graded the site to be Grade II.

RESOLUTION

The Committee confirmed the grading of the site as a whole to be Grade II including the church and the grave yard and associated open green space and is an important location in terms of historic routes.

The Committee resolved to make no decision until a thorough consultation process with relevant heritage organisations and the wider public has been undertaken. Such consultation should involve the CIA Heritage Committee, the various City branches (heritage, urban design and planning), Simon van der Stel Foundation, VASSA and any other relevant organisations, and should include public notification.

An archaeological heritage statement is required to assess whether there are any unmarked burials or any other archaeological concerns.

NN

E.11. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

E.11.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Glonor Court, 24 Davenport Road, Erf 1444, Vredehoek: NM HM/VREDEHOEK/ERF 1444

Case No: 130612NN16E

An application and Statement of Significance prepared by Chris Snelling, dated May 2013 were tabled

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that some members who had not yet visited the site would conduct a site visit (SW, MW, TH)

NN

E.11.2 Proposed Total Demolition, Trelawny, Erf 83, 2 Houghton Road, Bakoven, Camps Bay: NN HM/CAMPS BAY/ERF 83

Case No: 130507SD06E

An application, comments from Meta Form Architects, dated 6 May 2013 and photographs were tabled.

Mr Shaun Dyers made a power-point presentation.

Mr John Powell of the CBRRA and Mrs Robyn Berzen for the applicant were present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building does not have sufficient significance to be formally protected.
- The environs do not have any heritage significance.
- The character of Camps Bay has been significantly changed.

DECISION

The Committee decided that the building is ungradable

The Committee resolved to approve the proposed demolition as the building has insufficient significance to be formally protected.

SD

E.11.3 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 1443, 22 Davenport Road, Vredehoek: NM HM/VREDEHOEK/ERF 1443

Case No: 130611ZS15E

An application and Statement of Significance prepared by Chris Snelling, dated May 2013 were tabled.

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee resolved that the demolition be approved as the building has insufficient significance to be formally protected. .

ZS

E.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

E.12.1 Proposed Alterations and Restorations, Erf 9641, 157 Waterkant Street, Cape Town: NM HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 9641

Case No: 130508ZS03E

An application, supporting documents and plans prepared by Martin Kruger Associates, dated 02 May 2013 were tabled.

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Committee has no objection to the scale of the proposals but suggests some modifications to the proportions of the front and side façades and the cornice treatment.
- The building is located on a prominent street corner forming part of an important streetscape.
- The DWCA's comments are requested on the amended proposal.

COMMENT

The committee has discussed certain amendments and looks forward to a revised proposal.

ZS

E.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

E.13.1 None

E.14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

E.14.1 None

E.15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

E.15.1 None

E.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

E.16.1 None

E.17 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

E.17.1 None

E.18 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

E.18.1 None

E.19 Other Matters

E.19.1 None

20. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

21. CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at **16H00**

22 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 26 July 2013

CHAIRPERSON _____ **DATE** _____

SECRETARY _____ **DATE** _____