

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING
OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Wednesday, 27 November 2013, 1st Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09H00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The meeting was officially opened at 09:00 by the chairperson, Ms Sarah Winter, and she welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms Sarah Winter
Ms Belinda Mutti
Mr Graham Jacobs
Mr Michael Scurr
Mr Rowen Ruiters
Mr Stuart Hermansen
Mr Peter Buttgens

SW
BM
GJ
MS
RR
SH
PB

Members of Staff

Mr Andrew Hall AH
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka ZS
Mr Troy Smuts TS
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec) LM
Mr Ronny Nyuka RN
Mr Olwethu-Oz-Dlova (Sec) OD
Mr Jonathan Windvogel JW
Ms Ntombekhaya Nkoane NN
Mr Guy Thomas GT
Mr Christina Jikelo CJ

Visitors

Ms Melanie Attwell
Ms Cindy Postlethwayt
Mr Tyron Engel
Mr Raymond Smith
Mr Nellis Beyers

MA
CP
TE
RS
NB

Prof Jo Noero DN
Mr Ashley Lillie AL
Mr Rob Dutton RD
Mr Tertius Kruger TK
Anne-Marie Fick AF

Observers

3. Apologies

None

4. Approval of minutes of previous meeting held 23 October 2013

4.1 The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with no amendments.

5. Disclosure of Interest

5.1 GJ: W.10.4, E.10.2 & E.12.5
SW: E.12.5
MS: 8.6
SH: 8.5

6. Approval of Agenda

The Committee approved the agenda dated 27 November 2013 with following additional items:

- Proposed Erecting of Monument, St Blaize Cave, Point of Mossel Bay, Mossel Bay
- Proposed Repairs and Maintenance on Erf 861, Abutting Homestead Park, Stadsfontein Vault, Oranjezicht.

- Proposed Restoration on Morgenster Farm, Farm 1319, Vergelegen Drive, Somerset West.

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

The CEO report back on following appeals and tribunal matters:

- Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 237, 31 Boom Street, Elim
- Baboon Point, Elands Bay
- Highclere, Bloubergstrand

AH/ZS

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges

8.2.1 Formal Stop Works Order for Unauthorised Work, Erf 106, 1 Church Street (Museum), Tulbagh

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that:

- The sand be removed before the 13 December 2013 or charges should be laid.
- Photographs of the completed work should to be forwarded to HWC.

JW

8.3 Checklist for Applications

The matter was held over for discussion at the next meeting.

ZS

8.4 Elim Workshop

SW requested that the draft report on the workshop be circulated to committee members.

ZS reported that the draft report had not yet been circulated to the Friends of Elim, the Moravian Church, the Opsiensersraad and the municipality for comment. This would be undertaken before the next meeting.

CJ

8.5 Application for Departures on Erf 1324, Dorp Street, Stellenbosch: MA HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 1324

SH recused himself.

ZS and the CEO reported that an attempt has been made to set up a meeting with the Stellenbosch Municipality and that this will be followed up.

ZS/CEO

8.6 Erf 90780 and 91062, Oak Cottage, Durban Road, Wynberg (PHS)

MS recused himself and left the room.

The Committee upholds its previous recommendation and strongly advises the CEO to lay charges. In light of this, the Committee is unable to consider Mr Rennie's proposal.

ZS

9. Appointments

9.1 The Committee noted the appointment of item W.10.4 set for 11H00.

FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION

W.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

**W.10.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 8168, Trafalgar Park, Searle Street, Bandstand, Woodstock: NM
HM/WOODSTOCK/ERF 8168**

Case No: 130123JW29E

An application for permit and photographs were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- Woodstock Aesthetic Advisory Committee supports the proposal.

DECISIONS

The Committee decided the grading of the site to be grade II and it is a PHS.

The Committee resolved to approve the temporary alteration for the period of March 2013 to March 2014.

JW

**W.10.2 Proposed Additions on Erf 237, 1 Buite Street, Elim: NM
HM/ELIM/ERF 237/1 BUIE STREET**

Case No: 131108JW23

An application for a permit prepared by T. Engel, dated 7 November 2013, a Heritage Statement dated November 2013 and plans were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr Tyrone Engel was present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- Elim Opsieners Raad and the Agulhas Municipality support the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application subject to the submission of revised drawings indicating amendments to the roof form to extend the existing hipped roof over the garage.

Revised plans must be submitted to HWC for scrutiny by the CEO.

JW

W.10.3 Proposed New Building on Erf 237, 13 Kerk Street, Elim: NM HM/ELIM/ERF 237/13 KERK STREET

Case No: 130514JW25

An application for a permit prepared by Tyrone Engel, dated 6 November 2013, a Heritage Statement dated November 2013 and plans were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation

Mr Tyrone Engel was present and took part in discussion

In discussion it was noted that:

- Elim Opsiensersraad supports the proposal
- The Committee commended Mr Engel on the completeness of the application and quality of the drawings.
- The Committee suggested a number of amendments which were annotated on the plans.

DECISION

The Committee resolved not to approve the application.

Revised plans must be submitted for scrutiny by the CEO.

JW

W.10.4 Proposed Visitors and Interpretive Centre, West Coast Fossil Park Precinct One, Farm 1223, Saldanha Bay: MA HM/SALDANHA BAY/WEST COAST FOSSIL PARK PRECINCT ONE/FARM 1223

Building plans prepared by Noero Architects and dated 13 November 2013 and a Heritage Report prepared by Melanie Attwell and Associates, dated 10 November 2013 were tabled.

Mr Graham Jacobs recused himself and joined the applicants.

Mr Troy Smuts made a power-point presentation.

Ms Melanie Attwell and Prof Jo Noero were present and took part in discussion. Prof Noero made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Committee welcomed the final proposals.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the final building plans.

A CMP must be submitted prior to work on the Fossil Bed Site commencing. Previous conditions of approval pertaining to archaeological and paleontological resources remain applicable.

TS

W.10.5 Proposed Additions to existing structure on Erf 237, 16 Sand Street, Elim: NM HM/ELIM/ERF 237/16 SAND STREET

Case No: 131108RN26

An application for a permit prepared by Tyrone Engel, dated 30 October 2013, a Heritage Statement dated November 2013 and plans were tabled.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

Mr Tyrone Engel was present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The slope of the roof line of the proposed angled lean-to was not accurately depicted. However, limited views of the proposed addition would not significantly impact on the surrounding area.

DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

RN

W.10.6 Proposed Erecting of Monument, St Blaize Cave, Point of Mossel Bay, Mossel Bay HM/MOSSEL BAY/ST BLAIZE CAVE/POINT OF MOSSEL BAY

Case No: 131126TS39

An application, photographs and plans were tabled.

Mr Troy Smuts made a power-point presentation.

COMMENTS

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Committee supports the principle of commemorating the Khoisan heritage of the site and the region.
- The Committee is aware that there are other initiatives to commemorate Khoisan heritage and that the Municipality has major plans for the interpretation of the coastal archaeology of the Southern Cape in close proximity to St Blaize Cave.
- There are other Khoisan organisations with similar initiatives and wide consultation is needed before commemoration within a PHS of this nature can be considered. Such consultation is required in terms of the NHRA.

- This is an important archaeological site with the highest level of protection available under the NHRA and the erection of a structure of this nature is likely to impact archaeological deposits and the character of the cave.
- The short notice and incompleteness of this application has made it difficult for the committee to give more complete advice on how Khoisan heritage could be appropriately commemorated at the site.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to refuse the application.

TS

W.10.7 Proposed Repairs and Maintenance on Erf 861, Stadsfontein Vault, Oranjezicht HM/ORANJEZICHT/STADSFONTEIN/ERF 861

An application for a permit prepared by Sjanel Martin of the City of Cape Town, dated 01 November 2013, plans and photographs were tabled.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- Archaeological monitoring will be required.
- The work should be undertaken by an appropriately experienced contractor.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the site to be grade II and it is a PHS.

The Committee resolved to undertake a site visit to inspect the quality of the phase I work before making a decision. (MS, SH and PB)

RN

W.11 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

W.11.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erven 312 & 313, Indigo Backpackers/ Africa's Beach House, 83 Beach Road, Gordons Bay: NM HM/GORDONS BAY/ERVEN 312 & 313

A Heritage Statement prepared by Ron Martin Consultancy was tabled.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building has no heritage significance.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be un-gradable.

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

RN

W.11.2 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 57935, Hoogeind, 6 Torquay Avenue, Claremont: NM HM/CLAREMONT/ERF 57935

Case No: 131114RN33

An application for a permit photographs and plans was tabled

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation

Mr Ashley Lillie was present and took part in discussion

In discussion it was noted that:

- The City of Cape Town has no objection to the demolition.
- The City of Cape Town suggested the grading of the building to be grade IIC.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection (MS and PB).

RN

**W.11.3 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 24292, 24 Louws Avenue, Southern Paarl:
MA
HM/SOUTHERN PAARL/ERF 24292**

Case No: 131017RN19

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

Ms Anne Marie Fick was present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection (GJ, SH and SW).

RN

**W.11.4 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 487, No.92 The Ridge, Clifton: NM
HM/CLIFTON/ERF 487**

Case No: 131114JW31

An application for a permit and a Heritage Statement prepared by Ashley Lillie, dated 13 November 2013 were tabled.

The matter was removed from the agenda at the request of the applicant.

JW

**W.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL
DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**W.12.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 9649, Lourens Street, Somerset West: NM
HM/SOMERSET WEST/ERF 9649**

An application for a permit, plans and photographs were tabled.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

Mr Ashley Lillie was present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- Unauthorised work had been carried out.
- The municipality had issued a cease works order.

DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to undertake a site visit (SH) and that stop works order be issued.

RN

**W.12.2 Proposed Alterations and Restorations on Erf 924, 54 Chiappini Street, Bo-Kaap: NM
HM/BO-KAAP/ERF 924**

Case No: 131105JW12E

An application for a permit prepared by Assandri Diego, dated 5 November 2013, photographs and plans prepared by Flavio Manzo Architere, Pheko Architecture and 2MD Exclusive Italian Design, dated 7 September 2012 were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

DECISIONS

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade IIIB.

The Committee resolved to approve the application subject to the moulding to the parapet wall of the new addition being simplified.

JW

**W.12.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 146105, 5 & 7 Gray Street, Zonnebloem: NM
HM/ZONNEBLOEM/ERF 146105**

Case No: 1301011JW10

An application for a permit prepared by W. Baker, dated 2 October 2013, photographs and plans prepared by Greater City Designers, dated January 2013 were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building is in a derelict condition.

- The City of Cape Town had no objection to the demolition.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be IIC.

The Committee resolved to approve the application for total demolition.

JW

W.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

W.13.1 None

W. 14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

W.14.1 None

W.15. PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

W.15.1 None

W.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

W.16.1 None

W.17. PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

W.17.1 None

W.18. REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

W.18.1 None

W.19. Other Matters

W.19.1 None

SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION

E.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

**E.10.1 Proposed Additions to existing structures, Erf 237, Elim Clinic, Kerk Street,
Elim: NM
HM/ELIM/ERF 237**

Case No: 131022NN33E

An application and plans prepared by Willie van der Berg, dated 01/10/2013 were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The submission was incomplete.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that the application was incomplete due to the absence of a site location plan which made it impossible to assess the proposals within its context. The committee requires the submission of fully coloured plans, section lines and north point.

NN

E.10.2 Proposed Restorations on the historic Dutch Reformed Church, Erf 1224 (Ptn Erf 625) Church Street, Somerset West: MA HM/SOMERSET WEST/ERF 1224

A Heritage Related Status Report prepared by Graham Jacobs, dated November 2013, and plans were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

GJ recused himself.

DECISION

The Committee supports the recommendations of the heritage statement prepared by Mr Graham Jacobs including the need for ongoing monitoring of further work.

The Committee accepts the work already undertaken.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposed additional work; this is subject to the ongoing monitoring of the work by a heritage architect and the submission of a completion report to HWC.

An application must be submitted for any further additional work including site works.

The Committee strongly recommends the restoration and reinstatement of the pulpit.

NN

E.10.3 Proposed Consent Use of a Dwelling for a House Shop, Falcon House, Erf 165381, 21 Durban Road, Wynberg: NM HM/WYNBERG/ERF 165381

Case No: 131024NN40M

A Heritage Assessment Report prepared by Cindy Postlethwayt, dated October 2013 was tabled

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

Ms Cindy Postlethwayt and Mr Rob Dutton (represent Old Wynberg Village Society) were present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Committee was not unanimous on the heritage impacts of the proposed change in use. The majority of the committee members were not in favour of the proposed change in use for house shop purposes as this would have a

cumulative negative impact on the finely balanced heritage character of the village, the site and its streetscape.

- Committee members were of the opinion that the information submitted was insufficient in terms of the consequent adaptive re-use of the building and the use of the site as a house shop. Issues such as signage, lighting and access are not adequately addressed.
- As the committee was not unanimous in its position, the members voted on the matter. (The voting was undertaken in camera).

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade IIIA within a grade II context.

The Committee resolved to refuse the application.

NN

E.10.4 Proposed Restoration on Morgenster Farm, Farm 1319, Vergelegen Drive, Somerset West: NM HM/SOMERSET WEST/MORGENSTER FARM/FARM 1319

An application for a permit prepared by Peter John Puttick, dated 26 November 2013, photographs and plans were tabled

Mr Tertius Kruger and Mr Nellis Beyers were present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The water damage to the yellowwood floorboards of the homestead in particular requires urgent attention.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade II and it is a PHS.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposed scope of works as outlined in the letter from Revel Fox and Partners, dated 26 November 2013.

The Committee recommended that the void under the floor be increased to introduce under floor ventilation with the inclusion of unobtrusive perimeter vents.

ZS

E.11. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

E.11.1 None

E.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

E12.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 95067, Wilton House, 7 Krynauw Street, Gardens: MA

HM/GARDENS/WILTON HOUSE/ERF 95067

Case No: 130508ZS05

The matter was withdrawn from the agenda by request of the applicant.

ZS

**E.12.2 Proposed Additions to Structures on Mokaddam, Erf 173395, Leewen Street, Cape Town: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 173395/MOKADDAM**

Case No: 131015NN22E

An application for a permit and plans dated 01/01/2013 were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The site is situated within a Grade I area.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals subject to there being no negative comment from SAHRA.

NN

**E.12.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 342, Taillard Street, Arniston: NM
HM/ARNISTON/ERF 342**

Case No: 130930NN36M

An application for a permit and a Heritage Statement prepared by Raymond Smith, dated November 2013 were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Committee expressed concern regarding the number of dormer windows and their impact on the roof profile particularly in respect of the north and the east elevations.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade IIIC. It is located within a proposed heritage area and its landmark qualities contribute to the character of the area.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal subject to the replacement of the dormers on the east and west facing side of the north projecting bay with roof lights running flush with the thatched roof profile. The existing main north facing dormer should not be increased in size.

Revised plans must be submitted to the Committee.

NN

E.12.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Farm Fredericks 1602, Simondium, Paarl: MA

HM/SIMONDIUM/FARM 1602

Case No: 131106JW09M

Revised plans prepared by Malherbe Rust, dated 23/07/2013 were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation,

Ms Anne-Marie Fick was present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the revised plans.

NN

**E.12.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 94, Klein Melkboschplaas, Melkbosstrand: MA
HM/MELKBOSSTRAND/ERF94**

Case No: 110930NN30

Status Report and recommendations for uplifting the current cease works order on the Historic Homestead to be tabled

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation
SW recused herself and left the room and PB chaired this item.
GJ recused himself and joined the applicant.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that the work may proceed according to the consultant's report and on condition of the following:

- That the consultant be involved in the supervision of the work provided it is limited to the homestead only.
- Mr Jacobs reports back to the committee on a monthly basis.
- Prior to authorisation being issued HWC be provided with written confirmation concerning the use to which the building will be put.

The stop works order for the site is lifted in so far as it applies to the work that has been approved, but remains in force for any other purpose.

NN

**E.12.6 Proposed Restoration, Portion Farm Elandsfontein No 64, Farm Amalienstein Zoar, Main of Kannaland, Ladismith: MA
HM/LADISMIT/FARM AMALIENSTEIN ZOAR**

Case No: 130925NN33M

An application for a permit prepared by Anthony Davis undated, A Heritage Statement prepared by Dr Nicolas Baumann and Sarah Winter, dated March 2006 photographs and plans were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The proposals did not in all instances appear to match the information provided in the photographs of the buildings submitted.

DECISION

The Committee supports the upgrading of the cottages but requires further information on the proposed roof structures, windows and doors. It is recommended that the applicant meet with the CEO and the case officer to clarify the information needed.

NN

E.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

E.13.1 None

E.14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

E.14.1 None

E.15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

E.15.1 None

E.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

E.16.1 None

E.17 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

E.17.1 None

E.18 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

E.18.1 Comment on Application for Rezoning and Subdivision, Erf 30331, 10 Molenvliet Road, Observatory: NM HM/OBSERVATORY/ERF 30331

Case No: 130814ZS12E

Plans prepared by the City of Cape Town were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The property is located directly behind the historic Coornhoop complex.

COMMENT

The Committee is concerned by the potential impact of development that may result from the subdivision, in particular the impact on the Coornhoop complex which has high heritage significance and part of which is a declared PHS. This is particularly with regard to height, scale and massing of such a development. There is also concern that the loss of what was previously used as a parking area for Coornhoop may compromise its future viability.

It is hence recommended that the applicable controls in terms of the HPOZ and other controls for this area be rigorously applied.

E.19 Other Matters

E.19.1 None

20. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS
The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

21. CLOSURE
The meeting adjourned at **18H15**

22 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 18 December 2013

CHAIRPERSON _____ **DATE** _____

SECRETARY _____ **DATE** _____

Approved