

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING
OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Wednesday, 28 August 2013, 1st Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09H00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The meeting was officially opened at 09H14 by the chairperson, Ms Sarah Winter, and she welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms Sarah Winter	SW
Dr Stephen Townsend	ST
Mr Patrick Fefeza	PF
Mr Roger Joshua	RJ
Mr Trevor Thorold	TT
Ms Melanie Attwell	MA
Mr Tim Hart	TM

Members of Staff

Mr Andrew Hall	AH
Mr Troy Smuts	TS
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)	LM
Mr Ronny Nyuka	RN
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka	ZS
Mr Jonathan Windvogel	JW
Ms Ntombekhaya Nkoane	NN
Ms Tamar Shem-Tov	TST
Mr Olwethu Dlova (Sec)	OD
Ms Christina Jikelo	CJ
Mr Ronny Nyuka	RN

Visitors

Mr Ismail Achmat	IM
Mr Stuart Hermansen	SH
Ms Tarna Klitzner	TK
Mr Fred de Kock	FdK
Mr Ashley Lillie	AL

Ms Denae Engelbrecht	DE
Mr Mike Scurr	MS
Mr Johan Malherbe	JM
Ms Graham Jacobs	GJ
Mr Henry Aikman	HA

Observers

Ms Jacqui Marais	JM	(City of Cape Town)
------------------	----	---------------------

3. Apologies

3.1 Ms Maureen Wolters MW

4. Approval of minutes of previous meeting held 24 July 2013

4.1 The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with minor amendments.

5. Disclosure of Interest

- TH: 8.6, W.10.1 & W.11.2
- MA: W.10.1

6. Approval of Agenda

The Committee approved the agenda dated 28 August 2013 with a few amendments.

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

The CEO gave a report back that the Appeal meeting scheduled for 27 August 2013 was postponed.

The CEO reported that a decision had not yet been made on the Baboon Point appeal to the MEC's Tribunal.

ZS

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges

There were no new matters to report,

ZS

8.3 Checklist for Application- Related Decision- Making

The CEO is to complete the checklist. Mr Shiceka as acting AsD will follow up the finalisation of the checklist with the CEO.

ZS

8.4 East Fort, Hout Bay (PHS)

The CEO gave a report back on the site visit undertaken with TMNP representatives. Considerable discussion ensued regarding HWC's mandates and how to encourage and persuade the TMNP to budget properly to accommodate its responsibilities in respect of heritage resources.

The Committee requested that the CEO write to the TMNP confirming the site meeting between Park officials and HWC and bringing to its attention the concerns of the Committee. The Committee requires that an application to restore the East Fort be submitted within the next month. Failing which HWC would have no option but to issue a compulsory repair order.

TS

8.5 Report back on Elim

The Committee expressed concern that the notes of the workshop of 6 July 2013 had not yet been circulated.

The CEO gave a report back and the Committee recommended that charges had been laid with respect to unauthorised works.

The CEO is to discuss with staff members any questions raised regarding the suggestion of uneven treatment on the part of BELCom of unauthorised works.

CJ

8.6 Jacobs Ladder

TH recused himself and left the room.

The Committee noted that the following decision was made via email:

The Committee resolved to approve the proposed development subject to the following conditions:

- The stonework must be replaced as it was, as far as possible.
- Where work has been undertaken and appropriate backfilling and edging has not been undertaken, corrective measures are to be implemented
- A report including before and after photographs must be submitted to HWC on completion of the work.

ST recorded his recusal from the matter and his dismay at, in his view, HWC's actions given the City Council's competence as deemed by HWC.

SD

9. Appointments

9.1 None

FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION

W.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

W.10.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 28002, De Meule, Avenue Road, Mowbray: MA HM/MOWBRAY/ERF 28002/DE MEULE

Case No: 110713TG14E

An application for a permit prepared by Mike Scurr, dated 13 August 2013, plans prepared by Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects, dated 14 August 2013 was tabled.

MA and TH recused themselves and left the room.

Ms Tamar Shem-Tov made a power-presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The City of Cape Town supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

TS-T

**W.10.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions to Complex, Oude Leeskamer, Erf 1288, 182 Dorp Street, Stellenbosch: MA
HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 1288/OUDE LEESKAMER**

Case No: 130626TG02M

A Heritage Assessment prepared by Aikman Associates, dated June 2013, an application for a permit prepared by Henry Aikman, dated 26 June 2013, photographs and plans prepared by Fred De Kock & Partners Architects, dated April 2009 were tabled.

Ms Tamar Shem-Tov made a power-presentation

Mr Fred de Kock was present and took part in discussion

In discussion it was noted that:

- Plans had been approved by the municipality some years ago.
- No response had been received from the SHF within the 30 day commenting period
- The SIG proposed that steps be taken to address the irregularities regarding the municipality approving plans without HWC's approval. .

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the current proposal.

The Committee requested that a letter to be sent to Municipality reminding it of its responsibility to ensure that the NHRA has been complied with before it issues its own authorization.

TS-T

**W.10.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 3701, Zeederberg Square, 4 and 5 Zeederberg Street, Paarl: MA
HM/PAARL/ERF 3701/ZEEDERBERG SQUARE**

Case No: 130524TG23E

An application for a permit prepared by Robin Barnes, photographs and plans prepared by HH Architects, dated 13 August 2013 was tabled.

Ms Tamar Shem-Tov made a power-presentation.

Mr Stuart Hermansen was present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Paarl 300 and Drakenstein Municipality supported the proposal
The DHF did not support the previous proposal to remove the steel plate tiles. .

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals and maintenance plan and requires that Mr S Hermansen continue to be involved in the specification and administration of the works.

TS-T

**W.10.4 Proposed Reconstruction of the Verandah and Details of Stadzticht, Erf 4163,
19 Victoria Street, Paarl: NM
HM/PAARL/ERF 4163/STADTZICHT**

Case No: 130814JW10M

An application for a permit prepared by Johan Malherbe, dated 14 August 2013, Comments from Drakenstein Municipality, DHF and Paarl 300, photographs and plans prepared by Malherbe Rust Architects, dated July 2013 were tabled

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-presentation

Mr Johan Malherbe was present and took part in discussion

In discussion it was noted that:

- AKSO, DHF and P300 support the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be a Grade II and it is Provincial Heritage Site.

The Committee resolved to approve the application subject to Mr Malherbe being retained to supervise the work.

JW

**W.10.5 Proposed Upgrade of Electrical Services Infrastructures on Farm 237
(Vogelstruyskraal), Elim: NM
HM/ELIM FARM 237/VOGELSTRUYSKRAAL**

An application for a permit prepared by Christo Botha, dated 6 August 2013, Preliminary Heritage Report, prepared by Graham Jacobs, dated 15 December 2012, photographs and plans prepared by C Botha, dated 25 January 2013 were tabled

Mr Graham Jacobs and Ms Denae Engelbrecht (representing MCSA) were present and took part in discussion.

Mr Troy Smuts made a power-presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The matter must be referred to APM in terms of archaeological requirements.
- The MCSA had no objection to the proposal.

SUSPENDED DECISION

The Committee resolved that:

- The permit for the proposed upgrade of electrical services may be granted.
- The electrical services along Church Street must be placed underground to mitigate the visual impact.
- A plan be submitted indicating the position of the electrical junction boxes to the individual buildings for approval (Mr Jacobs must advise on the appropriate location).

This decision is suspended until such time that the owner has given its consent and signed Annexure A.

TS

W.11 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

**W.11.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 16, Stofbergfontein, Langebaan Lagoon, West Coast: NM
HM/LANGEBAAN LAGOON/ERF 16/STOFBERGSFONTEIN**

Case No: 130726TG33E

An application for a permit prepared by Graham Jacobs, dated 26 July 2013, A Heritage Statement and Motivation prepared by Graham Jacobs, dated 26 July 2013 were tabled

Ms Tamar Shem-Tov made a power-presentation

Mr Graham Jacobs was present and took part in discussion

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building is not conservation-worthy in its own right but is located within landscape of considerable heritage significance.

SUSPENDED DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade IIIC within a Grade II context

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition.

This decision is suspended until the signature of the Stofbergfontein Home Owners Association has been obtained.

TS-T

**W.11.2 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 172912, Vasco da Gama Tavern, Alfred Street, Cape Town: MA
HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 172912/VASCO DA GAMA TAVERN**

Case No: 130611TG14E

A Phase I Heritage Impact Assessment Report prepared by Chris Snelling, dated June 2009, an application for a permit, photographs and comments from the Heritage Resources Section, City of Cape Town, dated 16 May 2013 and a Heritage Statement prepared by Ashley Lillie were tabled

Mr TH recused himself

Ms Tamar Shem-Tov made a power-presentation.

Mr Ashley Lillie was present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The City of Cape Town had requested a social study and was in support of the incorporation of the existing building into a new development rather than total demolition. The committee did not think that this was necessary as it could see how such study could affect the building in question or its conservation or otherwise.
- A meeting between HWC and SAHRA had been undertaken and HWC's responsibilities of co-operative governance had been satisfied. SAHRA has approved the reinterment of any relics in the ossuary.
- The social historical significance of the area is great but the extent to which the building represents a marker of this significance is questionable.
- The character of the area has been considerably altered.
- The retention of a remnant of the building and its incorporation into a new development is not warranted in this case.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade IIIC.

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition.

TS-T

W.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

W.12.1 Proposed Alterations and Landscaping on Erf 1121, Klein Constantia Estate, Klein Constantia Road, Constantia: MA HM/CONSTANTIA/ERF 1121/KLEIN CONSTANTIA ESTATE

Case No: 130611TG16E

An application for a permit prepared by Christiaan van Awegen, dated 12 June 2013, Landscaping Analysis Report and Landscape Proposal prepared by Franchesca Watson Garden Designer and Tarna Klitzner Landscape Architect, dated 10 June 2013 were tabled

Ms Tamar Shem-Tov made a power-presentation.

Ms Tarna Klitzner and Mr Mike Scurr were present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The City of Cape Town and CPOA supported the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade II.

The Committee resolved to approve the landscaping proposal.

TS-T

**W.12.2 Proposed Internal Alterations on Erf 1282, Beautiful Life, No 72 and 74 Bree Street, Cape Town: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 1282/BEAUTIFUL LIFE**

Case No: 130726TG34E

An application for a permit prepared by Graham Jacobs, dated 26 July 2013, a Heritage Statement and Motivation prepared by Graham Jacobs, dated 26 July 2013 was tabled.

Ms Tamar Shem-Tov made a power-presentation.

Mr Jacobs was present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- City of Cape Town supported the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade IIIB.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

TS-T

**W.12.3 Proposed Restoration on Erf 3788, Marks Building, Parliament Street, Cape Town: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 3788/MARKS BUILDING**

Case No: 130814TG15M

An application for a permit prepared by Albert Willemse, dated 14 August 2013, a Heritage Statement prepared by Stuart Hermansen, dated August 2013, photographs and plans prepared by ACA Architects, dated March 2013 were tabled

Ms Tamar Shem-Tov made a power-presentation.

Mr Stuart Hermansen was present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- City of Cape Town supports the proposal and recommends that slate tiles should be considered to replace the asbestos cement tiles on the mansard roof.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade II.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposed maintenance work. All work is to be overseen and administered by the heritage architect. A Completion Report including the architectural details must be submitted to HWC.

The Committee strongly recommends that the reinstatement of Brosely or other similar terra cotta roof tiles be investigated.

TS-T

W.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

W.13.1 None

W. 14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

W.14.1 None

W.15. PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

W.15.1 None

W.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

W.16.1 None

W.17. PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

W.17.1 None

W.18. REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

W.18.1 None

W.19. Other Matters

**W.19.1 Application for Departures on Erf 1324, Stellenbosch: NM
HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 1324**

Case No: 130807TG07E

Ms Tamar Shem-Tov made a power-presentation

COMMENT

The Committee is of the opinion that the proposals are entirely inappropriate in the context of Dorp Street which is worthy of grade II heritage status. HWC requires that it be informed by the Stellenbosch Municipality of any decision on the consent and departures application and advised of its right to appeal.

Should this or other similar designs be approved HWC will consider the use of S29 of the NHRA in order to protect the grade II heritage status character of Dorp Street.

TS-T

SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION

E.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

**E.10.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 10166, 56 Rose Street, Bo-Kaap: NM
HM/BO-KAAP/ERF 10166**

Case No: 130618NN14E

An application for a permit, plans and motivation prepared by Bo-kaap Civic Association, dated 11 June 2013 were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposals as they are and to give design advice. The committee discussed several improvements that Ms Shem-Tov should discuss with the applicant's architect.

NN

**E.10.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Vlakkeland, Jan van Riebeck Drive, Erf 19519, Paarl: NM
HM/PAARL/ERF 19519**

Draft Heritage Impact Assessment Report, prepared by Aikman Associates Heritage Management, dated August 2013 was tabled.

Mr Shaun Dyers made a power-presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Council has confirmed the grade II status of this PHS.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition of the unauthorised building and the construction of the proposed two new buildings.

The proposals for the historical buildings are not approved. More detailed analysis of the historical fabric of these buildings is required.

The Committee requires the input of a conservation architect to advise on the interventions and detailing.

SD

E.11. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

E.11.1 None

E.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

**E.12.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, 6 Moor Street, Erf 64954, Kenilworth: NM
HM/KENILWORTH/ERF 64954**

Case No: 130812NN09E

Application and plans prepared by Design, dated 27 December 2013 was tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-presentation

DECISION

The Committee decided the building to be ungradable and the proposals are approved.

NN

**E.12.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, House Countinho and Claassens, Erf 899, 297B Ocean Drive, Fresnaye: MA
HM/FRESNAYE/ERF 899**

Case No: 120712NN14E

Plans prepared by B Crowsen of Crowsen Creations, dated 06/13, Drawing number 01-joe-14 was tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee decided the building to be ungradable and the proposals are approved.

NN

E.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

E.13.1 None

E.14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

E.14.1 None

E.15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

E.15.1 None

E.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

E.16.1 None

E.17 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

E.17.1 None

E.18 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

E.18.1 None

E.19 Other Matters

E.19.1 None

20. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

21. CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at

15H05

22 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

25 September 2013

CHAIRPERSON _____

DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

DATE _____

APPROVED