

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,  
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)  
Held on Wednesday, 29 June 2016 at the 1<sup>st</sup> Floor Boardroom, at the Offices of  
the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,  
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09:00**

---

**1. Opening and Welcome**

The Chairperson Ms Sarah Winter officially opened the meeting at 09:05 and welcomed everyone present.

**2. Attendance**

**Members**

Ms Sarah Winter	SW
Mr Mike Scurr	MS
Ms Belinda Mutti	BM
Mr Peter Buttgens	PB
Mr Stuart Hermansen	SH
Mr Graham Jacobs	GJ
Mr Rowen Ruiters	RR

**Members of Staff**

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka	ZS
Ms Jenna Lavin	JL
Mr Jonathan Windvogel	JW
Mr Andrew September	AS
Ms Waseefa Dhansay	WD
Mr Olwethu Oz Dlova (Sec)	OD
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)	LM
Ms Penny Meyer	PM
Ms Katherine Robinson	KR
Ms Colette Scheermeyer	CS
Ms Heidi Boise	HB

**Visitors**

Mr Derek Chittenden	DC	Mr Pascal Righini	PR
Ms Lauren Hill	LH	Mr Samuel Nherera	SN
Mr Gary Hill	GH	Mr Johan Cornelius	JC
Mr Ashley Lillie	AL	Mr Chris Snelling	CS
Mr Riaz Ebrahim	RE	Mr Johann Slee	JS
Mr A Krynauw	AR		

**Observers**

None

**3. Apologies**

Mr Mxolisi Dlamuka MD

**4. Approval of Agenda**

**4.1 Dated 29 June 2016**

The Committee approved the agenda dated 29 June 2016 with minor amendments.

**5 Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting**

**5.1 Dated 25 May 2016**

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with minor amendments.

**5.2 Dated 31 May 2016**

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with minor amendments.

**6. Disclosure of Interest**

- SH: item 11.6
- MS: item 8.8 and
- GJ: item 11.2 and 8.2.1

**7. Confidential Matters**

7.1 None

**8. Administrative Matters**

**8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees**

PM reported back on the following appeals matters:

- Howe Street, Observatory

PM

**8.2 Report Back on Stop Works Orders and Charges**

**8.2.1 Illegal Work - Erf 9649 - Lourens Street, Somerset West**

WD reported on the extensive unauthorised work undertaken on the property and the decision by the CEO to lay charges.

The Committee fully supported the decision to lay charges given that the property owner was fully aware of the permitting requirements of Section 27. The unauthorised work including alterations to historic fabric and new construction has severely and irreversibly damaged heritage significance.

The property forms a significant component of a heritage context worthy of grade II status and the exact extent to which its grade II status has been damaged needs to be identified and monetary compensation quantified.

WD

**8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings Refused for Demolition**

JL reported back that HWC Council has approved the draft regulations for placing buildings on the heritage register.

JL

**8.4 Workshop on Guidelines for Heritage Statements**

It was reported that the notes of the workshop on heritage statements had been circulated with the agenda and the Committee undertook to discuss the matter further.

JL

## **8.5 Erf 145189, 10 Upper Lady Grey Street, Paarl**

WD reported that the applicant will be submitting revised plans with the carport omitted. The Committee agreed that the revised plans do not need to come back to BELCom.

**WD**

## **8.6 Unauthorized Work, Erf 656, 110 Dorp Street, Stellenbosch**

The Committee resolved that it would not consider the revised proposals until the matter of the unauthorised work has been concluded. This unauthorised work includes raising the eaves of the back wing, chasing services into historic fabric and the use of inappropriate materials. The Committee recommends that HWC lay charges.

**KR**

## **8.7 St Mary's Church, Stellenbosch**

The legal advisor indicated that she will contact the Bishop in order to obtain co-operation within the Church.

**PM**

## **8.8 Erf 149294, 19 Dock Road, V&A Waterfront**

MS recused himself.

The Committee noted that extensive unauthorised work has been undertaken and that work is ongoing. The Committee requests that a stop works order be issued and requires that an assessment of the impact of unauthorised work on heritage significance be undertaken by a suitably qualified and experienced heritage practitioner.

**JW**

## **9. Standing items**

### **9.1 Site Inspections**

The following site inspections undertaken by Committee members and staff were noted:

- Proposed Partial Demolition, Restoration, Additions and Alterations, Erf 6156, De Volkskombuis Restaurant, Aan-De-Wagenweg, Stellenbosch
- Proposed New Buildings and Alterations on Erf 696, 4 The Grove Lane, Green Point
- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 10866-Re, 10869-Re, Woodstock
- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 1487 - 15 Davenport Road, Vredehoek
- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 10868-Re, 3 Davison Street, Woodstock
- Proposed Total Demolition, Rem of Erf 10870, 83 Albert Road, Woodstock
- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 10877-Re, 77 Albert Road, Woodstock
- Proposed Development, Erf 10878-Re, 8 Grey Street, Woodstock
- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 31353, 12 Spin Street, Rosebank, Cape Town

- Proposed Alteration & Additions to Erf 721, 34 Queens Road, Bantry Bay
- Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 8988, 22 Plein Street Paarl
- Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 2051, Old Post Office, Corner of Bird and Plein Street, Stellenbosch Proposed Additions to Erf 95443, 8 Dunkley Road, Gardens
- Proposed Alterations to Farm 6/153, Hendrikse Street, Stellenbosch

The following site inspections undertaken by staff were noted:

- Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 2051, Old Post Office, Corner of Bird and Plein Street, Stellenbosch
- Proposed Alterations to Farm 6/153, Hendrikse Street, Stellenbosch
- Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 8988, 22 Plein Street Paarl
- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 31353, 12 Spin Street, Rosebank, Cape Town
- Proposed Partial Demolition, Restoration, Additions and Alterations, Erf 6156, De Volkskombuis Restaurant, Aan-De-Wagenweg, Stellenbosch

PM

## 10. Appointments

10.1 None

## MATTERS DISCUSSED

### 11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

#### 11.1 Proposed Partial Demolition, Addition, Restoration & Alteration to Farm 6/153, Hendrikse Street, Stellenbosch: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSCH/FARM6/153

**Case No:** 16041911HB0511E

A Heritage Report prepared by Stuart Hermansen dated 14 March 2016 to be tabled.

The matter was removed from the agenda and will be dealt with on the 5<sup>th</sup> July 2016 under Section 34 matters.

HB

#### 11.2 Proposed Rezoning and Consent-Use for Josephine Mill, Erf 96664, 13 Boundary Road, Newlands: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/NEWLANDS/ERF 96664

**Case No:** 1512409AS0209M

A draft Conservation Strategy was tabled.

GJ recused himself and joined the applicant

Mr Andrew September made a power-point presentation.

Mr Derek Chittenden was present and took part in discussion.

The matter was deferred to the next BELCom meeting to be held on the 5<sup>th</sup> July 2016 in order for the legal advisor to review the strategy

**AS**

**11.3 Proposed New Buildings and Alterations on Erf 696, 4 The Grove Lane, Green Point: MA  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN\GREEN POINT\ERF 696**

**Case No:** 16041312GT0415E

GJ and MS reported back on their site inspection.

**DECISION**

The Committee decided that the grading of the building should be IIIA in terms of its high architectural qualities and recommends that this matter be referred to IGIC. The building does not warrant grade II status.

The Committee was supportive of some aspects of the proposals particularly the proposed boundary treatment, access arrangements and the location of the carport. However, there are concerns with the proposed new terrace including its architectural treatment, the demolition of the adjacent historic outbuilding and the return of the new terrace wing into the site.

There are various aspects to the proposed interventions to the house that will have a cumulative negative impact on its architectural quality and integrity. These include the proposed attic, the size of the opening between the two front rooms, the removal of the fire place and the placing of the staircase.

Due to the concerns raised, the Committee resolved not to approve the proposals in their current form and requires the submission of revised proposals to HWC for approval by BELCOM.

**GT**

**11.4 Proposed Additions to Erf 9547, C/O Adringa & Dorp Streets, Stellenbosch: NM  
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/ STELLENBOSCH/ERF 9547**

**Case No:** 16060105HB0601M

Drawings prepared by Galana Project Architects - STH/sp/001 - STH/sp/003 dated August 2015 were tabled

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

Mr Gary Hill and Mr Samuel Nherera were present and took part in discussion.

**DECISION**

The Committee noted the comments of the Stellenbosch Interest Group.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals as having no impact on the heritage significance of the site. The Committee is of the opinion that the court yard space has already been significantly compromised and does not contribute to the significance of the site.

Approval is subject to the submission of detailed drawings with sections indicating the impact of the proposals on the courtyard and junctions between the proposed glass conservatory and existing built fabric. To be submitted for stamping by the case officer.

HB

**11.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 656, 110 Dorp Street, Stellenbosch: MA  
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSCH/EEF 656**

**Case No:** 16061503KR0615M

The matter was dealt with under Item 8.6.

KR

**11.6 Proposed Additions to existing Structure and Alterations to Erf 796, 103 Dorp Street, Stellenbosch: MA  
HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 796**

**Case No:** 111012ZS12

Drawings were tabled.

SH recused himself for this item.

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

**DECISION**

The Committee was of the opinion that the unauthorised work has not negatively impacted on heritage significance, particularly the Dorp Street streetscape. The Committee resolved not to revoke the permit. The Committee requires the submission of a full set of as-built drawings for the record.

HB

**12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION**

**12.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 26939, Observatory: NM  
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/OBSERVATORY/ERF 26939**

**Case No:** 15080413HB1022E

A Heritage Report prepared by Andrew Pratt, dated 10 August 2015 & February 2016 and revised proposals were tabled.

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal as it addresses the previous concerns raised.

HB

**12.2 Proposed Total Demolition Erf 31353, 12 Spin Street, Rosebank: MA  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ROSEBANK/ERF 31353**

**Case No:** 16041115KR0413E

GJ, SW and MS and PB reported back on their site inspection.

**DECISION**

It was noted that the City has graded the building IIIA.

It was noted that the condition of the building is beyond repair. However, the building is a rare example of a corrugated iron building in this area and it is located within a HPOZ with a general consistency in terms of height, roof shape, setback and street interface. The building retains a number of surviving period elements which are still intact. These include doors, windows, veranda colonnade and corrugated iron cladding and roof sheeting.

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition subject to the replacement building being submitted to HWC for approval by BELCom. The replacement building must respond positively to the character of the historical built environment and incorporate the reuse of surviving period elements. Demolition may not proceed until the design of the replacement building has been approved by BELCom.

**KR**

**12.3 Proposed Total Demolition Erf 939, 43 Upper Albert Road, Tamboerskloof: NM  
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/TAMBOERSKLOOF/ERF 939**

**Case No:** 16031605JW0401E

Plans, photographs and other documents were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection (SW, MS, PB and GJ).

**JW**

**12.4 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 177420, 21 Wheelan Road, Newlands: NM  
HM/ CAPE METROPOLITAN/NEULANDS/ ERF 177420**

**Case No:** 16041902HB0531E

Drawings and subdivision plan were tabled.

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to conduct a site inspection (SW, MS, PB and GJ).

**HB**

**12.5 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 334, 21 Victoria Road, Bantry Bay: NM HM/ CAPE METROPOLITAN/BANTRY BAY/ ERF 334**

**Case No:** 16050501HB23E

A Heritage Report prepared by Dave Saunders dated March 2016 was tabled.

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to conduct a site inspection (SW, MS, PB and GJ).

**HB**

**12.6 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 1487, 15 Davenport Road, Vredehoek: MA HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/VREDEHOEK/ERF 1487**

**Case No:** 16031526WD0413E

MS and GJ reported back on their site inspection.

**DECISION**

The Committee is of the opinion that the building has insufficient heritage significance to warrant formal protection. However, the building is located within a proposed HPOZ and therefore demolition is approved subject to the proposals for the replacement building being submitted to HWC for approval by BELCom.

**WD**

**12.7 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 10866-Re, 10869-Re, Woodstock: MA HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/WOODSTOCK/ERF 10865-RE, 10866-RE, 10869-RE**

**Case No:** 16041303JW0420E

SW, MS and GJ reported back on their site inspection.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition subject to the replacement development being submitted to BELCom for approval.

The building has insufficient heritage significance to warrant formal grading. However the site is located within an existing/ proposed HPOZ.

**JW**

**12.8 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 10868-Re, 3 Davison Street, Woodstock: MA HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/WOODSTOCK/ERF 10868-RE**

**Case No:** 16041302

SW, MS and GJ reported back on their site inspection.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition subject to the replacement development being submitted to BELCom for approval.



The building has insufficient heritage significance to warrant formal grading. However the site is located within an existing/ proposed HPOZ.

JW

**12.9 Proposed Total Demolition, Rem of Erf 108070, 83 Albert Road, Woodstock: MA  
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/WOODSTOCK/ERF 10870-RE**

**Case No: 16041306JW0415E**

GJ, SW, MS and GJ reported back on their site inspection.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition subject to the replacement development being submitted to BELCom for approval.

The building has insufficient heritage significance to warrant formal grading. However the site is located within an existing/ proposed HPOZ

JW

**12.10 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 10877-Re, 77 Albert Road, Woodstock: MA  
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/WOODSTOCK/ERF 10877-RE**

**Case No: 16041305JW0415E**

GJ, SW, MS and GJ reported back on their site inspection.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition subject to the replacement development being submitted to BELCom for approval.

The building has insufficient heritage significance to warrant formal grading. However the site is located within an existing/ proposed HPOZ

JW

**12.11 Proposed Development, Erf 10878-Re, 8 Grey Street, Woodstock: MA  
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/WOODSTOCK/ERF10878-RE**

**Case No: 16041304JW0415E**

GJ, SW, MS and GJ reported back on their site inspection.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition subject to the replacement development being submitted to BELCom for approval.

The building has insufficient heritage significance to warrant formal grading. However the site is located within an existing/ proposed HPOZ

JW

**12.12 Ptn 686 of Farm Blaauwklip 501, Webersvallei Road, Jamestown: MA  
HM/JAMESTOWN/PTN OF FARM 510**

**Case No: 15060108JW0601E**

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition subject to further discussions between the Jamestown heritage society and the applicant in finalising the recommendations of Professor Burden. The final outcome of these discussions must be submitted to the case officer for record purposes.

**JW**

**13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL  
DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**13.1 Proposed Additions to Existing Structure, Erf 46472, 165 Main Road  
Rondebosch: MA  
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/RONDEBOSCH/ ERF 46472**

**Case No: 16012104HB0127E**

Mr Chris Snelling and Mr A Krynauw were present and took part in the discussion.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved that the building is not conservation worthy and it would have no objection to its demolition. The Committee resolved to approve the proposals.

**HB**

**14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS**

**14.1** None

**15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT**

**15.1** None

**16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL**

**16.1** None

**17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS**

**17.1** None

**18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS**

**18.1** None

**19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE**

**19.1** None

**20 OTHER MATTERS**

20.1 None

**21. NON COMPLIANCE**

21.1 None

**22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS**

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

**23. CLOSURE**

The meeting adjourned at: **15:30**

**24. DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 5 July 2016**

**CHAIRPERSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE** \_\_\_\_\_

**SECRETARY** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE** \_\_\_\_\_

Approved