

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,  
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)  
Held on Wednesday, 2 December 2015 at the 1<sup>st</sup> Floor Boardroom, at the  
Offices of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,  
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09:00**

---

**1. Opening and Welcome**

The Chairperson Ms Sarah Winter officially opened the meeting at 09:05 and welcomed everyone present.

**2. Attendance**

**Members**

Ms Sarah Winter	SW
Ms Belinda Mutti	BM
Mr Peter Buttgens	PB
Mr Rowen Ruiters	RR
Mr Graham Jacobs	GJ
Mr Stuart Hermansen	SH

**Members of Staff**

Dr Errol Myburg	EM
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka	ZS
Ms Jenna Lavin	JL
Ms Penny Meyer	PM
Mr Guy Thomas	GT
Mr Jonathan Windvogel	JW
Mr Andrew September	AS
Ms Heidi Boise	HB
Ms Waseefa Dhansay	WD
Mr Olwethu Oz Dlova (Sec)	OD
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)	LM
Ms Katherine Robinson	KR

**Visitors**

Mr Luke Croker	LC	Mr Adam Voigt	AV
Mr Tyrone Engel	TE	Mr Ron Martin	RM
Mr Henry Aikman	HA	Mr Johan Malherbe	JM
Ms Sarah-Jane Jackson	S-JJ	Mr Johan Cornelius	JC
Mr John Edgar	JE	Mr C King	CK
Mr Matthew Beatty	MB	Mr Nic Ray	NR
Mr Jacques van Niekerk	JvN	Mr Jayson Clark	JC
Mr Anthony Silberberg	AS		

**Observers**

**3. Apologies**

Mr Mike Scurr MS

**4. Approval of Agenda**

**4.1 Dated 2 December 2015**

The Committee approved the agenda dated 2 December 2015 with minor amendments.

**5 Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting**

**5.1 Dated 11 November 2015**

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes without amendments.

## **6. Disclosure of Interest**

6.1 None

## **7. Confidential Matters**

7.1 None

## **8. Administrative Matters**

### **8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees**

PM reported back on the following appeals matters:

- Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 14363, Lodge Laan 1, Wellington: Section 34
- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 55150, 12 Hugon Road, Claremont: Section 34
- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 304, 28 Scott Street and Erf 303 26 Scott Street, Cape Town CBD: Section 34
- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 689, 3 Hall Road Sea Point: Section 34

**PM**

### **8.2 Report Back on Stop Works Orders and Charges**

AS reported back that a stop works order had been issued for Erf 176, 29 Mutley Road, Sea Point

**PM**

### **8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings Refused for Demolition**

It was noted that there were no matters to report.

**ZS**

### **8.4 Drostdy Museum, PHS Section 27, Swellendam**

PM gave a report back on the matter.

**WD**

## **9. Standing items**

### **9.1 Site Inspections**

The following site inspections undertaken by Committee members were noted:

- Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 882, 10 Romney Road, Green Point - Total Demolition
- Erf 50248, 2 Buchan Road, Newlands
- Proposed Alterations, Additions and Partial Demolition on Erf 168, Free Masons Hall, Malmesbury
- Proposed Alterations, Additions and Partial Demolition Erf 4018, 4 & 6 Vredenberg Lane, Cape Town

**PM**

**10. Appointments**

10.1 None.

**MATTERS DISCUSSED**

**11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS**

**11.1 Proposed Addition to Existing Structures - Erf 237, 27 New Street, Elim: NM  
HM/OVERBERG / CAPE AGULHAS / ELIM**

**Case No:** 15110601HB1111E

A Heritage Statement prepared by Tyrone Engel dated October 2015 and drawings dated October 2015 were tabled

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

Mr Tyrone Engel was present and took part in discussion.

**DECISION**

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be IIIC within the context of the PHS.

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposals given their negative impact on the significance of the streetscape and the nature of private public interface. The Committee was of the opinion that the extension of the building to the side lane would have a negative impact on the pattern of built form and spaces characterising the settlement.

**HB**

**11.2 Proposed Addition to Existing Structures- Erf 11310,101 Marsh Street, Mossel  
Bay: NM  
HM/EDEN/MOSSEL BAY/ERF 11310**

**Case No:** 15102604

Revised drawings prepared were tabled.

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals as they will not adversely impact the heritage significance of the site. Approval is subject to the linking element not being attached to the church in order to ensure that the stone work is not damaged. Any landscaping interventions will need to be submitted to HWC as part of a separate Section 27 application.

**HB**

**11.3 Proposed Alterations, Illegal Work, Bartolomeu Diaz Museum, Mossel Bay: MA HM/EDEN/MOSSEL BAY/ERF 2993, 3032, 3034, 3046, 3050, 3051, 3057, 3060, ETC**

**Case No:** 15111001HB1109E

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The site inspection was conducted on the 31 July 2015
- The Museum has plans to do further work on the precinct.
- The Committee recommended that a conservation management plan be compiled for the precinct.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve emergency plaster work on condition that the appropriate lime renders are used.

With respect to the remaining work, the Committee resolved to request a heritage statement to assess the following:

- The heritage significance of the site including the authenticity of building fabric.
- The impact of unauthorised work on heritage significance; and
- The impact of the proposed work on heritage significance.

All construction work is to be supervised by an architect with sufficient and appropriate heritage expertise.

**HB**

**12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION**

**12.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 1079, 28 Vredehoek Avenue, Vredehoek: MA HM/CAPE TOWN/ VREDEHOEK/ERF 1079**

**Case No:** 15071004HB0715E

An application for demolition dated 14 July 2015 was tabled.

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

Mr Luke Croker and Mr Adam Voigt were present and took part in discussion

The Committee advised that drawings be submitted indicating the scale, massing and proportions of the proposed development in relation to its surrounding context. The Committee also advised that the City's guidelines for development within a HPOZ be consulted with particular reference to building height and massing, roof treatment boundary treatment and building setback.

**HB**

**12.2 Proposed Total Demolition for Erf 5396, 15 Contour Road, Mossel River West, Hermanus: NM  
HM/OVERBERG / OVERSTRAND / HERMANUS / MOSSEL RIVER WEST**

**Case No:** 15110912HB1109E

A Heritage Statement prepared by Ron Martin Heritage Consultancy was tabled.

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

Mr Ron Martin was present and took part in discussion.

GJ abstained from the decision making.

**DECISION**

The Committee noted that the approved Overstrand Heritage Survey had graded the site as IIIC. It recommended that the site be investigated for regrading as IIIB.

The Committee was of the opinion that the building has sufficient heritage significance to warrant formal protection particularly in terms of its intrinsic architectural and aesthetic value and its relationship with its setting.

The Committee resolved not to approve the demolition.

**HB**

**12.3 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 882, 10 Romney Road, Green Point - Total Demolition: MA  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/GREEN POINT/ERF 882**

**Case No:** 15100503KR1007E

GJ, SH, SW and PB reported back on their site inspection.

Mr Johan Cornelius, Mr John Edgar and Mr C King were present.

In discussion it was noted that:

- GJ, SH, PB, SW and MS had inspected the site together with a representative of Green Point Residents and Ratepayers Association and the heritage consultant.

**DECISION**

The Committee decided that the building and its context have insufficient heritage significance to warrant formal protection. The Committee resolved to approve the demolition.

**KR**

**12.4 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 2668, Wellington: NM  
HM/ CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / WELLINGTON**

**Case No:** 15100807HB1014E

A Heritage Statement prepared by Aikman Associates, dated October 2015 was tabled.

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

Mr Henry Aikman was present and took part in discussion.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition given that the building has insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention and protection.

**HB**

**13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL  
DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**13.1 Proposed Alterations, Additions and Partial Demolition, Erf 50248, 2 Buchan  
Road, Newlands: MA  
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/NEWLANDS/ERF 50248**

**Case No:** 15091507HB1012E

GJ and PB reported back on their site inspection.

Mr Matthew Beatty and Mr Nic Ray were present and took part in the discussion.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved that the building and its context have insufficient heritage value to warrant formal protection.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals.

**HB**

**13.2 Proposed Addition to Existing Structures & Alteration- Erf 453, 80 Waterkant  
Street, Cape Town: MA**

**Case No:** 1511807HB1120E

A Heritage Statement prepared by Aikman Associates, dated November 2015 and drawings (Mu\_00 - Mu\_09 & street perspective) prepared by L & L Architects dated 15 November 2015 were tabled.

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- City's HRS and the De Waterkant conservation body have no objection to the revised proposal

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal as having addressed previous concerns.

**HB**

**13.3 Proposed Alterations on Erf 9986, 156 Waterkant Street, De Waterkant: NM  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/DE WATERKANT/ERF 9986**

**Case No:** 15101502GT1016E

An application as well as previous approved plans (Lad\_101 Rev A and new plans Lad\_101 Rev B) were tabled.

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

Mr Jacques van Niekerk was present and took part in the discussion.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals as they will have minimal impact on heritage resources.

**GT**

**13.4 Proposed Alterations, Additions and Partial Demolition on Erf 168, Free  
Masons Hall, Malmesbury: MA  
HM/WEST COAST/SWARTLAND/ MALMESBURY/ERF 168**

**Case No:** 14110514KR0313M

SH, SW and GJ reported back on their site inspection.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to recommend to the CEO that HWC charges be laid against the owner in terms of S 51 of the NHRA. The Committee was of the opinion that the unauthorised work has had a cumulative negative impact on the heritage significance of a building worthy of grade IIIA heritage status. The extent of unauthorised work which has damaged heritage significance has included *inter alia* the following:

- The removal of period fixtures and fittings including the foundation stone;
- The replacement of the corrugated iron roof with IBR;
- The filling in of the ceremonial space;
- Inappropriate flashings and downpipes;
- The painting over of ceiling decoration;
- The removal of the timber stage; and
- The external retaining wall along the south elevation.

The Committee requires that the exposed brickwork on the external faces be patched using an appropriate lime based render.

The remaining proposed work will not be considered until the outcome of the recommend charges has been resolved.

**KR**

**13.5 Proposed Alterations, Additions and Partial Demolition Erf 4018, 4 & 6  
Vredenberg Lane, Cape Town: MA  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ERF 4018**

**Case No:** 15100502KR1007E

SW, GJ and SH reported back on their site inspection.

Mr Johan Cornelius was present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The City has graded the building IIIB
- The Committee is of the opinion that the primary significance of the building is the front façade and its contribution to the streetscape.
- While the Committee was initially concerned about the impact of the height of the proposed addition, the site inspection and visual material demonstrated that the addition will not be prominently viewed.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals subject to the following conditions:

- That the new addition be finished in a dark tone to minimise its visual impact as a backdrop to the surrounding streetscapes;
- That the front façade be adequately propped and protected during construction.

**KR**

**13.6 Proposed Alterations and Partial Demolition on Erf 4431, Cheve House, Paarl:  
MA  
CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 4431**

**Case No:** 15090802HB0910E

Revised drawings (S-200 Rev A 101 Rev B, 201 Rev C) dated 13 November 2015) and prepared by Malherbe Rust Architects were tabled.  
Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

Mr Johan Malherbe and Ms Sarah-Jane Jackson were present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The DHF had submitted comments on the revised proposals but as these were submitted on the day of BELCom they were not able to be tabled at this meeting.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals as having met concerns previously raised. Approval is subject to the recording of historic fabric and methods of the new interventions and for this record to be included in a closeout report to be submitted to HWC within 30 days of practical completion.

**HB**



**13.7 Proposed Alteration- Erf 457, 80 Church Street, Worcester: NM  
CAPE WINELANDS / BREEDE VALLEY / WORCESTER**

**Case No:** 15090306HB0903E

Plans W15-103-CS-01 & W15-103-CS-02 prepared by I2 Architects dated 20 March 2015 was tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Ms Ron Martin was present and took part in discussion.

**DECISION**

The Committee decided that the grading of the building to be IIIB and noted that the building is situated within an important streetscape.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals subject to following conditions:

- That the fence be located behind the boundary wall approximately 10cm from the rear wall face,.
- That the revised proposals be submitted to the Committee for approval.
- That revised proposals be accompanied by 1:5 scale detail drawings of the fencing, gates and fixtures.

**JW**

**13.8 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Ervern 567/7/8, 31 Berverde Road,  
Oranjezicht: MA  
HM/ORANJEZICHT/ERVERN 567/7/8**

**Case No:** 14072812JW0909E

Revised plans were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection (GJ, SW, PB and SH/MS)

**JW**

**13.9 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 186, Wylie Store, Le Roux & Kie, van  
der Stel Street, Tulbagh: NM  
HM/TULBAGH/ERF 186**

**Case No:** 1511170JW1117E

An Application for a permit, photographs and plans were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr Jayson Clark and Mr Antony Mr Anthony Silberberg were present and took part in the discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building has been graded IIIB.
- Mr Silberberg expressed concern that Mr Clark had a conflict of interest as both the heritage consultant on the project and a member of the Tulbagh Valley Heritage Association
- The Chairperson requested Mr Clark to clarify his position in this regard and he indicated that he had recused himself from commenting on the application as a member of the Tulbagh Valley Heritage Association.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee supported the proposals in principle. However, it expressed concern with the detailing of the front veranda and the height of the front boundary wall.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals subject to the following conditions:

- That the veranda colonnade consists of simple timber supports in order to distinguish it as a contemporary element.
- That the height of the front boundary wall be reduced to 600mm.

The above mention approval does not address the unauthorised alteration of the rear boundary wall. The Committee requires that the services of a land surveyor be obtained to establish whether the boundary wall is located on the adjacent PHS.

**JW**

#### **14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS**

14.1 None

#### **15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT**

15.1 None

#### **16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL**

16.1 None

#### **17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS**

17.1 None

#### **18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS**

18.1 None

#### **19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE**

19.1 None

#### **20 OTHER MATTERS**

20.1 None

#### **21. NON COMPLIANCE**

21.1 None

**22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS**

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

**23. CLOSURE**

The meeting adjourned at:

**24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:**

**To be announced**

**CHAIRPERSON**\_\_\_\_\_

**DATE**\_\_\_\_\_

**SECRETARY**\_\_\_\_\_

**DATE**\_\_\_\_\_

Approved