

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING
OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Wednesday, 30 January 2013, 1st Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09H00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The meeting was officially opened at 09H30 by the chairperson, Ms Sarah Winter, and she welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms Sarah Winter	SW
Ms Maureen Wolters	MW
Mr Roger Joshua	RJ
Mr Trevor Thorold	TT
Ms Melanie Attwell	MA
Mr Patrick Fefeza	PF

Members of Staff

Mr Andrew Hall	AH
Mr Calvin van Wijk	CvW
Ms Christina Jikelo	JC
Mr Jonathan Windvogel	JW
Mr Olwethu Dlova (Sec)	OD
Ms Tamar Grover	TG
Mr Ronny Nyuka	RN
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)	LM

Visitors

Mr John Rennie	JR	Mr Mike Scurr	MS
Mr Jonathan Barnes	JB	Mr John Malherbe	JM
Nr Henry Aikman	AK	Mr Ashley Lillie	AL
Mr Patrick Cullen	PC	Mr Bruce Kingwill	BK
Mr Martin Zahradnik	MZ	Ms Bridget O'Donoghue	BO
Ms Teral Cullen	TC		

Observers

Mr Mark Bell (City of Cape Town)

3. Apologies

Dr Stephen Townsend	ST
Mr Tim Hart	TH
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka	ZS

4. Approval of minutes of previous meeting held 12 December 2012

4.1 The Committee resolved to approve the minutes without amendments.

5. Disclosure of Interest

5.1 None

6. Approval of Agenda

The Committee approved the agenda with no additional items.

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 See attached minutes

8. Administration Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

The CEO gave a report back on the Queens Road, Sea Point Tribunal outcome and reported that no appeals were held in January 2013.

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges

The CEO reported back on the Klein Konstantia, 4 Konstantia Street, Paarl, Elim, St James Homestead, and Agulhas Lighthouse matters.

8.3 Checklist for Application related decision making

The CEO reported back that a draft checklist is in the process of completion.

8.4 Elim Workshop

It was agreed that Ms Jikelo will make contact with ST, TT, RJ, MW and the CEO, in order to clarify a programme, invitees and availability of Committee members. Ms Jikelo will circulate a draft programme and set up a meeting to discuss the workshop before the 9 February 2013. It was recommended that a workshop take place on a weekend (possibly the 9th March) and that it possibly be preceded by a meeting with the Municipality. Ms Jikelo will also draft the list of invitees to ensure that all relevant parties are involved.

8.5 Overstrand Municipality Issues of Jurisdiction

Mr Hall will meet with the Municipal Manager and Mr John Simson to clarify issues of jurisdiction especially with respect to Section 34 and Section 31.

8.6 UCT, Middle Campus, Economics Building

A review of the conditions of the Section 38 approval and a meeting between the CEO and Nigel Haupt is awaiting.

8.7 Circulation of documentation on Agulhas Lighthouse

The Committee expressed extreme concern at the continued administration errors in this case; that the specifications have still not been distributed; and that an appointment had not been made for Mr J Rennie until this morning (30 January 2013), despite instructions from the CEO. The Committee requested the CEO to take disciplinary action.

8.8 Builders holiday

The CEO reported on the recommendation of EXCO to Council.

8.9 Digitised distribution of documents

The Committee discussed the digitised distribution of documents and it was noted that hard copies were not available at the meeting venue as previously agreed.

9. Appointments

9.1 Item E.10.1 Agulhas Lighthouse; 11H00 am

FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION

W.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

W.10.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions to an Existing Building on ERF 66745 Riebeeck House, Riebeeck Street, Wynberg: NM HM/WYNBERG/ERF 66745

Case No: 121213JW09

A Heritage Statement prepared by Bridget O'Donoghue, dated December 2012 was tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Ms Bridget O'Donoghue and Mr Jonathan Barnes were present and participated in the discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Old Wynberg Village Historical Society and City of Cape Town support the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be Grade IIIA within a Grade II context,

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

JW

W.10.2 Proposed Excavations, Erven 95164, 95136, Company Gardens Queen Victoria And St Johns Road, Cape Town: MA HM/COMPANY GARDENS/ERF 95164& 95136

Case No: 121030JW02E

A letter prepared by the City of Cape Town, dated 18th December 2012 and accompanying historical surveys and maps were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The proposal coincided with potential landscape features such as historic water channels as indicated on the surveys provided.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to refer the matter to APM for approval. The Committee has no built environment concerns; and requires that prior to commencement of work an historical archaeologist identify areas of particular sensitivity. Thereafter, work on those areas must only be undertaken in the presence of that archaeologist.

Otherwise the site should be monitored by an Archaeologist, and a monitoring brief should be submitted to Heritage Western Cape for approval.

JW

W.11 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

W.11.1 None

W.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

**W.12.1 Proposed Alterations and Renovations, Erf 1121 Klein Constantia Estate, Klein Constantia Road: MA
HM/KLEIN CONSTANTIA/ERF 1121**

Case No: 120116TG10M

A Proposal Update, Design Development Appraisal and Technical Details, prepared by Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects, dated January 2013 were tabled

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation.

Mr Mike Scurr and Mr Mark Bell were present and participated in the discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- Given the archaeological sensitivity, any below ground disturbance requires a section 35 application to SAHRA.
- The CPOA supported the current proposal.
- The building is in a grade I context but is not declared as a PHS.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the buildings to be Grade II.

The Committee endorses the report prepared by Mr Rennie Scurr Adendorff (RSA).

The Committee approves the proposals as per the plans, elevations, detailing and specifications attached to the RSA report. It is recommended that the two flights of internal stairs proposed to the wine cellar be reconsidered and/or further motivated.

The following working drawing details are to be submitted to HWC for final approval prior to being implemented on site as per points (i-iv) of page 40 of the RSA Report:

- (i) Main house: final detail of new staircase to the attic bedrooms.
- (ii) Old wine cellar: detail of the stoep extension and addition of central steps.
- (iii) Old wine cellar: joinery details in af-dak portion on north side.
- (iv) Old wine cellar: internal two half flight staircases and openings.

Detailed landscape proposals are to be submitted for approval.

Approval is subject to the conservation architect's continued appointment and the submission of a completion report. RSA must monitor the work until project

completion and provide HWC with interim reports (including further details, specs and photo record).

TG

W.12.2 Proposal to Replace Thatch Roof with Corrugated Iron Sheeting on Farm 501/02, Farm Mooikelder, Main Street, Northern Paarl, Paarl: NM HM/MOOILKELDER/PAARL

Case No: 121212RN15E

A report, photographs and drawings prepared by Malherbe Rust were tabled.

Mr Johan Malherbe was present.

It was noted that the DHF, Paarl 300 and AKSO objected to the proposal. These parties were not informed that the application would be tabled at the meeting and therefore further discussion had to be deferred.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection and meeting on Monday, 11 February 2013 at 14H30 and to make a decision by email.

All parties must be informed of the site inspection and meeting as a matter of urgency and this must be done by the case officer.

RN

W.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

W.13.1 None

W. 14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

W.14.1 None

W.15. PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

W.15.1 None

W.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

W.16.1 None

W.17. PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

W.17.1 None

W.18. REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

W.18.1 None

W.19. Other Matters

W.19.1 None

SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION

E.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

E.10.1 Ptn 53 and Ptn 4 of Farm 281, Cape Agulhas Lighthouse: MA HM/CAPE AGULHAS LIGHTHOUSE/PTN 53 AND PTN 4 OF FARM 281

Drawings, photographs and a report prepared by John Rennie were tabled.

Mr John Rennie was present and participated during discussion.

The Committee resolved to discuss this matter in camera.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to endorse the approach to the remedial work on the plinth as proposed by Rennie Scurr Adendorff. More detailed proposals for the plinth must be submitted to HWC for approval.

The withdrawal of the stop-works order is premised on:

- The appointment of the same conservation architect responsible for the approved specifications to supervise and provide technical advice for the entire scope of the project and as per HWC decision of 2007.
- That an assessment of the work undertaken on other parts of the structure be undertaken by the said architect and submitted to HWC for consideration.
- A completion report be submitted by the architect assessing the work and impacts of unauthorised work on significance of the site.
- The applicant submits written undertaking to adhere to the above.

During the closed session it was noted that:

- Remedial work approved will be in terms of a compulsory repair order.
- The ExCo of HWC has resolved to reserve its right to bring charges in this matter pending assessment of the finalised project.

ZS

E.10.2 Proposed change of planning status, consent use of structures on CFM 503 Malabar, formerly known as Nooitgedacht, Ceres: NM HM/CERES/503

A Heritage Statement prepared by Henry Aikman was tabled.

Mr Calvin van Wijk made a power-point presentation.

Mr Henry Aikman was present and participated during discussion.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be Grade IIIB.

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

ZS

E.11. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

E.11.1 None

E.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

E.12.1 Proposed Excavation on Erf 172264, 146 Waterkant Street, Cape Town: NM HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 172264

Case No: 120803ZS02E

An application, motivation and supporting documenting prepared by Martin Zahradnik, dated 21 January 2013 was tabled including a report prepared by Ashley Lillie dated 20 July 2012, revised method statement prepared by Noel de Villiers (ADA Consulting Engineers), dated 30 November 2012, drawings prepared by Michael Lumby (Architect), dated 12 September 2012, and a report by Ted Kelley, dated 17 October 2012 were tabled.

Ms Teral Cullen, Mr Patrick Cullen, Mr Ashley Lillie, Mr Bruce Kingwill and Mr Martin Zahradnik were present and participated during discussion

Mr Calvin van Wijk made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- There was lack of clarify regarding the heritage significance of the historical wall and its associated building.
- There are differing engineer's opinions regarding the structural integrity of the historical wall and methods to prevent it from damage.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection.

ZS/CvW

E.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

E.13.1 None

E.14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

E.14.1 None

E.15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

E.15.1 None

E.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

E.16.1 None

E.17 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

E.17.1 None

E.18 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

E.18.1 None

E.19 Other Matters

E.19.1 None

20. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

21. CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at **15:05**

22 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 27 February 2013

CHAIRPERSON _____

DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

DATE _____

Approved