

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING  
OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,  
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)  
Held on Wednesday, 30 January 2014, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the  
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,  
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09H00**

---

**1. Opening and Welcome**

The meeting was officially opened at 09:10 by the chairperson, Ms Sarah Winter, and she welcomed everyone present.

**2. Attendance**

**Members**

Ms Sarah Winter  
Ms Belinda Mutti  
Mr Graham Jacobs  
Mr Michael Scurr  
Mr Rowen Ruiters  
Mr Stuart Hermansen  
Mr Peter Buttgens

SW  
BM  
GJ  
MS  
RR  
SH  
PB

**Members of Staff**

Mr Andrew Hall AH  
Mr Christina Jikelo CJ  
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka ZS  
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec) LM  
Mr Ronny Nyuka RN  
Mr Olwethu-Oz-Dlova (Sec) OD  
Mr Jonathan Windvogel JW

Mr Hermansen arrived at 11H00

**Visitors**

Mr Ashley Lillie AL

**Observers**

None

**3. Apologies**

None

**4. Approval of agenda**

4.1 The Committee approved the agenda dated 30<sup>th</sup> January 2014.

**5. Approval of minutes of previous meeting held 18 December 2013**

5.1 The Committee resolved to approve the minutes without amendments.

**6. Disclosure of Interest**

6.1 MS: 8.5, E.12.3 and E.12.4  
PB: E.12.1

**7. Confidential Matters**

7.1 None

**8. Administrative Matters**

**8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees**

The CEO reported back on the outcomes of the following appeals and tribunal matters:

- Proposed Total Demolition on Erven 11126 & 11127, Corner of Albert and Frere Roads, Woodstock.

- New Lecture Facility, UCT, Upper Campus.

AH/ZS

## **8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges**

### **8.2.1 Stop Works Order for Unauthorized Work, Erf 106, 1 Church Street (Museum), Tulbagh**

The Committee noted that the sand had been removed from the furrow.

The Committee recommended that the verge be tidied up and appropriately landscaped.

JW

## **8.3 Checklist for Applications**

The matter was held over for discussion at the next meeting.

ZS

### **8.4 Application for Departures on Erf 1324, Dorp Street, Stellenbosch: MA HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 1324**

The CEO reported that a meeting is in the process of being set up with Mr de la Bat of the Stellenbosch Municipality.

ZS/CEO

### **8.5 Erf 90780 and 91062, Oak Cottage, Durban Road, Wynberg**

MS recused himself.

MS reported on behalf of John Rennie that it is the intention of the applicant to submit a proposal to HWC in due course.

The Committee requested an indication of significant progress in this matter by next meeting, failing which the Committee will consider other options.

ZS

### **8.6 Resolution of Stop Works Order, Purple Turtle (Old Imperial Hotel, 29 Shortmarket Street, Cape Town, Erf 2355, Cape Town**

The CEO reported that there have been difficulties between the owner and the service provider who has refused to work for the owner. Other options are being investigated. The deadline for submission of a work plan is the 31 January 2014 failing which the owner's deposit is forfeited to HWC.

#### **RECOMMENDATION**

Should the conditions in the previous decision not be implemented on deadline, HWC is to consider bringing charges as well as proceeding with work.

ZS/AH

## **8.7 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 487, No.92, The Ridge, Clifton**

The Committee noted the legal opinion and confirming that the total demolition be considered in terms Section 34, and there is no requirement for plans under Section 31 to be submitted with the Section 34 application. This would be optional if demolition and absence of the new structure adversely affects the heritage significance of the area.

**JW**

## **9. Appointments**

**9.1** None

### **FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION**

#### **W.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS**

##### **W.10.1 Proposed Geotechnical Drill Core Sampling in Government Ave, Company Gardens: MA HM/COMPANY GARDENS/GOVERNMENT AVE**

**Case No:** 140127TS10

This matter was dealt with by email and it was resolved to approve the application subject to the submission of an application.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

**TS**

#### **W.11 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION**

##### **W.11.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 57935, Hoogeind, 6 Torquay Avenue, Claremont, Cape Town: MA HM/CLAREMONT/ERF57935**

**Case No:** 131114RN33E

BM did not attend the site visit and did not participate in the discussion.

Committee members reported back on their site visit.

Mr Ashley Lillie was present and took part in the discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The heritage significance of the building resides largely in its external envelope and its intactness, as well as its relationship with its setting, i.e. it forms a historic anchor element in the neighbourhood.
- The Committee recognises that there are viability issues but these do not outweigh its heritage significance and recommends that alternative land use and adaptive reuse options be explored, knowing that these would have the in - principle support of HWC.

- The Committee would have no objection to the alteration or demolition of the out-buildings on the northwest side of the property; particularly if this would assist in improving its viability.

**DECISION**

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be Grade IIIB.

The Committee resolved to not approve the demolition.

**RN**

**W.11.2 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 487, No.92 The Ridge, Clifton: MA  
HM//CLIFTON/ERF 487**

**Case No:** 131114JW31E

The CEO gave feedback on the legal opinion.

The Committee was of the opinion that the removal of the building did not adversely affect the significance of the heritage area.

**DECISION**

The Committee decided that the building is ungradable and demolition is approved.

**JW**

**W.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL  
DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**W.12.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 1024, Berthelin, Signal Street, Cape  
Town: NM  
HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 1024**

**Case No:** 131104JW08E

An application for permit, photographs and plans prepared by Sayed Adams, dated October 2013, drwg no: 52/2013 were tabled,

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

**DECISION**

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be Grade IIIB, within a proposed Grade 1 area.

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

**JW**

**W.12.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 187, 18 Stadler Road, Blaauwberg Strand: NM  
HM/BLAAUBWBERG STRAND/ERF 187**

**Case No:** 130131JW06E

An application for permit, photographs and plans were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The similar adjacent building has been previously nominated as a National Monument.
- The extent of the remaining historical fabric is unclear.

**DECISION**

The Committee decided that it was unable to resolve on a grading.

The Committee resolved to request a Heritage Statement prepared by a suitably qualified heritage practitioner focusing on the grading of the building and the presence of historic fabric in the area affected by the proposed intervention.

**JW**

**W.12.3 Proposed Alterations and Restorations on Erf 924, 54 Chiappini Street, Bo-Kaap: MA  
HM/BO-KAAP/ERF 924**

**Case No:** 31105JW12E

Revised plans were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Committee had no objections to the proposals.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

**JW**

**W.12.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 5426/5427, Stakesby-Lewis Hostels, 86 Commercial Street, Zonnebloem, Cape Town: NM  
HM/CAPE TOWN/ZONNEBLOEM/ERF 5426/5427**

**Case No:** 131205RN31E

An application, photographs and plans prepared by Earthworld Architects and Interiors, dated 26 November 2013 (drwg no: 300) were tabled.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building is a good example of its period and has high social and historical significance with linkages to District Six.
- The building may be a grade II site and this needs investigation.
- The proposed interventions appear to be top heavy in relation to the existing building.
- It is not clear to what extent the proposals take the broader visual context into account and how they would affect perceptions of the building and streetscape.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to request a Heritage Statement that addresses the above mentioned issues and formally proposes a grading. The Heritage Statement must be prepared by suitably qualified and independent heritage practitioners, names to be submitted and confirmed by HWC.

**RN**

#### **W.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS**

**W.13.1** None

#### **W. 14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT**

**W.14.1** None

#### **W.15. PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL**

**W.15.1** None

#### **W.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS**

**W.16.1** None

#### **W.17. PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS**

**W.17.1** None

#### **W.18. REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE**

**W.18.1** None

#### **W.19. Other Matters**

**W.19.1** None

## **SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION**

### **E.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS**

#### **E.10.1 Proposed Landscaping and Additions to Existing Structures on Erf 95135, Company Gardens, Queen Victoria Street, Cape Town: NM HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 95135**

**Case No:** 140114NN20M

An application and motivation prepared by Margot van Heerden, dated December 2013 were tabled

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Committee had no objections to the proposals.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

**NN**

### **E.11. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION**

#### **E.11.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 32 Bantry Bay, 196 Kloof Road, Bantry Bay: NM HM/BANTRY BAY/ERF 32**

**Case No:** 131213NN15E

An application and Heritage Statement prepared by Bridget O'Donoghue, dated December 2013 were tabled,

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building is ungradable.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition as the building is un-gradable.

**NN**

### **E.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

#### **E12.1 Proposed Alterations, Weltevreden Farm 1646/14, R45 Simondium: NM HM/SOMONDIUM/FARM 1646/14**

**Case No:** 131211NN19M

An application and plans prepared by Malherbe Rust, dated 06/06/2013 were tabled.

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The site is situated within a Grade I landscape,
- The comments of SAHRA and registered conservation bodies had not been submitted with the application.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to undertake a site visit. Given the Grade I status of the landscape, SAHRA's comments must be obtained and conservation bodies consulted.

**NN**

#### **E.12.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Transnet Engineering, Erf 15201, 19 Voortrekker Road, Salt River: NM HMSALT RIVER/ERF 15201**

**Case No:** 131203NN21M

An application and plans prepared by Gallagher Lourens Architects, dated Sept 2013 were tabled.

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation

PB recused himself and left the room.

In discussion it was noted that:

- It was difficult to assess the visual impact of the proposals from Voortrekker Road and the Salt River Market.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to request three-dimensional representations of the proposals to better assess the visual impact on the existing building with particular attention to the new fire escapes on both ends of the building and the roof addition.

**NN**

#### **E.12.3 Proposed Alterations on Farm 1121, Klein Constantia: MA HM/KLEIN CONSTANTIA/FARM 1121**

An application and drawings prepared by Mike Scurr, dated November 2013 and a report prepared by Mike Scurr, dated January 2014 were tabled.

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation.

MC recused himself.

In discussion it was noted that:

- This is an application for modifications to previously approved plans.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the application subject to the recommendations of the heritage architect contained in the report dated January 2014, particularly with respect to ongoing supervision and monitoring by the heritage architect. The

committee approves Option B on the southeast elevation. Final amended drawings must be submitted to HWC for stamping by the case officer.

**NN**

**E.12.4 Proposed Signage, Rex Trueform, Erf 175134, 263 Victoria Road, Salt River:  
MA  
HM/SALT RIVER/ERF 175134**

**Case No:** 131023NN38M

Revised plans were tabled

MS recused himself

In discussion it was noted that:

- An application is not required for proposals B and C as it involves the reinstatement of existing signage.
- There is no objection to proposals A and D.
- The building is a grade II and has been nominated as a PHS.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the signage panel above the main entrance subject to its reduction in size away from the vertical edges of the building by a meter each side.

**NN**

**E.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS**

**E.13.1** None

**E.14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT**

**E.14.1** None

**E.15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL**

**E.15.1** None

**E.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS**

**E.16.1** None

**E.17 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS**

**E.17.1** None

**E.18 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE**

**E.18.1** None

**E.19 Other Matters**

E.19.1 None

**20. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS**

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions

**21. CLOSURE**

The meeting adjourned at

**12H30**

**22 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:**

**26 February 2014**

**CHAIRPERSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE** \_\_\_\_\_

**SECRETARY** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE** \_\_\_\_\_

APPROVED