

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Tuesday, 31 January 2017 at the 1st Floor Boardroom, at the Offices of
the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 10.00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The Acting Chairperson, Mr Graham Jacobs, officially opened the meeting at 10.00 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms Janine de Waal
Mr Mike Scurr
Mr Graham Jacobs
Mr Peter Büttgens
Mr Mayiji Nyikosa
Ms Belinda Mutti
Ms Elize Joubert

JdW
MS
GJ
PB
MN
BM
EJ

Members of Staff

Ms Penelope Meyer PM
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka ZS
Ms Heidi Boise HB
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti LM
Ms Katherine Robinson KR
Mr Andrew September AS
Ms Waseefa Dhansay WD

Visitors

Mr Klaus Neumann
Mr Chris Snelling

Observers

Absent

None

3. Apologies

Ms Karin Dugmore Ström KDS
Mr Gaarith Williams GW
Ms Colette Scheermeyer CSc
Mr Jonathan Windvogel JW

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 31 January 2017

The Committee approved the agenda dated 31 January 2017 with some amendments.

5 Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting

5.1 Minutes dated 25 January 2017 will be approved, together with the minutes of this meeting, at the next scheduled meeting.

6. Disclosure of Interest

- GJ: 11.1
- PB: 13.4

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Conservation Strategy for the Josephine Mill, Newlands.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to make a decision by email.

8.2 Site Inspection by Committee members

Staff reported that payment for site inspections are applicable in terms of a decision by EXCO but will require an attendance register and site inspection report to be made by the committee for inclusion in the following committee meeting minutes.

It was agreed that site reports would be entered on the committee blog pro-forma, which also makes allowance for the uploading of images.

ZS

8.3 100 Buitengracht Street

The legal adviser (PM) reported back that HWC has decided to take this matter on review and will be engaging with Council accordingly.

PM

9. Standing Item

9.1 Site Inspection

There were no site inspections undertaken by staff and Committee members.

HB reported that a Stop Works Order has been issued for Erf 3166, 3167 No 176 and 178 Bree Street, Cape Town.

10. Appointments

10.1 None

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Conversion of the Stables and the Slave Quarters into guest suites on the PHS, Ptn 12 Of Farm 1674, La Rhone, Boschendal: NM HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSCH/PORTION 12 OF Farm 1674

Case No: 16102405KR1130M

Motivation for alterations to a PHS document by ARCON and drawings Rev 1: 20160926 (2 pages) Dated 26 September 2016 & Rev 3: 20161129 dated 26 November 2016 By Petra Kleyn were tabled.

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation

GJ was present for answering questions but recused himself and left the room while the matter was being deliberated.

PB chaired this item.

COMMENT

The Committee resolved to conduct a site inspection in order to assess the sensitivity of the site.

KR

12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 None

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Erf 1226 - 22 Berg Street Wellington - Additions and Alterations: MA HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTIEN/ WELLINGTON/ ERF 1226

Case No: 16120604WD1206E

Application Documents were tabled

Ms Waseefa Dhansay made a power-point presentation

In the discussion it was noted that:

- The committee determined the grading of the building to be grade III C.
- The Drakenstein municipality supports the proposal but the DHF has recorded its objection.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals subject to the following conditions:

- That the north east (street facing) end elevation of the proposed extension be amended to reflect a veranda typology with corner column and low wall.
- That the street boundary wall be retained as existing and extended to a similar design.

Revised proposals are to be submitted to officials who will determine whether to refer back to Committee or stamp and approve based on the above conditions.

WD

**13.2 Erf 177196 - 91 Plein Street, Cape Town CBD
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CAPE TOWN CBD/ ERF 177196**

Case No: 16112501WD1214E

Application Documents were tabled.

Ms Waseefa Dhansay made a power-point presentation.
Mr Chris Snelling was present and participated in the discussions.

In the discussion it was noted that:

- The CoCT has graded the building grade IIIB.

COMMENT

The Committee resolved to conduct a site inspection to better understand the nature of the significance of the site and the nature of the proposed alterations.

WD

**13.3 Erf 644 - 4 South Way Pinelands - Additions and Alterations
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ PINELANDS/ ERF 644**

Case No: 16113013WD1206E

Ms Waseefa Dhansay made a power-point presentation.

In the discussion it was noted that:

- The CoCT grading of the building is grade III B.
- Pineland Residents and Ratepayers Association supports the proposals but with concerns.
- The CoCT support the proposals.

DECISION

The committee supports HOMS recommendations and agrees with its concerns that the front additions will impact negatively on a fine Cape Revival/ Arts and Crafts architectural example.

With the exception of the car port and pergola, the committee resolved to approve the proposals as not impacting negatively on architectural significance.
The committee requires revised proposals to be submitted to the HWC officials for stamping.

WD

**13.4 PROPOSED ALTERATION & ADDITIONS TO ERF 9988, 118 ST GEORGES MALL, CAPE TOWN
HM/ CAPE METROPOLITAN/CAPE TOWN/ ERF 9988**

Case No: 16051008HB0511M

Reuse / Refurbishment methodology statement by Peter Büttgens dated November 2016 was tabled.

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

PB stayed for discussion but recused himself and left the room when the matter was deliberated.

Mr Klaus Neumann was present and participated in the discussion.

COMMENT

The Committee cannot endorse unauthorised work. The committee does not believe that heritage significance has been negatively impacted.

The Committee requests the heritage consultant to submit an interim report on the condition of the 'Broseley' tiles and their potential for re-use before work commences on the roof.

The Committee agreed to lift the stop works order on signature of a heritage agreement which incorporates the heritage consultant's reports and recommendations.

HB

**13.5 Proposed Partial Demolition & New Building On Erf 149274, Ptn Erf 148549, "Old Breakwater Jail", 9 Portswood Road, Green Point:MA
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/GREEN POINT/ERF 149274, PTN ERF 148549**

Case No: 16070802HB0714E

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals as having met previous concerns.

HB

**13.6 Erf 2932, 54 Rathfelder Road, Constantia Extension of the Outbuilding to Incorporate a New Staff Lounge.
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CONSTANTIA/ERF 2932**

Case No: 15106608KR0415E

Application Documents, Ratepayers and City Heritage Comments, Drawing No: MP 14042 dated Aug 2010 were tabled.

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals as having met previous concerns.

KR

**13.7 Proposed Alterations and Additions to Erf 14469, 12 Neethling Street, Stellenbosch.
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 14469**

Case No: 16111502KR1116E

Application document and document prepared by Dr Elzet Albertyn dated 16 November 2016 were tabled.

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The committee resolved not to approve the proposals as they do not address the committee's previous concerns.

KR

**13.8 Addition of a new structure to the back of an existing structure on Erf 90263, 230 Main Road, Kalk Bay
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/KALK BAY/ERF 90263**

Case No: 16121401KR1213E

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposals as they impact negatively on heritage significance. The Committee requires further information including a heritage statement that amongst others identifies significant historic fabric and the nature of the building's spatial context. Input from a suitably qualified heritage consultant with appropriate architectural expertise will be required.

KR

**13.9 Proposed Alterations & Additions to Erf 26888, 52 Trill Road, Observatory: NM
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/OBSERVATORY/ ERF 26888**

Case No: 16092104HB1128E

Application pack, proposal drawings and photographs were tabled.

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

COMMENT

The Committee resolved to conduct a site inspection to better understand the nature of the significance of the site and its context before making a decision. (GJ, PB, MS, MN, EJ and JDW)

HB

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 OTHER MATTERS

20.1 None

21. NON COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at: 13H15

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 22 February 2017

CHAIRPERSON _____ **DATE** _____

SECRETARY _____ **DATE** _____