

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Tuesday, 5 July 2016 at the 1st Floor Boardroom, at the Offices of the
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09:00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The Chairperson Ms Sarah Winter officially opened the meeting at 09:05 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms Sarah Winter	SW
Mr Mike Scurr	MS
Ms Belinda Mutti	BM
Mr Peter Buttgens	PB
Mr Stuart Hermansen	SH
Mr Graham Jacobs	GJ
Mr Rowen Ruiters	RR

Members of Staff

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka	ZS
Ms Heidi Boise	HB
Mr Jonathan Windvogel	JW
Mr Andrew September	AS
Ms Waseefa Dhansay	WD
Mr Olwethu Oz Dlova (Sec)	OD
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)	LM
Ms Katherine Robinson	KR

Visitors

Mr Bartus Swanepoel	BS	Mr Johan Papendorf	JP
Mr Seruads De Kock	SDK	Mr Robert Golttlieb	RG
Mr Alan Maintors	AM	Mrs Bridget Brown	BB
Mrs AC Gilmour	ACG	Mrs Claire Abrahamse	CA
Mr Johann Slee	JS	Ms Ezet Albertyn	EA
Mr Piet Katz	PK	Mr Daniel Ferrelia	DF
Mr Piere du Plessis	PdP	Mr Johan Cornelius	JC

Observers

None

3. Apologies

Mr Mxolisi Dlamuka	MD
Ms Colette Scheermeyer	CS
Ms Penny Meyer	PM

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 5 July 2016

The Committee approved the agenda dated 5 July 2016 with minor amendments.

5 Disclosure of Interest

- MS: 7.1
- SH:13.4 and 13.19

6. Confidential Matters

6.1 None

7. Administrative Matters

7.1 Dock Road, Waterfront.

MS recused himself for this item.

It was noted that a stop works order has been issued and HWC will await the heritage report.

JW

7.2 Criteria for Determining Whether a Matter Raising is Revised Proposal or New application

The matter will be discussed at the next meeting.

8. Standing items

8.1 Site Inspections

None

PM

9. Appointments

9.1 None

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

**11.1 Proposed Rezoning and Consent-Use for Josephine Mill, Erf 96664, 13 Boundary Road, Newlands: MA
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSCH/EEF 6156**

Case No: 1512409AS0209M

A Draft Conservation Strategy to be tabled

The matter was deferred for a decision by email.

AS

**11.2 Proposed Partial Demolition, Restoration, Additions and Alterations, Erf 6156, De Volkskombuis Restaurant, Aan-De-Wagenweg, Stellenbosch: MA
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSCH/EEF 6156**

Case No: 16041220KR0414M

GJ, SH, PB, SW and Ms reported back on their site visit.

Johan Slee and Elzet Albertyn were present and took part in the discussion.

DECISION

The Committee agrees with the heritage consultant's recommendation that the building is worthy of grade III A status.
It was noted that the SIG supported the latest revisions to the proposals as indicated in Revision E.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals as indicated in Revision E, subject to the submission of a full set of final drawings for stamping by the case officer. The final drawings must indicate the retention of the ceilings in cottages 1, 2, 7 and 8.

KR

12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 None

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

**13.1 Proposed Additions to existing structure, Erf 46472, 165 Main Road Rondebosch: MA
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/RONDEBOSCH/ ERF 46472**

Case No: 16012104HB0127E

The matter has been dealt with at the previous meeting.

HB

**13.2 Proposed Total Demolition Portion 686 Of Farm Blaauwklip 510, Jamestown: MA
HM/JAMESTOWN/PTN 686 FARM 510**

Case No: 15060108JW0601E

Additional information prepared by Prof M. Burben was tabled.

The matter has been dealt with at the previous meeting.

JW

**13.3 Proposed Addition of 3 to 4 Storeys to the top of the Old Post Office Building Erf 2051, Old Post Office, Corner of Bird and Plein Street, Stellenbosch: MA
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSCH/EEF 1051**

Case No: 16050912KR0511M

SH recused himself for this item and joined the architect and applicants.
GJ, SW, PB and MS reported back on their site visit.

It was noted that:

- Ms Corlie Smart (SHF) tendered her apologies.
- The PAC had approved Option B.
- The SIG and SHF do not support the proposals.

DECISION

It was noted that the building is graded IIIB in terms of the approved Stellenbosch Survey.

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposals in their current form. The Committee supports the principle of additional storeys but does not support the current configuration and set back of the proposals which have been dictated by zoning scheme requirements. The result is that the proposals negate the significance of the splayed corner and the character of the façade as a whole. The proposals in their current form contribute to a sense of visual clutter of the roof scape particularly as viewed from the Die Braak. The building and its relationship with the opposite corner building form a gateway to Plein Street which needs to be respected.

The Committee requires the submission of revised drawings to for approval by BELCom . It requires the revised drawings to be illustrated by a contextual argument to address the concerns regarding visual clutter and the relationship of the building to the opposite corner building, the Plein Street and Bird Street streetscapes as well as Die Braak.

The Committee supports the lightweight architectural treatment of the new addition. However, given the significance of the building and its context the new addition needs to be carefully designed and detailed.

The Committee supports the limited number of new door openings on the ground floor as this will retain the overall institutional character of the building.

KR

13.5 Proposed Additions to existing structure Farm 145, The Oaks, Greyton: MA HM/OVERBERG/THREEWATERSKLOOF/GREYTON/FARM 145

Case No: 16050502KR0506M

Documents including 3D design images, conservation body comments and revised drawings prepared by Malherbe Rust Architects 1390/1201 Rev B and 1390/1301 Rev B dated 01.04.2016 were tabled.

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

The architect from MR Architects was present and took part in the discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the revised proposals as having largely addressed previous concerns raised. The Committee still has concern that there needs to be a larger set back of the dressing room from the end gable wall. Therefore approval is subject to a minimum set back of 500 mm of this addition from the end gable wall. Final drawings (Revision C) must be submitted to HWC for stamping by the case officer.

KR

**13.6 Proposed Alteration & Additions to Erf 721, 34 Queens Road, Bantry Bay: MA
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/BANTRY BAY/ERF 721**

Case No: 16030704HB0426E

MS and GJ reported back on their site visit.

It was noted that local conservation bodies and the CoCT supported the proposals. The building has not yet been graded by the CoCT and the building does not fall within an HPOZ. The Committee is in agreement that the building should be graded IIIB in terms of its architectural qualities and intactness and its contribution to the street character of Queens Road.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to support the principle of a double storey addition but not the proposals in their current form. The double storey addition on the bay portion of the building and extending along Rochester Street creates an imbalance in the overall built form and the relationship between the semi-detached dwellings

The Committee requires the submission of revised proposals taking into consideration the following recommendations:

- The double storey addition must be extended across the full width of the building facing Queens Road.
- The length of the double storey addition along Rochester Street must be reduced to match the length of the middle section
- The authenticity and integrity of the ground floor must be retained.

The Committee requires the submission of revised proposals for approval by BELCom.

HB

**13.7 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 1584, 2B Devonport Road,
Tamboerskloof,: MA
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/TAMBOERSKLOOF/ERF 1584**

Case No: 16052504JW0525E

Plans, photographs and other documents were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee resolved to conduct a site inspection (GJ, SW, MS and PB).

JW

**13.8 Proposed Additional Structure on Erf 174160, 38 Buitenkant Street, City CBD:
NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CITY CENTRE CBD/ERF 174160**

Case No: 16051009AS0615E

New plans, sections, 3D models, permit application and comments from CoCT HRS and CIBRA were tabled.

Mr Andrew September made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposals due to their negative impact on the historic fabric of the warehouse building and legibility of the interior warehouse space. Floor plans and sections must be submitted which clearly differentiate the existing from the proposed and with a much clearer legibility of the internal warehouse space.

The Committee supports the principle of the additional storeys but does not support the overbearing architectural language which should be more recessive in relation to the warehouse building and surrounding urban landscape.

AS

**13.9 Proposed Extension of the Outbuilding to incorporate a New Staff Lounge, Erf 2932, 54 Rathfelder Road, Constantia: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CONSTANTIA/ERF 2932**

Case No: 15106008KR0415E

Annexure A, plans (drawing no. MP 14042 dated August 2010), supporting documentation and comments from the Constantia Ratepayers' and Residents' Association and CoCT HRS s were tabled.

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection (SW, GJ, MS and PB).

KR

**13.10 Proposed Addition of a Double Garage and External Entertainment Room, Erf 15860, 46 Jonkershoek Way, Stellenbosch: NM
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSCH/EEF 15860**

Case No: 16040105KR0405E

Application documents, drawings no: C/006/200 a & C/006/100 a prepared by Hugo Lotter Architects dated 27-01-2016, and PAC SHF and SIG comments were tabled.

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection in order to obtain a better understanding of the context (SH, GJ and MS).

KR

**13.11 Proposed Additions to Erf 95443, 8 Dunkley Road, Gardens: NM
HM\CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN\GARDENS\ERF 95443**

Case No: 16041308GT0415E

MS and GJ reported back on their site visit.

DECISION

The Committee supports the principle of additional storeys but does not support the proposals in their current form.

The Committee requires the submission of revised proposals which takes into account the relationship of the building to surrounding additions. The Committee is of the opinion that the first floor should not be set back from the front façade of the building and that the use of materials should reflect that of the existing building.

Revised proposals can be circulated for a decision by e-mail.

GT

13.12 Proposed Additions, Erf 14225, 42 Balfour Street, Woodstock: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/WOODSTOCK/ERF 14225

Case No: 16041804JW0606E

Annexure A, plans, photographs and other documents were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr Ernest Ford of the Woodstock Aesthetics Committee was present and took part in the discussions.

It was noted that:

- The Woodstock Aesthetics Committee does not support the proposals.
- The CoCT has no objection to the proposals.
- The CoCT has identified the building as being not conservation worthy (2015 audit).

DECISION

The Committee is of the opinion that the building is worthy of grade III C in terms of its contribution to the character of the HPOZ, i.e. roof scape, street interface, building scale and form.

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposals as they will have a very negative impact on the roof form of the building and its contribution to the surrounding roof scape and will be visible from Balfour Street.

The Committee has no objection to the principle of an additional storey.

The Committee requires a new application to be made to HWC.

JW

13.13 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 3190, 4 Constantia Road, Oranjezicht: NM HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/ORANJEZICHT/ERF 3190

Case No: 16041310JW0415E

Annexure A, plans, photographs and comments from conservation bodies and the CoCT were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building IIB and noted that it is located within the HPOZ. The Committee is of the opinion that the proposals are over scaled and will negatively impact the architectural integrity and quality of the building and its contribution to the streetscape.

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposals.

JW

**13.14 Proposed Addition to existing structure on Erf 92253, 42 Durban Road, Wynberg: NM
HM/ CAPE METROPOLITAN/WYNBEG/ ERF 92253**

Case No: 16050912HB0601E

The matter was removed from the agenda.

HB

**13.15 Proposed Partial Demolition, Alterations and Additions to Erf 8132, 9 Caxton Street, Woodstock: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/WOODSTOCK/ERF 8132**

Case No: 16032405AS0578E

Annexure A, 3D images, plans, comments and supporting documentation were tabled.

Mr Andrew September made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals as they will have no heritage impact.

AS

**13.16 Proposed Alterations and Additions, ERF 352, 19 Braemer Road, Green Point: NM
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/GREEN POINT/ERF 352**

Case No: 16032203JW0606E

Plans, photographs and other documents were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee supported the III C grading of the CoCT

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals as they will not have a negative impact on the heritage significance of the building and its context.

It is noted that the building falls within a proposed HPOZ and the CoCT needs to apply its boundary treatment policy.

JW

**13.17 Proposed Alteration & Additions to Erf 13536, "Sillery Estate", Sillery Lane, Constantia: NM
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/CONSTANTIA/ERF 13536**

Case No: 15111907HB1202E

A Heritage Statement prepared by Claire Abrahamse, dated May 2016 and drawings prepared by Michael Dall drawing No. 2.001 Rev B & 2.002 Rev B dated November 2014 were tabled.

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

Ms Claire Abrahamse was present and participated in the discussion.

COMMENT

The Committee is of the opinion that the building is worthy of a IIIB grading given its high local social significance and tangible association with the history of forced removals and the Sardien family. While the building has largely lost its rural context, the Committee is of the opinion that the cottage typology of the existing building must be emphasised.

The Committee endorses the heritage indicators and recommended heritage mitigation measures contained within the heritage report prepared by Claire Abrahamse and recommends that the design development proceed on this basis. The Committee has no objection to the removal of the bay window.

The Committee strongly supports the recommendation for the retention of the palisade facing along the Sillery Lane in order to retain the visual connection of the building with the street edge.

The current proposals are not supported.

HB

**13.18 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 8988, 22 Plein Street Paarl: MA
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 8988**

Case No: 14040802JW0509E

SW, PB, MS and GJ reported back on their site inspection.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that the building is worthy of grade IIIB. The proposals are significantly at variance with the previous application and therefore must be considered as a new application. In this instance, the period fire place and the interior configuration of the layout is retained.

The Committee is of the opinion that the proposals will have no impact on the historical, architectural and aesthetic value of the building.

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

JW

13.19 Proposed Partial Demolition, Addition, Restoration & Alteration to Farm 6/153, Hendrikse Street, Stellenbosch: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSCH/FARM6/153

Case No: 16041911HB0511E

Annexure A, drawings and a Heritage Report prepared by Stuart Hermansen dated 14 March 2016 were tabled.

SH recused himself.

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

PB, GJ, MS and SW reported back on their site visit.

DECISION

The Committee recommended the grading the werf to be grade II in terms of its high historical, architectural and aesthetic value and its landscape setting.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals subject to the following:

- The work must be supervised by a suitably qualified and experienced architect.
- A closeout report must be submitted within 30 days of practical completion
- A landscape framework plan must be submitted for the werf specifically including the three court yard spaces, the approach road and the interface between the werf and its agricultural landscape setting.
- Any below ground disturbance within the werf and in proximately to the kraal ruins must be monitored by a historical archaeologist (refer to area of archaeological sensitivity identified by H. Clift).

New interventions including *inter alia* repair and maintenance, plaster finishes and landscaping must ensure that the overall rustic character of the werf is retained and not gentrified.

HB

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 OTHER MATTERS

20.1 None

21. NON COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at: **15:00**

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 27 July 2016

CHAIRPERSON _____ **DATE** _____

SECRETARY _____ **DATE** _____