

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Wednesday, 8 July 2015 at the 1st Floor Boardroom, at the Offices of the
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09:00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The meeting was officially opened at 09:15 by the chairperson, Ms Sarah Winter, and she welcomed everyone present

Attendance

Members

Ms Sarah Winter
Mr Mike Scurr
Graham Jacobs
Mr Peter Buttgens
Ms Belinda Mutti

SW
MS
GJ
PB
BM

Members of Staff

Dr Errol Myburg EM
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka ZS
Ms Jenna Lavin JL
Ms Penny Meyer PM
Mr Ronny Nyuka RN
Mr Jonathan Windvogel JW
Ms Kathrine Robinson KR
Mr Andrew September AS
Mr Olwethu Oz Dlova (Sec) OD
Ms Waseefa Dhansay WD
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec) LM
Ms Heidi Boise HB

Visitors

Mr Johan Cornelius
Mr Martin van der Merwe
Mr Stefan Rademan
Ms Jane Visser
Mr Patrick Labrosse
Mr Heiko Schulze

JC
MvdM
SR
JV
PL
HS

Ms Sihaam Ajuuhaar SA
Mr Ashley Lillie AL
Mr Alan Todd AT
Prof Fabio Todeschini FT
Mr Trevor Thorold TT

Observers

Mr Clinton Jackson (SAHRA)

Ms Nonyameko Mlungwana (SAHRA)

2. Apologies

Mr Stuart Hermansen SH
Mr Rowen Ruiters RR

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 8 July 2015

The Committee approved the agenda dated 8 July 2015 without amendments.

5 Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting

5.1 Dated 17 June 2015

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes without amendments.

6. Disclosure of Interest

- PB: W.19.1 and W.19.2
- MS: E.12.1 and W.13.5

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

The Legal Advisor (PM) reported back on the following appeals matters:

- Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 15163, 22 Coronation Road, Walmer Estate: Section 34
- Proposed Partial Demolition, Additions to Existing Structures and Alterations "The Old School House", Erf 3653, 1 Theron Street, Paarl: Section 34
- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 5028, Garmor House, 12 Plein Street, Cape Town: Section 34
- Fixing Up of an Existing Carport and adding a New Deck, Erf 66, 5 Blackheath road, Sea point: Section 34
- Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 11306, Klein Constantia Street, Paarl: Section 27

PM

8.2 Report Back on Stop Works Orders and Charges

There were no new matters to report back.

PM

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings Refused for Demolition

There were no new matters to report back.

ZS

8.4 St Mary's Church, Stellenbosch.

PM and KR reported back on their site inspection.

DECISION

That a letter be sent to the applicant requesting reasons why the permit should not be withdrawn in the light of the illegal work.

PM

8.5 Restoration, Repairs & Renovations to the National Council of Provinces building, Parliament

ZS reported that HWC was still awaiting proposed dates for the site visit from the consultant.

ZS

8.6 The Rhodes Statue Report Time Lines

Mr Ashley Lillie was present and took part in the discussion.

DECISION

The Committee agreed to the request to extend the deadline for the submission from 150 days to 180 days. The extension will not disadvantage any party and it is accepted that the HWC's draft guidelines to monuments and memorials need to be considered in the submission.

The Committee will not consider any further extension of the deadline given that the 180 days stipulated is regarded as more than adequate. The Committee requires that the verbal request from Mr Lillie be submitted in writing for the record.

JL

9. Standing items

9.1 Site Inspections

The following site inspections were noted:

- 152 Waterkant, Cape Town
- St Mary's Church, Stellenbosch
- 12 Windsor Road, Kalk Bay
- 2 and 4 Claire Street, Vredehoek
- 30 Hofmeyr Street, Gardens

10. Appointments

10.1 The Committee noted the appointment for items 8.6 set for 10H00

FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION

W.11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

W.11.1 Proposed Partial Demolition, Erf 1227, Graaf Electronical Works Building, Molteno Water Site, Molteno Road, Cape Town: NM HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 1227

Case No: 15032710JW0415M

An application for a permit, photographs and plans were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be a grade II and it is a PHS. The building has high architectural and technological value. It is a very intact and rare example of a late 19th century industrial building with surviving period infrastructure and equipment.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals.

The Committee supports the 'restoration strategy' indicated as the preferred alternative in the report prepared by Gabriel Fagan Architects dated Feb 2015. This is regarded as the appropriate conservation approach and should inform any future interventions on the site.

A heritage specialist is to oversee the work and a completion report is to be submitted to HWC upon the practical completion of work.

JW

W.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

W.12.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 55150, 12 Hugon Road, Claremont: NM HM/CLAREMONT/ERF 55150

Case No: 14091809RN1001E

An application for a permit, photographs and Heritage Statement prepared by Ashley Lillie, dated 18 June 2015 were tabled.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

Mr Ashley Lillie was present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection (GJ, SW, PB and MS).

RN

W.13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

W.13.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 14363, Lodgelaan 1, Wellington: NM HM/WELLINGTON/ERF 14363

Case No: 15052622RN0528E

An application for a permit, photographs and plans were tabled.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

Ms Sihaam Ajuuhaar and Mr Martin van der Merwe were present and took part in the discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection (GJ, SW and PM).

RN

**W.13.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Rem of Farm 705, Spice Route,
(Leeuwenjacht), Agter-Paarl: MA
HM/AGTER-PAARL/REM OF FARM 705/SPICE ROUTE**

Case No: 15051303RN0513M

A Concise Heritage Statement prepared by Malherbe Rust Architects was tabled.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals given that there will be minimum impact on the significance of the site and no impact on historic fabric.

RN

**W.13.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 9563, 13 Glynville Terrace, Gardens:
NM
HM/GARDENS/ERF 9563**

Case No: 15050610JW0623M

An application for a permit, photographs and plans were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr Stefan Rademan was present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade IIIA as it forms part of a terrace of high architectural and aesthetic value.

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection (GJ, SW, PB and MS).

JW

**W.13.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 96771, 138 Campground Road,
Rondebosch: NM
HM/RONDEBOSCH/ERF 96771**

Case No: 15060302JW0603E

An application for a permit, photographs and plans were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Ms Sihaam Ajuuhaar and Mr Martin van der Merwe were present and took part in the discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolve to undertake a site inspection (GJ, SW, MS and PB)

JW

**W.13.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 1320, 30 Hofmeyer Street, Oranjezicht:
NM
HM/ORANJEZICHT/ERF 1320**

Case No: 15031710JW0327E

An application for a permit, photographs and plans were tabled.

MS recused himself.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr Trevor Thorold, Mr Alan Todd and representatives of CIBRA, Mr Patrick Labrosse and Mr Heiko Schulze were present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolve to take the site inspection (GJ, SW, MS and PB).

Representatives of the applicant, objecting parties and the CoCT HRS will be invited to attend.

JW

W.14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

W.14.1 None

W. 15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

W.15.1 None

W.16. PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

W.16.1 None

W.17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

W.17.1 None

W.18. PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

W.18.1 None

W.19. REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

**W.19.1 Proposed Alteration and Additions, Erf 113, 20 Brownlow Road,
Tamboerskloof: NM
HM/TAMBOERSKLOOF/ERF 113**

Case No: 15062408HB0625E

PB recused himself.

PB was advised that an application would need to be submitted to HWC.

HB

**W.19.2 Proposed Alterations on Erf 383, No 42 Woodside Road, Tamboerskloof: NM
HM/TAMBOERSKLOOF/ERF 383**

Ms Jane Visser was present and took part in discussion.

The Committee agreed that revised proposals would need to be submitted as a new application.

JW

W.20. Other Matters

W.20.1 None

SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION

E.11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

**E.11.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 377, Alphen Farm Estate, Constantia:
NM
HM/CONSTANTIA/ERF 377**

Case No: 15062218KR 0625E

An application for a permit, photographs and plans were tabled

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the site to be grade II. It is a PHS and forms part of a broader cultural landscape of grade I heritage status.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposed reinstatement of the original entrance to the historic werf as it considers the proposals to be a vast improvement on the current access arrangements.

The Committee resolved to approve the associated soft and hard landscaping proposals.

The proposed security booms and structures are to be submitted as a separate application accompanied by more detailed proposals that affect the PHS.

KR

**E.12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL
DEMOLITION**

**E.12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Highclere, Erf 280, 8 Ranke Road
Blaauwbergstrand: MA
HM/BLAAUWBERGSTRAND/ERF 280**

Case No: 14121801GT0115M

JL reported that the site inspection and meeting had been postponed at the request of the applicant.

GT

E.12.2 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 998, 152 Waterkant Street, Greenpoint: MA HM/GREENPOINT/ERF152

Case No: 15041408KR0416M

SW reported back on their site visit attended by SW, MS, PB, MB, KR and HB

In discussion It was noted that:

- The CoCT HRS represented by Mr Mark Bell and Committee members (SW, MS and PB) are in agreement that the building is un-gradable.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve demolition given that the building is un-gradable and its context is not worthy of any formal protection.

KR

E.12.3 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 66, 13 Bellwood Road, Fresnaye: NM HM/FRESNAYE/ERF 66

Case No: 15060210KR0606E

An application for a permit and photographs were tabled.

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

Mr Johan Cornelius was present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

On the vote of three to two the Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade III C.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposed demolition given that its context has been highly altered and is not worthy of formal protection as a HPOZ or a heritage area.

KR

E.13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

E.13.1 None

E.14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

E.14.1 None

E.15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

E.15.1 None

E.16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

E.16.1 None

E.17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

E.17.1 None

E.18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

E.18.1 None

E.19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

E.19.1 None

E.20 NON COMPLIANCE

E.20.1 None

20. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

21. CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at: **12H45**

22 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 29 July 2015

CHAIRPERSON _____ **DATE** _____

SECRETARY _____ **DATE** _____