

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Wednesday, 9 September 2015 at the 1st Floor Boardroom, at the Offices of
the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09:00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The Chairperson Ms Sarah Winter officially opened the meeting at 09:10 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms Sarah Winter
Mr Peter Buttgens
Mr Mike Scurr
Mr Graham Jacobs
Mr Rowen Ruiters
Ms Belinda Mutti
Mr Stuart Hermansen

SW
PB
MS
GJ
RR
BM
SH

Members of Staff

Ms Hanneljie Du Preez HDP
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka ZS
Ms Jenna Lavin JL
Ms Penny Meyer PM
Mr Guy Thomas GT
Mr Jonathan Windvogel JW
Ms Katherine Robinson KR
Ms Heidi Boise HB
Ms Waseefa Dhansay WD
Mr Olwethu Oz Dlova (Sec) OD
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec) LM
Mr Andrew September AS

Visitors

Mr Ashley Lillie
Prof Sandra Klopper
Mr Johan Cornelius
Mr P. Marosse
Mr Gawie Fagan
Mr Henry Aikman
Mr GK Tucker
Ms S Ozinsky
Ms Janet Steer
Mr Hein Visser

AL
SK
JC
PM
GF
HA
GKT
SO
JS
HV

Mr Nigel Haupt NH
Mr Tyron Engel TE
Mr K Ingwersen KI
Dr G Fagan DrGF
Mr John-Wilson-Harris JWH
Mr JP van Wyk JPvW
Mrs V Keuber VK
Mr S October SO
Mr Andrew Steer AS

Observers

Mr Troy Smuts (CoCT) TS

3. Apologies

Dr Errol Myburg EM

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 9 September 2015

The Committee approved the agenda dated 9 September 2015 with minor amendments.

5 Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting

5.1 Dated 19 August 2015

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with one amendment.

6. Disclosure of Interest

- MS: 11.4
- GJ: 13.2

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 UCT Rhodes must fall

Mr Ashley Lillie, Mr Nigel Haupt and Prof Sandra Klopper were present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The requirements of HWC were explicit.
- UCT is in default of compliance of those requirements.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to consider a further extension to the deadline for the submission of the application to HWC on condition that:

- A detailed timeline indicating the process to date and the reasons for extensions and firm dates for deliverables be submitted to HWC as undertaken by UCT by close of business today.
- UCT issue a media statement explaining the above and that this be issued as a matter of urgency as the previously agreed extended deadline for the release of the report for public comment has already lapsed.

The Committee further resolved that logistical arrangements for a special BELCom meeting will be developed in consultation with the Chair and Committee members.

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

The Legal Advisor (PM) reported on the outcome of the following appeal matters:

- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 5028, Garmor House, 12 Plein Street, Cape Town: Section 34
- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 52606, 6 Livingston Road, Claremont: Section 34
- Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 186, Van Der Stel Street, Tulbagh: Section 34
- Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 1407 Ptn of Erf 1406, 10 Kinbrae Court, Belle Ombre Road, Tamboerskloof: Section 34
- Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 582, Errol Heynes, 6 Homestead Way, Pinelands: Section 34

PM

8.2 Report Back on Stop Works Orders and Charges

There were no new matters to report back.

PM

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings Refused for Demolition

There were no matters to report.

ZS

8.4 St Mary's Church, Stellenbosch.

There was nothing to report.

PM

8.5 Erf 333, Yzerfontein

There was nothing to report.

GT

9. Standing items

9.1 Site Inspections

The following site inspections undertaken by Committee members were noted:

- Proposed Alterations and additions to Erf 1862, 7 Constantia Road, Oranjezicht
- Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 453, 80 Waterkant Street, Cape Town
- Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 224, No.2 Claire Street, Vredehoek
- Proposed Alteration and Additions, Erf 71301, Corner Melville and Ferguson Road, Plumstead

The following site inspections undertaken by staff were noted:

- Erf 3666, Table Mountain Old Tea Room and Table Mountain Lower Cable-way Station Shop

10. Appointments

10.1 The Committee noted the appointment for item 13.1 set for 10H30.

MATTERS WERE DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Proposed New Buildings, Ptn Erf 858, Homestead Park, Corner Upper Orange Street and Sidmouth Avenue, Oranjezicht: NM HM/ORANJEZICHT/PTN ERF 858

Case No: 15082604JW0826M

An application for a permit photographs and plans were tabled.

Mr Troy Smuts was present and took part in discussion.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- A similar application had been submitted previously and was refused given that unauthorised work had already taken place and damage had been caused to a PHS.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal subject to the following:

- The tent structures may be erected without any invasive ground fixing.
- That the structure be of a temporary nature specifically for the heritage day celebration.
- Any future permit application will require that the position of any anchor points be pre-determined in consultation with archaeologist in order to avoid any disturbance of archaeological material.

JW

11.2 Proposed Restoration of the Rondebosch Fountain, Corner of Belmont and Main Road Rondebosch: NM HM/RONDEBOSCH/FOUNTAIN

Case No: 15082010KR0820M

An application for a permit and photographs were tabled.

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee decided that the grading of the structure to be grade II.

The Committee approved the proposal in principle. However, it requires a repair method statement to be compiled by an appropriate conservation expert. The Committee commended the CoCT for their proactive engagement.

KR

11.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf, 237, 50 Boom Street, Elim: NM HM/ELIM/ERF 237/50 BOOM STREET

Case No: 15071513JW0715M

An application for a permit photographs and plans were tabled.

Mr Tyrone Engels was present and took part in discussion.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The proposal is not for alterations but for total demolition

DECISION

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposal as it will have a negative impact on the streetscape and result in the significant loss of historic fabric. . The

Committee would consider a proposal which involves the extension of the existing footprint rather than its total demolition.

JW

**11.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Rem Ptn 6 of the Farm Fleurbaai No 1040, Stellenbosch: MA
HM/STELLENBOSCH/REM PTN 6 OF THE FARM FLEURBAAI No 1040**

Case No: 14081108JW0815M

Interim Heritage Report 02, prepared by Mike Scurr, dated August 2015 was tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr Mike Scurr recused himself for this matter

DECISION

The Committee resolved to support the recommendations of the interim report with respect to the Agterkamer fireplace detailing and the main bedroom wing interior detailing. The proposed changes are stylistically inappropriate and will have a negative impact on the heritage significance of the building. The Committee requires that revised proposals be submitted for tabling at BELCom.

JW

**11.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 11310, St Peters Church, 101 Marsh Street, Mossel Bay: MA
HM/MOSSEL BAY/ERF 11310**

Case No: 15050803RN0514E

The matter was removed from the agenda as the proposal was previously refused and therefore a new application must be submitted taking into account the previous recommendations.

ZS

12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

**12.1 Proposed Total Demolition, 28 Vredehoek Avenue, Erf 1079, Vredehoek: NM
HM/VREDEHOEK/ERF 1079**

Case No: 15071004HB0715E

The matter was withdrawn as the applicant did not provide the required information as requested by the case officer.

HB

12.2 Proposed Total Demolition Erf 315, 11 Strathmore Road, Camps Bay: NM HM/CAMPS BAY/ERF 315

Case No: 15080702KR0813E

An application for a permit, Motivation and photographs were tabled.

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee noted that the CoCT has graded the building grade III C.

The Committee was of the opinion that the building and its context has insufficient heritage value to warrant formal protection.

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition.

KR

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Proposed Alterations and Restoration, Erf 174160 (Ptn of Erf 10190), 38 Buitenkant Street, Cape Town: MA HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 174160 (PTN OF ERF 10190)

Case No: 15041407AS0414M

An application for a permit, Heritage Report prepared by Gabriel Fagan Architects, dated March 2015 and plans were tabled.

Mr Andrew September made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- CIFA has no objections
- CoCT supports in principle however were concerned about the bulk of the extension and the lift shaft taking up 30 percent of the historic floor space.
- CIBRA recommends that the addition (upper floors) be set back by 1.5 meters.
- Docomomo withheld comment due to the application not being in their sphere of interest.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade IIIB in terms of its surviving historic fabric and its contribution to the character of the streetscape.

The Committee was of the opinion that the architectural response was appropriate in this heritage context in terms of retention of the historic envelop, the relationship between old and new and the scale of the proposals in relation to the streetscape character. The Committee therefore resolved to approve the proposals.

AS

**13.2 Proposed Partial Demolition, Additions and Restorations, Erf 1774466
(Consolidated 4947, 4948, 4949, 4950) The Granairy, 11 Buitenkant Street, Cape
Town: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 1774466**

Case No: 15080507HB0812N

A Heritage Statement prepared by GAPP Architects/Urban Designers, dated 5 August, application for a permit and plans were tabled.

GJ recused himself.

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee decided that the grading of the building to be grade II.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal subject to the following:

- An archeologist to be available throughout the construction phase(s) of this project for archaeological monitoring due to a high potential for finding intact archaeological deposits.
- A detailed archaeological monitoring schedule to be submitted to HWC for approval as soon as the building plans / concepts have been approved by HWC and it is recommendation that:
- no earthworks (i.e. excavation of foundations, pillar posts or services) should take place in the historic core and its associated courtyard without full time supervision of the site archaeologist
- removal of mature trees in the historic courtyard needs to be undertaken in such a manner as to cause minimal damage to subsurface archaeological deposits and features
- monitoring of bulk earthworks in Grade IIIC areas (Refer to figure 1)
- The input and involvement of appropriately skilled conservation practitioners and contractors must be in place throughout the project.
- Six-weekly progress reports on the design development, technical detailing and conservation methods be submitted to HWC

HB

**13.3 Proposed Alterations and additions to Erf 1862, 7 Constantia Road,
Oranjezicht: MA
HM/ORANJEZICHT/ERF 1862**

Case No: 15071608KR0701E

An application for a permit and plans prepared Flavio Tedeschi, dated 14 August 2015 were tabled.

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

GJ, MS and SW reported back on their site inspection

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade III C.

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposals given the negative impact of the heavy modification of the roof form resulting in a form that is out of character.

Revised proposals must be submitted and consideration should be given to using the existing roof space and retaining its current form or raising the entire structure to two storeys with hipped roof.

KR

**13.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 453, 80 Waterkant Street, Cape Town:
MA
HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 453**

Case No: 15070803HB0708E

GJ, , MS and SW reported back on their site inspection.

DECISION

The Committee noted that the CoCT has graded the building grade IIIB and that it is located within an HPOZ.

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposals for the following reasons:

- The external staircase will have a high visual impact on the surrounding streetscape particularly when viewed from the upper footway level of the street.
- The first floor set back is questioned given the context of other double storey street boundary frontages in the area.
- The switching of the front entrance and window will result in significant damage to historic fabric.

HB

**13.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 224, No.2 Claire Street, Vredehoek:
MA
HM/VREDEHOEK/ERF 224**

Case No: 15062005HB0612M

GJ, , MS and SW reported back on their site inspection.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade III B.

The Committee cannot condone unauthorised work as this is not provided for in the NHRA.

Given the negative impact of the unauthorised work on the heritage significance of the building and the character of the area, the Committee is obliged to recommend that HWC lay charges. Should the applicant be willing to rectify the matter HWC should reconsider the laying of charges. The applicant must liaise with HWC in this regard within 30 days.

HB

**13.6 Proposed Alteration and Additions, Erf 71301, Corner Melville and Ferguson Road, Plumstead: MA
HM/PLUMSTEAD/ERF 71301**

Case No: 15041411JW0422E

GJ, MS and SW reported back on their site inspection.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade IIIC but that it is not worthy of formal protection as its context has no heritage value.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals.

JW

**13.7 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 582, 6 Homestead Way, Pinelands:
NM
HM/PINELANDS/ERF 582**

The matter has been removed from the agenda.

KR

**13.8 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 1485, House Furlong, 6 Secluse Lane,
Simonstown: NM
HMSIMONSTOWN/ERF 145**

Case No: 15070905JW0811E

An application, photographs and plans were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The CoCT has graded the building as IIIC.

DECISION

The Committee was of the opinion that the building has no heritage significance. The Committee resolved to approve the proposals.

JW

**13.9 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 26667, 3 Low Street, Observatory:
NM
HM/OBSERVATORY/ERF 26667**

Case No: 15040101KR0421E

An application for a permit and plans prepared by Jeff Stacey, dated February 2015 were tabled.

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee noted that the CoCT has graded the building grade III C and that it is located within an HPOZ.

The Committee is of the opinion that the building does not have heritage significance. The committee resolved to approve the proposals.

KR

13.10 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 14469, 12 Neethling Street, Stellenbosch: NM HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 14469

Case No: 15081212JW0812E

A Heritage Statement prepared by Ron Martin, application for permit, photographs and plans were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr Hein Visser was present and participated in the discussions.

DECISION

The Committee noted that the approved Stellenbosch heritage survey graded the building grade III A.

The Committee was of the opinion that the proposals will have a high negative impact on the significance of the building and its heritage context.

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposals for the following reasons:

- The proposed dormers will have a high visual impact on the roof form.
- The internal alterations will significantly alter the internal spatial characteristics of the house.
- The additional parking resulting from the number of units will impact the garden space and street interface.

JW

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 OTHER MATTERS

**20.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, 75 Church Street, Elim: NM
HM/ELIM/75 CHURCH STREET**

The matter was removed from the agenda.

ZS

21. NON COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

KR

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at: **15:15**

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 30 September 2015

CHAIRPERSON _____ **DATE** _____

SECRETARY _____ **DATE** _____