

**MINUTES OF MEETING  
OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,  
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)  
Held on Wednesday, 19 September 2012, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the  
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,  
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09H00**

---

**1. Opening and Welcome**

The meeting was officially opened at 09H15 by the chairperson, Ms Sarah Winter, and she welcomed everyone present.

**2. Attendance**

**Members**

Ms Sarah Winter	SW
Ms Maureen Wolters	MW
Mr Roger Joshua	RJ
Mr Trevor Thorold	TT
Mr Tim Hart	TH

**Members of Staff**

Mr Andrew Hall	AH
Mr Calvin van Wijk	CvW
Ms Christina Jikelo	JC
Mr Jonathan Windvogel	JW
Mr Olwethu Dlova (Sec)	OD
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)	LM
Ms Ntombi Nkoane	NN
Mr Shaun Dyers	SD
Ms Laura Bridgman	LB
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka	ZS

**Visitors**

Mr Alan Dolby  
Mr Paul Truscott  
Mr Henry Aikman  
Ms Corlie Smart  
Mr Graham Jacobs  
Mrs A Murphy  
Mr C.J. Hudson  
Mrs de Kock (Drakenstein Municipality)

Mrs Claire Donovan  
Mr Alex Cloete-Hopkins  
Ms Anne-Marie Fick  
Mr Stuart Hermansen  
Mr M. Wiley  
Mr D. Cowley  
Mr Delaney (Drakenstein Municipality)

**Observers**

Mr Mark Bell (City of Cape Town)

**3. Apologies**

Dr Stephen Townsend  
Ms Melanie Attwell  
Mr Patrick Fefeza

**4. Approval of minutes of previous meeting held 15 August 2012**

**4.1** The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with no amendments.

**4.2 Proposed Alteration of Roof Structure, Erf 28002, The Old Miller's House, De Meule, Avenue Road, Mowbray**

The following urgent decision was taken via email on 11 September 2012:

- The application to remove beetle-infested timber members of the Old Miller's House roof structure and reconstruct using treated poplar poles, as recommended by Lucas Quality Thatchers is approved.

**TG/LB**

## **5. Confidential Matters**

5.1 None

## **6. Administration Matters**

### **6.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees**

The CEO gave a report back on the outcome of the Alphen appeal.

### **6.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges**

Mr van Wijk reported that a stop works order had been served for the Homestead, Main Road, St James.

The CEO reported back on the pending court case regarding unauthorised work to Klein Konstantia, 4 Konstantia Street, Paarl. Charges had been served on the owner.

## **7. Appointments**

7.1 The Committee noted the appointments for items W.10.1 at 10H00, W.11.1 at 11H00 and W.19.1 at 14H00.

## **8. Disclosure of Interest**

Members declared their interest in the following items:

- W.10.1 & W.12.1 (SW)
- W.12.2 (TT)

## **9. Approval of Agenda**

The Committee approved the agenda with additional items.

## **FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION**

### **W. 10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS**

#### **W.10.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 337, Great Cellar, Alphen Estate, Constantia: MA HM/CONSTANTIA/ERF 337**

**Case No:** 120606TG05

A report on Lighting Options Explored for the Re-use of the Roof Loft prepared by Claire Donovan, dated September 2012 was tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by RJ and TT.

Ms Sarah Winter recused herself and joined the client, and Mr Roger Joshua took the chair.

Ms Laura Bridgman made a power-point presentation.

Mr Alan Dolby (representing CPOA), Mrs Claire Donovan, Mr Paul Truscott and Mr Alex Cloete-Hopkins were present and participated in the discussion.

The CPOA indicated that although it had recommended Option C it would be satisfied with Option B on both sides of the roof.

Due to the recusal of Ms Winter, there was no quorum for this item. A recommendation of the members present and able to discuss the matter will be circulated to all members for a decision by email

### **RECOMMENDATION**

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be Grade II and it is a PHS.

The Committee resolved to recommend that:

- Option B be approved as it satisfies the requirements of the tenants (light, ventilation, views) while being the least intrusive to the overall composition of the main façade by referencing existing elements.
- Detailed drawings are to be submitted to HWC detailing the accommodation of the new windows into the existing roof structure.
- Lease agreements must contain a condition that all block out blinds be closed between sunset and sunrise.
- Other work as previously presented is approved subject to the submission of comprehensive drawings for stamping by staff.
- Work may only commence once work on recently resolved matters concerning the parasols and the rose bar has been concluded to the satisfaction of HWC.

**TG/LB**

### **W.10.2 Proposed Alterations and Restorations, the Cottage, Erf 90780, No. 29 Durban Road, Wynberg: NM HM/WYNBERG/ERF 91062**

**Case No:** 120815JW16M

An application for a permit prepared by Mark Huxter, dated 16 July 2012, plans and photographs were tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by RJ, TT, SW and MW  
Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The site is a PHS in a highly significant area.

### **DECISION**

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be Grade IIIA within a Grade II area.

The Committee resolved to request an assessment of the proposed interventions concerning joinery and ironmongery by a suitably qualified and experienced specialist. A minimum of three names of specialists must be represented to HWC for endorsement.

**JW**

**W.10.3 Proposed Alterations and Restorations, Oak Cottage, Erf 91062, No. 27 Durban Road, Wynberg: NM  
HM/WYNBERG/ERF 90780**

**Case No:** 120815JW22

An application for a permit prepared by Mark Huxter, dated 16 July 2012 and photographs were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by TT, RJ, SW and MW.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The site is a PHS in a highly significant area.

**DECISION**

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be Grade IIIA within a Grade II area.

The Committee resolved to request an assessment of the proposed interventions concerning joinery and ironmongery by a suitably qualified and experienced specialist. A minimum of three names of specialists must be represented to HWC for endorsement.

**JW**

**W. 11 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION**

**W.11.1 Proposed Total Demolition of Structure Erf 1591, Corner 4 Loop and Derksen Streets, Paarl: NM  
HM/PAARL/ERF 1591**

**Case No:** X120912JW08D

A Heritage Statement prepared by Aikman Associates, dated September 2012 and an application for permit prepared by Henry Aikman, dated 10 September 2012 were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by TT, RJ and SW.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation,

Representatives from the Drakenstein Municipality (Mr Delaney, Mrs De Kock) and Mr Aikman were present and participated in the discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building had been significantly vandalised over the years.
- The current condition is of such a nature that the building cannot be restored.
- The building has insufficient remaining heritage significance to be retained.

- The Act does not cover willful neglect in cases other than Section 27, although it is recognised that the owner has allowed the building to deteriorate in the manner that is unacceptable.
- The DHF and the Paarl 300 had been informed of the appointment for this item.
- It is alleged that DHF has threatened to appeal on punitive grounds if HWC approves demolition. This is considered to be unacceptable and outside of the provision of the NHRA.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee decided that the building is ungradable

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition as the building in its current condition is ungradable.

If the allegations attributed to DHF can be substantiated a letter be written to the organization expressing concern.

JW

#### **W.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

##### **W.12.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Weltevreden Farm, Ptn 14 of Farm 1646, R45 Franschhoek: MA HM/FRANSCHHOEK/WELTEVREDEN FARM/PTN 14 OF FARM 1646**

**Case No:** 120731JW30

TT, RJ and MW reported back on their site visit and Report prepared by Anne-Marie Fick, dated 5 September 2012 was tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by RJ, TT and TH

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation

Ms Sarah Winter recused herself and joined the applicant's representative and Mr Roger Joshua took the chair.

Ms Anne-Marie Fick was present and participated during discussion.

The Committee discussed this matter at some length.

Due to the recusal of Ms Winter, there was no quorum for this item. A recommendation of the members present and able to discuss the matter will be circulated to all members for a decision by email.

#### **RECOMMENDATION**

The Committee decided the grading of the werf to be Grade IIIA on architectural and historical grounds and it is within SAHRA's Grade I area.

The Committee resolved to recommend that:

- There is no objection to rezoning the site back to Agricultural I with a consent use for guest facilities.
- A phase I archaeological assessment focusing on the werf and the above ground structures must be conducted with the view to informing future work.

- The proposals are approved in principle and must be further resolved taking into account the new grading and the outcome of the archaeological study.

JW

**W.12.2 Proposed Alterations, Additions and Renovation to three Buildings on Deltameer, Rem of Ptn 4 of the Farm Deltameer No 1460, Delta Minor Road, off R45, Groot Drakenstein: MA  
HM/GROOT DRAKENSTEIN/REM OF PTN 4 OF THE FARM DELTAMEER No 1460**

**Case No: 120712TG14M**

A report on Research Excavation prepared by Kathryn Smuts, dated 26 March 2012, an Application for Permit prepared by Trevor Thorold, dated 11 July 2012, photographs and plans were tabled.

Mr Trevor Thorold recused himself.

In discussion it was noted that:

- SAHRA, SIG, SHF and the Franschoek PAC had commented positively on the proposals.

Due to the recusal of Mr Thorold, there was no quorum for this item. A recommendation of the members present and able to discuss the matter will be circulated to all members for a decision by email.

**RECOMMENDATION**

The Committee resolved to recommend approval of the proposals and approval in principle of the concept proposals for the future extension of the building. Final drawings for the proposed future extension must be submitted to the committee.

TG/LB

**W.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS**

W.13.1 None

**W. 14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT**

W.14.1 None

**W.15. PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL**

W.15.1 None

**W.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS**

W.16.1 None

**W.17. PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS**

W.17.1 None

**W.18. REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE**

**W.18.1** None

**W.19. Other Matters**

**W.19.1 East Fort, Hout Bay: NM  
HM/HOUT BAY/EAST FORT**

A report on the condition of the site compiled by Ms Grover following a site visit in the company of Mr Cowley of the Hout Bay and Llandudno Heritage Trust (HBLHT) had been circulated and was discussed following a presentation by Ms Bridgeman.

The documents had been delivered to RJ, TT and TH.

Ms Laura Bridgman made a power-point presentation.

Mr M. Wiley (Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Cultural Affairs and Sport in the Provincial Parliament), representatives of HBLHT (Mrs A. Murphy, Mr D. Cowley and Mr C.J. Hudson) were present and participated during the discussion.

It was noted that:

- Management of the Table Mountain National Park had also been invited and that despite a concerted effort to secure their presence they were not present.

Mr Cowley from HBLHT made lengthy inputs. The Chairperson repeatedly expressed concern that he keeps his inputs to the issue under discussion. It was also necessary that he be warned on several occasions to conduct himself in terms of accepted procedures or risk being asked to leave the meeting.

Mr M, Wiley requested that he be forwarded a copy of the decision.

**DECISION**

The Committee decided the grading of the site to be Grade II and is a PHS within a Grade I site. The Forrester's Cottage although outside of the declared area is a significant component of the site as a whole.

The Committee resolved:

- To notify SANParks of its concern regarding the state of neglect of East Fort PHS and the Forrester's Cottage.
- To request that SANParks give notice of their intentions for the stabilisation and conservation of East Fort within the next 40 days, including a plan of action and date of commencement.

**TG/LB**

## **SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION**

### **E.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS**

#### **E.10.1 Proposed Restaurant, Electric fencing and parking, Erf 13836, Farm Weltevreden, Stellenbosch: MA HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 13836**

**Case No:** 120606SD05M

Revised Landscape Plans prepared by HB Architects, dated 15 September 2012 were tabled.

Mr Shaun Dyers made a power-point presentation.

Ms Corlie Smart and Mr Stuart Hermansen were present and participated during discussion.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the landscape plan subject to the use of laterite on the driveways, the removal of the tree planting to the north of the cellar, the removal of tree planting to the south of approach road opposite the waenhuis and the specification of tree species. Final plans are to be submitted to the case officer for stamping.

It is recommended that water Oaks be planted to form an avenue on the approach road.

The Committee resolved to approve the new restaurant and the associated playground.

**SD**

### **E.11. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION**

**E.11.1** None

### **E. 12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

#### **E.12.1 Proposed Excavation 146 Waterkant Street, Erf 172264, Cape Town: NM HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 172264**

**Case No:** 120803ZS02E

Photographs and plans prepared by Etienne Britz, dated 10 October 2010 were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by RJ, SW and TT.

The matter was withdrawn from the agenda as requested by the applicant.

**ZS**



**E.12.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Klein Melkboschplaas, Homestead, Erf 94  
Melkbosstrand: NM  
HM/MELKBOSSTRAND/ERF 94**

**Case No:** 110930NN30

A Heritage Statement prepared by Arcon Architects, dated September 2012 was tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by TT and MW.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

Mr Graham Jacobs was present and participated during the discussion.

**DECISION**

The Committee decided the grading of the site to be Grade IIIA.

The Committee resolved to undertake a site visit (TT and SW).

**NN**

**E.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS**

**E.13.1** None

**E.14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT**

**E.14.1** None

**E.15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL**

**E.15.1** None

**E.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS**

**E.16.1** None

**E.17 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS**

**E.17.1** None

**E.18 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE**

**E.18.1** None

**E.19 Other Matters**

**E.19.1** None

**20. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS**

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

The Committee was not quorate for items W.10.1, W.12.1, and W.12.2 and thus the recommendations of the members present. A decision by email will be taken in terms of the rules.

**21. CLOSURE**

The meeting adjourned at . **15H15**

**22 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:**

**17 October 2012**

**CHAIRPERSON**\_\_\_\_\_

**DATE**\_\_\_\_\_

**SECRETARY**\_\_\_\_\_

**DATE**\_\_\_\_\_

Approved