

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL MEETING
OF L HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Wednesday, 14 March 2014, 1st Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 11H00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The meeting was officially opened at 10:30 by the chairperson, Ms Sarah Winter, and she welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms Sarah Winter	SW
Ms Belinda Mutti	BM
Mr Graham Jacobs	GJ
Mr Michael Scurr	MS
Mr Peter Buttgens	PB
Mr Stuart Hermansen	SH

Members of Staff

Mr Andrew Hall	AH
Mr Ronny Nyuka	RN
Ms Ntombekhaya Nkoane	NN
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)	LM
Mr Olwethu-Oz-Dlova (Sec)	OD

Visitors

Ms Claire Abrahamse	CA	Mr Ashley Lillie	AL
Ms Vardi Bregman	VB	Ms Jeremy Bregman	JB
Ms Beveney Schiafer	BS	Mr Taki Amira	TA
Ms Ann Nuvoek	AN	Ms Sheina Igmmel	SI

Observers

None

3. Apologies

Mr Rowen Ruiters RR

4. Approval of agenda

The Committee approved the agenda dated 30th January 2014 with following additional item:

5. Approval of minutes of previous meeting held 18 December 2013

5.1 The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with minor amendments.

5. Disclosure of Interest

5.1 None

6. Confidential Matters

6.1 None

7. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

No new matters to report

FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION

W.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

W 10.1 None

W.11 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

W.11.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 880, 8 Rommney Street, Green Point: MA HM/GREENPOINT/ERF 880

Case No: 140114NN06E

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation

Mr Ashley Lillie, Ms Vardi Bregman, Ms Jeremy Bregman, Ms Beveney Schiafer, Mr Taki Amira, Ms Ann Nuvoock, Ms Sheina Igmmel were present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- There is substantial local interest in the retention of this building as expressed by I& AP's in writing and before the committee.
- Some of the arguments made by the objectors hinged around town planning and previous non-compliance issues under other laws which are not within the mandate of the committee.
- The Committee focussed on issues of heritage significance and context as set out and required in terms of Section.3.
- The Committee was divided on the significance of the building and its grading.
- Arguments not in favour of demolition were that the building has sufficient intrinsic significance by virtue of its intactness and its contribution to fine grained character of the inner core of the area. It was noted that the building has some local historical and architectural significance. The loss of the building would contribute to the further erosion of the fine grained character of the immediate area.
- Arguments in support of the application were that the building although substantially intact is of insufficient architectural, historical and aesthetic value or of rarity value. It is located within a much altered streetscape in which it plays little role in contributing to a heritage context. In light of this it is not possible to justify formal protection.
- Should HWC resolve to approve the demolition I&AP's have the option of approaching the City of Cape Town to exercise its powers to provisionally protect the site and therefore to take control of its future and provide time for negotiation around the creation of a heritage area under the Cape Town Zoning Scheme.

DECISION

The Committee resolved by a vote of the four to two to grade the building as III C.

The Committee resolved by a vote of three to three and the casting vote of the chairperson to approve the application.

RN

W.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

W.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

W.13.1 None

W. 14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

W.14.1 None

W.15. PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

W.15.1 None

W.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

W.16.1 None

W.17. PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

W.17.1 None

W.18. REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

W.18.1 None

W.19. Other Matters

W.19.1 None

SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION

E.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

E.11. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

E.11.1 None

E.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

**E12.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 47300, Ivydene, Private Road, Off Glebe Road, Rondebosch:MA
HM/RONDEBOSCH/ERF 47300**

Case No: 140205NN08E

An application and Initial Scoping Report, prepared by Claire Abrahamse, dated October 2013 was tabled.

Ms Clare Abrahamse was present and took part in discussion

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee has no objection to the proposed rezoning and sectionalisation as shown in the drawings dated December 2012, drawing number SDD.100.01. A full section 34 application will be required at building plan submission stage.

NN

**E.12.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions to 16 Bryant Street, Bo-Kaap: NM
HM/BO-KAAP/16 BRIGHT STREET**

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Committee members had been on site and were in agreement that a heritage statement was unnecessary.
- The Committee has no objection to the additional storey but has concerns with the roof pitch and side setbacks of the addition.
- Concerns regarding the pitched roof relate to the existing character of the building i.e. simple mono-pitched roof behind a parapet similar to existing pitch.
- The applicant is advised to obtain the input of heritage architect.

DECISION

The Committee the grading of the building to be grade III C in a grade I area.

The Committee resolved that revised plans to be submitted on the next meeting or later.

NN

E.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

E.13.1 None

E.14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

E.14.1 None

E.15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

E.15.1 None

E.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

E.16.1 None

E.17 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

E.17.1 None

E.18 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

E.18.1 None

E.19 Other Matters

E.19.1 None

20. **ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS**
The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions

21. **CLOSURE**
The meeting adjourned at **14:30**

22 **DATE OF NEXT MEETING:** **23 April 2014**

CHAIRPERSON _____

DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

DATE _____

Approved