

**APPROVED MINUTES OF MEETING  
OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,  
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)  
Held on Wednesday, 20 June 2012, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the  
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,  
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09H00**

---

**1. Opening and Welcome**

The meeting was officially opened at 09H20 by the acting chairperson, Dr Stephen Townsend, and he welcomed everyone present.

**2. Attendance**

**Members**

|                     |    |
|---------------------|----|
| Dr Stephen Townsend | ST |
| Ms Melanie Attwell  | MA |
| Mr Roger Joshua     | RJ |
| Mr Patrick Fefeza   | PF |
| Mr Tim Hart         | TH |
| Ms Maureen Wolters  | MW |
| Mr Trevor Thorold   | TT |

**Members of Staff**

|                            |     |
|----------------------------|-----|
| Mr Andrew Hall             | AH  |
| Ms Christina Jikelo        | CJ  |
| Mr Calvin van Wijk         | CvW |
| Mr Jonathan Windvogel      | JW  |
| Mr Olwethu Dlova (Sec)     | OD  |
| Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec) | LM  |
| Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka      | ZS  |
| Ms Ntombi Nkoane           | NN  |
| Ms Laura Bridgman          | LB  |

**Visitors**

Mr Martin Firer  
Mr Paul Trusscott  
Ms Corlie Smart  
Mr Derek Chittenden  
Mrs Anne-Marie Fick  
Mr F. Bohm  
Mr S Hermansen  
Mr S Dugmore

Mrs Clare Donovan  
Mrs Nicky Cloete-Hopkins  
Mr Ashley Lillie  
Ms Marne vd Westhuizen  
Mr Sean Haynes  
Mr R Mgadam  
Mrs K Strom  
Mr M Dall

**Observers**

None

**3. Apologies**

|                 |    |
|-----------------|----|
| Ms Sarah Winter | SW |
| Ms Tamar Grover | TG |

**4. Approval of minutes of previous**

**4.1 Meeting held on 16 May 2012**

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes.

**5. Confidential Matters**

**5.1 Kromme Rhee Farm, Koelenhof, Stellenbosch**

This matter was discussed in camera and is minuted separately

It should be noted that Mr Thorold excused himself and was outside the room for the entire discussion.

## **6. Administration Matters**

### **6.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees**

The CEO gave a report back on the outcome of the Tribunal decision in respect of the Stellenbosch hotel matter.

### **6.2 Bonnievale Railway Station**

The CEO made a verbal report in respect of this matter. The Committee agreed that prosecution would not be appropriate in this circumstance.

### **6.3 Erf 1647, Adderley Street, Stanford**

The Chairperson discussed issues raised by the Overstrand Municipality relating to the Qualidental judgement and the HWC officials' decision to deem this matter not to be within HWC's jurisdiction. The CEO will respond to Municipality to explain the differences in the cases.

Ms Attwell left at 10H30 and returned at 12.45pm

### **6.4 Erf 443, 47 Napier Street, De Waterkant**

The Committee agreed that in this case prosecution is unlikely to serve a constructive purpose.

### **6.5 Alphen, Decision of 16 May 2012**

The Committee agreed that the property owner should appeal against those parts of decisions they are unhappy about. Later in the meeting this was communicated to the applicant who attended the meeting in respect of another application affecting this property.

### **6.6 248 Buitengracht (Cnr Carisbrook) Road, Bo-Kaap**

The CEO made a verbal report in respect of this matter; and he advised that the permit had been granted.

It was noted that the civic association has a right to appeal.

### **6.7 Staff Presentations**

The Committee agreed that staff presentations should focus on significance and that the CEO will give some thought on the order of the information presented, perhaps with some illustrations of the situation being presented earlier in the presentations.

### **6.8 Declaration of Interest Forms**

The CEO warned the members to submit the declaration of interest forms on pain of exclusion.

## **7. Appointments**

- 7.1** The Committee noted the appointment of Item W.8.3, Tokai Homestead Precinct Plan, set for 14H00

### **FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION**

#### **W 8 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS**

##### **W.8.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 106, Oude Volks Kerk (Museum), 1 Church Street, Tulbagh: NM HM/TULBAGH/ERF 106**

Application prepared by P.J van Huyssteen, dated 23 May 2012, Landscape plans prepared by P.J van Huyssteen, dated April 2012 and photographs were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by TT and ST.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The site is a declared Provincial Heritage Site and is appropriately graded as a Grade II heritage resource.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to require more detailed research regarding the history of the relationship between the church and the abutting streets and the CEO would arrange for this between museum personnel and Friends of the Tulbagh Oude Kerk Volksmuseum. This may require more detailed drawings and plans. ST undertook to inspect the site.

**JW**

##### **W.8.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 337, Great Cellar, Alphen Estate, Constantia: NM HM/CONSTANTIA/ERF 337/GREAT CELLAR: MA**

**Case No:** 120606TG05M

An Application and report prepared by Claire Abrahamse, dated June 2012 and plans were tabled.

Ms Donovan-Abrahamse and Mrs Cloete-Hopkins, the owner, were present.

The documents had been circulated electronically to all members. This had, however, been done too late for the members to have scrutinised the documents.

Ms Laura Bridgman made a power-point presentation on behalf of Ms Tamar Grover

It was noted that:

- The building as a commercial zoning
- The site is situated on secondary cross axis from main house and the building is visible from M3

## **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to defer the matter for a site visit (ST, TT, MA and RJ)

**TG**

### **W.8.3 Proposed Draft Tokai Homestead Precinct Plan, Table Mountain National Park: NM HM/TABLE MOUNTAIN NATIONAL PARK**

Final Baseline Report, dated November 2012 was tabled.

Mr Thorold recused himself and joined the TMNP representatives.

Several representatives of the applicant, the TMNP, were present including Mr Mike Slayen, Mr Trevor Thorold, and Mr Derek Chittenden. These representatives made contributions to the presentation and discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The site has considerable heritage significance.
- The homestead and the Arboretum are declared as National Monuments.

## **DECISION**

1. The Committee resolved to endorse the Overall Tokai Manor Precinct Plan, subject to the submission of detailed plans in terms of relevant provisions of the Act and as outline in the framework presented.
2. The Committee resolved to endorse / approve in principle the siting and development of the new TMNP Head Office, as proposed in the Overall Precinct Plan. A Heritage Impact Assessment or focussed on potential Visual Impacts is required.

**TG**

### **W 9 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION**

**W.9.1** None

### **W.10 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

#### **W.10.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 8125, Buitenzorg, Paggasvlei Road, Constantia: NM HM/CONSTANTIA/ERF 8125**

**Case No:** 120502TG01

A Heritage Statement prepared by Aikman Associates, dated March 2012, an application for permit prepared by Antoinette Burke, dated 19 March 2012 and drawings prepared by Ad2 Architecture & Design, dated October 2011 were tabled. The documents had not been circulated and, therefore, not read by any committee member.

## **DECISION**

The Committee resolved not to deal with this matter and that some members will visit the site (MA and TT) and the heritage practitioner is to provide an estimation of the date of construction (based at least on aerial photographs).

**TG**

### **W.10.2 Proposed Partial Demolition/ Alterations and Additions, Erf 28285, House Meyer, 39 Orange Street, Paarl: MA HM/PAARL/ERF 28285**

**Case No:** 290525TG20M

An application for permit prepared by Paul Meyer, dated 24 May 2012 and plans prepared by Paul Meyer Architect, date of first issue: November 2003 and second issue April 2012 were tabled.

The documents had not been circulated and, therefore, not read by any committee member.

The matter is returned to the case officer to obtain all necessary information so that the significance of the building and its environs can be assessed in order to make a decision.

**TG**

### **W.11 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS**

**W.11.1** None

### **W. 12 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT**

**W. 12.1** None

### **W. 13 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL**

**W.13.1** None

### **W.14 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS**

**W.14.1** None

### **W.15 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS**

**W.15.1** None

### **W.16 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE**

**W.16.1** None

### **W.17 Other Matters**

**W.17.1** None

## **SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION**

### **E 8 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS**

#### **E 8.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 13836, Weltevreden Farm off R304, Stellenbosch: NM HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 13836/WELTEVREDEN FARM**

Heritage Report prepared by Ms Corlie Smart in association with Mr Stuart Hermansen, dated May 2012 in support of application for permit was tabled.

Mr Hermansen and Ms Smart were present and made contributions to the discussion.

Mr Shaun Dyers made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- There are minor and acceptable alterations proposed to the homestead, Jonkeershuis, wine cellar and the stables.
- The alterations proposed to the garage should be carried out in similar building materials to those used in the surrounding erf.
- There are extensive proposals for the waenhuis which includes the addition of a glass house.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the alterations to most of the works proposed to most of the buildings including the homestead, the jonkheershuis, the wine cellar, the stables and the garage subject to the changes agreed on the garage. The case officer shall write the ROD and stamp the drawings when this change is made.

The proposed parking and the works on the waenhuis, the proposed hothouse and extensive pergola were not approved; and the Committee resolved to visit the site to assess the nature of the scale, position and form of the hothouse (with pergola etc.) and the parking.

**SD**

#### **E.8.2 Proposed Alteration and Additions, Erf 2246, Strooidak Kerk, 163B Main Road, Paarl: MA HM/STROOIDAK/ERF 2246**

**Case No:** 120502ZS01

This matter stood over from the previous meeting.  
Ms Fick of the architects, Malherbe Rust, was present and made input.

ST reported back on his site visit.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

**ZS**

**E 9 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION**

**E.9.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 739, 30 Avenue La Croix, Fresnaye: MA HM/FRESNAYE/ERF 739**

**Case No:** 120208SD09

Letter and Application prepared by Ashley Lillie, dated 24 May 2012 was tabled. Mr Lillie was present and explained this complicated repeated application.

Mr Shaun Dyers made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The wrong City Council comments were inadvertently submitted by the applicant.
- This new application is submitted to correct the error.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

**SD**

**E.9.2 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 2262, 4 Groeneweide Street, Stellenbosch: NM HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 2262**

**Case No:** 120606ZS07E

An Application for a permit prepared by WP Bosch, dated 20 May 2012 was tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by MA, SW and TT

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- It does not seem that the building is worthy of a formal protection.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved that the chairperson Ms Winter will conduct a site visit (as offered). It is suggested that she look at the area generally as it appears to be under pressure. The matter will be dealt by e-mail if possible.

**ZS**

**E.9.3 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 2261, 2 Groeneweide Street, Stellenbosch: NM HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 2261**

**Case No:** 120606ZS06E

An Application for a permit and Heritage Statement prepared by WP Bosch Corlie Smart, dated May 2012 were tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by MA, SW and TT

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- It does not seem that the building is worthy of a formal protection.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved that the chairperson Ms Winter will conduct a site visit (as offered). It is suggested that she look at the area generally as it appears to be under pressure. The matter will be dealt by e-mail if possible.

**ZS**

**E 10 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**E 10.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 149, Main Street, Keurbooms: MA HM/KEURBOOMS/ERF 149**

**Case No:** X111111ZS15

An Application for a permit and photographs prepared by Swart and Associates Architects was tabled

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved that it could not deal with this matter as only one copy of the report has been received and nobody have read it. Ms Wolters undertook to read it and she will report back at the next meeting.

The case officer is advised to get more copies of the report for distribution.

**ZS**

**E.10.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Elwyngor, Erf 45281, 8 Silwood Road, Rondebosch: MA HM/RONDEBOSCH/ERF 45281**

**Case No:** 120208ZS12

A Heritage Statement prepared by Karin Strom, dated 08 February 2012 revised 06 June 2012 was tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by ST, SW and TT

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The City Council's HRS has not given good advice in respect of the significance or the proposal.
- The architects have revised the proposal discussed previously.
- The property is inside an Urban Conservation Area.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

**ZS**



**E.10.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 46324, 31 Avenue Road, Rondebosch:  
NM  
HM/RONDEBOSCH/ERF 46324**

**Case No:** 120523ZS26M

An Application for a permit and motivation prepared by Martin Firer, undated was tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by MA, ST and TT

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The environment is particularly heterogenous in its character and the committee feels that it would be wrong to insist on a symmetrical formal arrangement.
- The Committee feels that the building does not warrant grading and could not be formerly protected; and the section 108 decision of the City Council must be the final decision.

It was noted that Dr Townsend and Mr Thorold had previously spoken to Mr Firer with regard to this matter and Mr Firer had no objection to them being part of the decision- making. The Committee resolved not to require that either TT or ST recuse themselves.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved that it has no objection to the proposal and approves the applicant's chosen option.

**ZS**

**E.10.5 Proposed Alterations, Rex Trueform Factory Complex, 263 Victoria Road, Erf 175134, Salt River: NM  
HM/SALTRIVER/ERF 175134**

**Case No:** 111109NN08D

A Heritage Statement prepared by Ilze Wolff and Ashley Lillie, dated June 2012 was tabled.

Mr Lillie and the architects were present and made in-put in the discussion.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building is recommended to be a grade II.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved:

- That the complex should be regarded as a grade II heritage resource;
- That all tangible artefacts be collected, archived and preserved; this includes clock-in cards, clocks, signage, furniture, etc;
- That the one remaining bay of "Georgian-wired" glass in the Victoria Road façade of the 1963 building be retained;

- That the Victoria Road shopfronts on the Nicholsons building be retained and reinstated to its original character;
- That the repair of the windows of the 1948 building only proceed as examples are carried out and confirmed by a conservation architect (Mike Scurr was suggested) and HWC (via Mr Thorold)
- That the heritage practitioner (Mr Lillie) and conservation architect (Scurr) be appointed to monitor the respective of works to the satisfaction of HWC.

**NN**

**E.10.6 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 118915, 8 Highwick Avenue, Claremont: MA  
HM/CLAREMONT/ERF 118915**

ST, TT, SW and RJ reported back on their site visit.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the application; and requires that the heritage practitioner be retained during the construction phase in order to assist and advise the architect.

**NN**

**E.10.7 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 66375 & 66376; Dutch Reformed Mission Church, Wynberg: MA  
HM/WYNBERG/ERF 66375 & 66376**

**Case No:** 120502NN01

ST and TT reported back on their site visit

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the application subject to an amended detail where the new concrete roof intersects with a door and the ogival window- opening above the door.

**NN**

**E.11 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS**

**E.11.1** None

**E.12 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT**

**E.12.1** None

**E.13 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL**

**E.13.1** None

**E.14 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS**

**E.14.1** None

**E.15 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS**

E.15.1 None

**E.16 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE**

E.16.1 None

**E.17 Other Matters**

E.17.1 None

**18. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS**

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

**19. CLOSURE**

The meeting adjourned at 16: 45

**20 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 18 July 2012**

**CHAIRPERSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE** \_\_\_\_\_

**SECRETARY** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE** \_\_\_\_\_

Approved