

**MINUTES OF MEETING
OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Wednesday, 18 July 2012, 1st Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09H00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The meeting was officially opened at 09H15 by the chairperson, Ms Sarah Winter, and she welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Dr Stephen Townsend	ST
Ms Melanie Attwell	MA
Mr Roger Joshua	RJ
Mr Patrick Fefeza	PF
Mr Tim Hart	TH
Ms Maureen Wolters	MW
Mr Trevor Thorold	TT
Ms Sarah Winter	SW

Members of Staff

Mr Andrew Hall	AH
Ms Christina Jikelo	CJ
Mr Calvin van Wijk	CvW
Mr Jonathan Windvogel	JW
Mr Olwethu Dlova (Sec)	OD
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)	LM
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka	ZS
Ms Ntombi Nkoane	NN
Ms Tamar Grover	TG
Mr Shaun Dyers	SD
Mr Ronny Nyuka	RN
Ms Laura Bridgeman	LB

Visitors

Mr Dave Saunders
Dudley Cloete-Hopkins
Mrs Berta Hayes
Ms Janine De Waal
Mrs Nicky Cloete-Hopkins
Ms Corlie Smart
Ms Elaine Aukamp

Mr Paul Meyer
Mr P Smith
Mrs Elaine Aucaup
Mrs E. Joubert
Ms Claire Donovan
Mr Stuart Hermansen
Ms Botha

Observers

Ms Warnich- Stemmet (City of Cape Town)

3. Apologies

None

4. Approval of minutes of previous held 20 June 2012

4.1 The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with minor amendments.

4.2 The Committee resolved to approve the confidential minutes

5. Disclosure of Interest

The CEO requested members of the committee to submit disclosure of interest forms.

6 Approval of Agenda

The Committee agreed to approve the agenda with additional items

7 Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8. Administration Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

It was noted that three matters will be going to the Appeals Committee including the Alphen Hotel parasols, the Steenberg Farm subdivision and the demolition of 248 Buitengracht Street, Bo-kaap. Three matters have been to the Tribunal, namely, Erf 26183 and 23685, 126 & 130 Main Road, De Oude Paarl Hotel, Paarl, Erf 248, 10 Queens Road, Sea Point and Erf 280, 8 Rancke Road, Bloubergstrand

8.2 Appointments

The procedures for setting up appointments will be discussed at the next Council meeting.

8.3 Deposits

There was a discussion around the possibility of requiring security for certain types of permits as provided in S48 of NHRA.

Decision

It was resolved that a complete administrative procedure needs to be developed for this requirement.

8.4 Legal advice on *ex post facto* approval

HWC has been advised that the ministerial regulations should be amended to accommodate such approvals.

9. Appointments

9.1 None

FIRST SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION

E 10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

E.10.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 13836, Weltevreden Farm off the R304, Stellenbosch: MA HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 13836/WELTEVREDEN FARM

ST, TT and SW reported back on their site visit.

Ms Corlie Smart and the architect, Mr Stuart Hermansen, and representatives of the Stellenbosch Interest Group, Ms Bertha Hayes and Ms Elaine Aukamp, were present and participated in the discussion.

The Committee considered both the original proposal and a revised proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposed hothouse extension to the waenhuis, the playground apparatus and the proposed parking. It did, however, recommend an alternative design and layout to mitigate the visual impacts on the werf as a whole.

SD

E.10.2 Proposed Additions to existing Structures, 18 Osborne Street, Erf 162892

Zonnebloem: NM

HM/ZONNEBLOEM/ERF 162892

Case No: 120625NN30E

An application for a permit and photographs prepared by Allan Jirek, dated 25 June 2012 and plans prepared by ALLCAD, dated June 2012 were tabled

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

Dr Townsend visited the site during the lunch break.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Committee had previously approved a similar application in Osborne Street
- The proposal will not have an impact on the significance of the streetscape.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application. Any renovation work to the front of the building should be consistent with the historic patterns and materials, e.g. gutters, down pipes, railings and fascia boards.

NN

E.10.3 Proposed Additions to existing Structures, 12 Osborne Street, Erf 162889

Zonnebloem: NM

HM/ZONNEBLOEM/ERF 162889

Case No: 120625NN31E

An application for a permit and photographs prepared by Allan Jirek, dated 25 June 2012 and plans prepared by ALLCAD, dated June 2012 were tabled

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

Dr Townsend visited the site during the lunch break.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Committee had previously approved a similar application in Osborne Street
- The proposal will not have an impact on the significance of the streetscape.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application. Any renovation work to the front of the building should be consistent with the historic patterns and materials, e.g. gutters, down pipes, railings and fascia boards.

NN

E.10.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions 14 Drosdy Street, Erf 1182 Swellendam: NM HM/SWLENDAM/ERF 1182

An application for a permit, photographs and plans prepared by Tinus Olivier BK, dated May 2012 were tabled. A heritage statement prepared by Dave Saunders was also tabled.

Mr Dave Saunders was presented and participated in the discussion.

The documents had been circulated to and read by RJ, ST and SW.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building, a declared PHS, is worthy of a Grade IIIB grading.
- The Swellendam Aesthetics Committee supported the application subject to a number of changes to the proposals

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal subject to the proposed parking area be shifted back to be in line with the front façade of the old building.

It is recommended that cottage No.8 be realigned with the side boundary and that the staggered alignment of the cottages be simplified.

NN

E 10.6 Proposed Alterations and Additions 50 Dorp Street, Stellenbosch. HM/STELLENBOSCH

An application and protest from Mr Len Raymond was discussed.

Decision

The Committee resolved to accept the application and to approve the proposal.

E 11 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

E.11.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 2262, 4 Groeneweide Street, Stellenbosch: NM HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 2262

Case No: 120606ZS07E

Ms Smart, representing the applicant, and Ms Hayes and Ms Botha, representing the Stellenbosch Interest Group, were present and took part in the discussion.

SW reported back on her site visit.

After discussion, it was explained to the SIG representatives that HWC could not refuse applications of this sort unless an argument could be made for formal protection.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition as the building is ungradable and its context is not worthy of formal protection.

ZS

E.11.2 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 2261, 2 Groeneweide Street, Stellenbosch: MA HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 2261

Case No: 120606ZS06E

Ms Smart, representing the applicant, and Ms Hayes and Ms Botha, representing the Stellenbosch Interest Group, were present and took part in the discussion.

SW reported back on her site visit.

After discussion, it was explained to the SIG representatives that HWC could not refuse applications of this sort unless an argument could be made for formal protection.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition as the building is ungradable and its context is not worthy of formal protection

ZS

E.11.3 Proposed Total Demolition, Rem Ptn 8, Drew Station, Station Complex, Sand Drift No.220: NM HM/SAND DRIFT NO 220/REM PTN 8

Case No: 120704ZS02E

A motivation for demolition prepared by D.J.A Carstens, dated 4 July 2012, an application for permit, prepared by Buntu Nkhoma, dated 4 July 2012, plans dated 4 July 2012 (drawing no. DRH 007m) and photographs were tabled

Mr Shaun Dyers made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The buildings have no heritage value.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application given that the buildings have no significance.

SD

E.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

E12.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 149, Main Street, Keurbooms: MA HM/KEURBOOMS/ERF 149

Case No: X111111ZS15

An application for a permit and photographs prepared by Swart and Associates Architects were tabled.

The documents had been circulated to and read by ST and RJ.

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The heritage significance of the building has still not been clarified but based on the evidence provided appears to have little significance.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

ZS

E12.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, 314 9th Street, Voelklip, Hermanus, Consolidated Erf 11157 incorporated Erf 4138: MA HM/HERMANUS/ERF 11157

Case No: 120611NN13M

An application for a permit and photographs prepared by Nicollette Lloyd, undated were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building is worthy of a Grade IIIB.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals subject to a more symmetrical treatment of the openings in the front façade and without rounded heads.

Revised proposals can be submitted and stamped by the case officer.

NN

E 12.3 Proposed Restoration and Alterations, Kromme Ree Farm, 62 Kromme Rhee Road, Kromme Rhee Provincial Training Institute, Koelenhof, Stellenbosch: NM HM/STELLENBOSCH/KOELLENHOF/KOMME REE FARM

Case No: 120612ZS14M

Ms Laura Bridgeman made a power-point presentation

Mr Trevor Thorold recused himself

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Committee considers the two historical buildings to be Grade IIIA and should be submitted to the Declarations Review Committee.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application and that a completion report be submitted.

LB

E.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

E.13.1 None

E. 14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

E.14.1 None

E15. PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

E.15.1 None

E.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

E.16.1 None

E.17. PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

E.17.1 None

E.18. REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

E.18.1 None

E.19. Other Matters

E.19.1 None

SECOND SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION

W.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

W.10.1 Proposed Restoration, Elsenburg Farm A (known as Rem of the Farm Elsenburg 34), Elsenburg Agricultural College, Stellenbosch: NM HM/STELLENBOSCH/ELSENBURG FARM A (KNOWN AS REM OF THE FARM ELSENBURG 34)

An application for a permit prepared by Jacobs Parker Architecture/ Interior Design, dated 21 June 2012, Partial Specifications prepared by Thorold Architects, dated June 2012, photographs and plans were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by RJ and MA.

Mr Trevor Thorold recused himself.

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application and that a completion report be submitted.

TG

**W.10.2 Proposed Additions to the Dwelling on Erf 237, 6 Kort Straat, Elim:MA
HM/ELIM/ERF 237**

Case No: 110627JW33

An application for permit prepared by P.K Siebrits, dated 2 May 2012, photographs and revised plans were tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by TT, ST, SW and RJ.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to refuse the proposal. The Committee recommends that the width of the addition be no more than the 60% of the width of the site as per the precedent set by the neighbour. A revised proposal must include the front elevation.

JW

**W.10.3 Proposed for Asbestos Roof Removal and Replacement and External Work to the Langa Pass Office, Erf 661, Corner Washington and Lerotholi, Langa: NM
HM/LANGA/ERF 661**

Case No: 120523RN22M

An application for permit, comments from SAHRA, dated 21 June 2012, maintenance/ restoration plan, photographs, historical background were tabled

Documents had been circulated to and read by MA, RJ and SW.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal. All renovation work must be under the supervision of a heritage architect, e.g. the City's architecture branch heritage specialist and careful consideration must be given to the materials used.

RN

**W.10.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 337, Great Cellar, Alphen Estate,
Constantia: MA
HM/CONSTANTIA/ERF 337**

Case No: 120606TG05

Ms Sarah Winter recused herself and Dr Townsend took the Chair.

MA, TT, RJ and ST reported back on their site visit.

The committee discussed the matter at considerable length with input from Ms Donovan and Mr & Ms Cloete-Hopkins. The Committee felt that the impact of the number size and position of the proposed roof-lights facing East onto the werf was damaging of the significance of this very important heritage resource. The Committee did concur, however that the use of the building is very important for its conservation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved not to decide on the matter until the unauthorised work has been concluded on finally.

TG

**W.10.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 106, Oude Volks Kerk (Museum), 1
Church Street, Tulbagh: MA
HM/TULBAGH/ERF 106/OUDE VOLKS KERK (MUSEUM) 1**

Case No: 120528JW24M

Landscaping plans, photographs and a report prepared by Philip Van Huyssteen Architect were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by ST, TT, MA and SW.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to await the outcome of the more detailed research by Museum Services.

JW

**W.10.6 Proposed Restoration, Erf 3678, Centre for the Book, 62 Queen Victoria Street,
Cape Town: MA
HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 3678**

Sandstone Lamination Explanatory Report prepared by The Heritage Conservation Group of the SA Institute for Object Conservation was tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by TT, RJ, SW and MA

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee resolved to request the project architect to set up a meeting including Public Works, SA Institute for Object Conservation, BELCom members (TT, ST and RJ), possibly John Rennie, the case officer and the C.E.O.

TG

W.10.7 Proposed Total Demolition, Erven 2034-2053, 2115-2133, 2076, 2077 and 1827-1830, Zone 17, 19 and 20, Langa: NM HM/LANGA/ERVEN 2034-2053, 2115-2133, 2076, 2077 AND 1827-1830

An application prepared by City of Cape Town, dated 19 April 2012 and photograph were tabled

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- Although there seems to have iterative interaction between officials of HWC and CoCT, it appears that no sections of the NHR Act are triggered.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to inform the City of Cape Town that Heritage Western Cape has no jurisdiction as the structures are not older than 60 years and the proposal does not trigger Section 38.

RN

W.10.8 Proposed Repair of Werf Wall, Alphen Estate, Alphen Drive, Erf 377, Constantia: MA HM/CONSTANTIA/ERF 377

Case No: 110713TG11M

A Heritage Report accompanying Annexure A, prepared by Claire Donovan was tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by MA, SW and RJ.

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal given the urgency of the repair work and the need to prevent further deterioration.

TG

W.10.9 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erven 90780 and 91062, "Oak Cottage and the Cottage", 27 & 29 Durban Road, Wynberg: MA HM/WYNBERG/ERVEN 90780

Case No: 111012TG12

An Application and Motivation photographs were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by MA, TT and RJ.

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

TG

W.11. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

W.11.1 None

W 12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

**W.12.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 8125, Buitenzorg, Pagasvlei Road, Constantia: MA
HM/CONSTANTIA/ERF 8125**

Case No: 120502TG01

MA and TT reported on the site visit.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

Given the comments of the CPOA, the case officer will inform the CPOA of the right of appeal.

TG

**W.12.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Farm 130/5 Rondekop now Oldenburg Vineyards, Rondekop, Zevenrivieren Road, Banhoek, Stellenbosch: NM
HM/STELLENBOSCH/FARM 130/5 RONDEKOP NOW OLDENBURG VINEYARDS**

Case No: 120628TG17D

A historical and structural research report prepared by Hennie Vos, dated July 2010, comments from Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation and the Stellenbosch Interest Group, dated June 2012, an application for a permit, photographs and plans were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by TT, MA and SW

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- It should be conveyed to the consultant that the very detailed historical research and social history (and presumed cost thereof) is regarded as unnecessary for a building suggested as Grade IIIB status and risks bringing HWC's processes into disrepute.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

TG

**W.12.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Ptn 9 of Ptn 3 of the Farm Edgbaston 104, De Balke/ Patreise Valley, Stellenbosch: MA
HM/STELLENBOSCH/PTN 9 OF PTN 3 OF THE FARM EDGBASTON 104**

Case No: X120705RN03M

De Balke Barn Rehabilitation plans; prepared Urban Dynamics Architects & Urban Designers, dated 21 June 2012 and a permit application, prepared by Andrew Horne, dated 4 July 2012 were tabled.

The matter, which is to satisfy a condition of a Section 38 approval, was removed from the agenda and referred to IACom.

RN

**W.12.4 Proposed Partial Demolition/ Alterations and Additions, Erf 28285, House Meyer, 39 Orange Street, Paarl: MA
HM/PAARL/ERF 28285**

Case No: 120525TG20M

A letter prepared by Paul Meyer, photographs and plans were tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by ST, SW and MA.

ST and SW reported back on their site visit.

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

TG

**W.12.5 Proposed Partial Demolition, Erf 8099, Corner of Wellington Road and Oxford Street, Shoprite Cherkers, Durbanville: NM
HM/DURBANVILLE/ERF 8099**

Case No: 120710TG10M

An application for permit prepared by Barry Slavin, dated 9 July 2012, paragraphs and plans were tabled

The documents had been delivered to and read by MA and RJ.

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation

Ms Warnich- Stemmet of the City Council was present and took part in the discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The City does not support the demolition application.
- The building does not have heritage value.

After discussion, it was explained to the CoCT representative, Ms Warnich-Stemmet, that HWC could not refuse applications of this sort unless an argument could be made for formal protection.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal as the subject building has no heritage value.

TG

W.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

W.13.1 None

W.14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

W.14.1 None

W.15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

W.15.1 None

W.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

W.16.1 None

W.17 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

W.17.1 None

W.18 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

W.18.1 None

W.19 Other Matters

W.19.1 None

20. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

21. CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at 16: 40

22 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 15 August 2012

CHAIRPERSON _____

DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

DATE _____